Minutes of the 129th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary, Environment on 26th February, 2019 in conference Hall, 7th Floor, Mantralaya, Mumbai. List of the members present in the meeting is enclosed as <u>Annexure I.</u>

Confirmation of Minutes:

The Authority decided to confirm that minutes of 128th meeting of the MCZMA.

<u>Item No.1:</u> Proposed development of Bhim Jyot on plot bearing CTS No. 2118 at Chaitybhoomi, Dadar, Mumbai by MMRDA

The MMRDA officials presented that application is for development of Bhim Jyot at Chaitybhoomi, Dadar, Mumbai by MMRDA. The structure is square in shape with a small dome divided into ground and mezzanine floors. The square shape structure is a circular wall about 1.5m in height. As per the approved CZMP 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ II area. The total size of the project is 8.75 sqm. It was further presented that in response to communication from the Executive Engineer, MMRDA, the MCZMA vide letter dated 4.12.2018 has granted in principal approval to Bhim Jyot at Chaitybhoomi, Dadar.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and quidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. The MMRDA to ensure that construction is proposed in CRZ II area only.
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.2:</u> Amendment in proposed maintenance dredging works to clear navigational water ways & channels in the Creeks and Rivers of Raigad District by MMB.

The CEO, Maharashtra Maritime Board was present for the meeting. The Authority noted that the MMB is seeking amendment in Environment clearance dated 18th March, 2016 granted for proposed maintenance dredging to clear

Member Secretary

Page 1 of 38

Navigational waterways and the channels of the creeks and rivers of the Raigad district.

The proposal under reference was deliberated in 88th and 103rd meetings of the MCZMA held on 31.1.2014 and 20.8.2015 respectively. MCZMA in its 103rd meeting recommended the proposal to SEIAA for grant of clearance. Accordingly, the SEIAA vide letter dated 18th March, 2016 granted the Environment Clearance for the maintenance dredging to clear Navigational waterways and the channels of the creeks and rivers of the Raigad district.

The MMB officials presented that the SEIAA has granted the EC for dredging of 28,87,796 brass dredging material from the creeks in Raigad districts namely, Savitri River/ Bankot creek, kal river, Rajapuri creek, kundalika river, Nagoan creek, Dharamtar creek, Dadar Vasheni rave creek and ulwa creek. The MMB officials further presented that the Rapid EIA was prepared considering the manual as well as mechanical way of dredging

The MMB officials further presented that at present, dredging activity is being carried out using manual and mechanical method. It was further presented that manual dredging process is extremely slow and will take a longer time in dredging out required quantity. In the last year, Around 45,229 brass of material was dredged out using mechanical method as against a meagre 2400 brass by using manual method. In the garb of manual dredging, deployment of banned means namely suction pumps for dredging cannot be ruled out. Hence, MMB has requested to allow the dredging in the creek by mechanical means in the certain areas where the manual dredging is being carried out.

The MMB officials further presented that manual dredging is a cumbersome and time consuming process. The MMB has requested the Authority to allow dredging by mechanical way in the certain areas where the manual dredging is being carried out. List of such blocks was submitted by the MMB vide its letter dated 6th February, 2019. It was further represented that manual dredging will be continued to certain pockets of the stretches. Total quantity of the dredged material as approved in EC dated 18th March, 2016 will not be exceeded.

The Authority discussed the probable impacts of the dredging by mechanical way on coastal environment. The Authority felt that role of the MMB is crucial in order to ensure that excess dredged material is not removed from the creek / river bed and dredging activity is restricted to navigational channel only. The

Member Secretary

Page 2 of 38

Authority further deliberated that mechanical dredging practices should in precision manner, in order to avoid the reckless and excessive dredging, which causes adverse impact on coastal environment.

The Authority further discussed the probable impact of noise from the mechanical dredging operation on marine life. Appropriate environment management plan to mitigate the impacts of noise on marine life could be implemented by the MMB. The Authority stressed the need to have sound environment management and monitoring plan with specific budget allocated for it.

The Authority further noted that as per para 3 (iv) (c) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, "maintenance or clearing of waterways, channels and ports, based on EIA studies" is a permissible activity. However, maintenance dredging activity should not be sand mining driven activity. MMB should ensure that the proposal primarily aims for maintenance dredging for clearing of waterways.

The Authority further noted the order dated 30^{th} May, 2018 in Original application no. 107/2018, M.A> 297/2018, M.A. 298/2018, M.A. 299/2018 & M.A> 300/2018) passed by the Hon'ble NGT, Pune.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. The proposed activity should be undertaken strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. This CRZ recommendation is for maintenance dredging for clearance of navigational waterway of channels of creeks/rivers.
- 3. MMB will have to carry out strict monitoring of dredging activity to ensure that it is not sand mining driven activity and aims for clearing navigational channel by maintenance dredging.
- 4. Mechanical dredging should be carried out in precision manner in order to avoid excessive dredging.
- 5. MMB to ensure that total quantity of the dredging material should not exceed which is approved in the EC.
- 6. The Environment Management Plan (EMP) & Environment Monitoring Plan should be implemented in spirit and it should be inconsonance with the surrounding ecosystem. Specific budget should be allocated for the implementation of EMP.

Member Secretary

Page 3 of 38

- 7. Port officer / MMB should monitor the disposal of mud and sludge
- 8. During the maintenance dredging work all efforts should be made to maintain ecology of the area.
- 9. No destruction of mangroves/ sea grass is allowed.
- 10. Dredging activity is not allowed in fish breeding sites.
- 11. No reclamation of water body is allowed.
- 12. Non sand/ coarse material should not be disposed in CRZ area.
- 13. MMB should ensure that emergency oil spill response plan is ready with appropriate cleanup supplies
- 14. MMB to ensure that observations made in order dated 30th May, 2018 in Original application no. 107/2018, M.A. 297/2018, M.A. 298/2018, M.A.299/2018 & M.A>300/2018) passed by the Hon'ble NGT, Pune shall be complied with.
- 15. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

<u>Item No.3:</u> Proposed temporary casting yard establishment at Juhu Koli Wada for Versova Bandra Sealink project by MSRDC

The MSRDC officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of temporary Casting Yard establishment at Juhu Koliwada for the proposed Versova Bandra Sea Link which has got the CRZ clearance on 9^{th} January, 2014 from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi.

As a requirement of the VBSL project, the casting yard of the area 5 Ha is proposed for undertaking civil works for the VBSL project. A casting yard is a confined space where all the concrete structure like segments, parapets, I-girders/beams, boundary wall panels, cable troughs etc re-casted shifted to their stack yard, cured for the specific period/days and then shifted to the working site/ viaduct after they gain their required strength. It will be around 1 km from the working site. Casting yard will have following activities:

- Site office
- Labour rest room
- RMC plant and QC lab
- Reinforcement fabrication yard
- Epoxy coating area
- Segment stacking yard
- Temporary jetty for feeding the material and segments
- Diesel dispensing tank

Member Secretary

Page 4 of 38

ehair man

The MCZMA in its 127th meeting held on 2nd November, 2018 deliberated the proposal, wherein it was observed that as per the approved Coastal Zone Management Plan prepared under the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011 the said land allotted by District Collector, Mumbai Suburban is located in CRZ 1(i) and CRZ II area. I further say and submit that the Authority received the complaint in the matter regarding the presence of mangrove on site, the Authority decided to make a site visit to ascertain whether the proposed site is in mangroves or in the 50 meters buffer zone.

A site visit was conducted on 5th November, 2018 by the Mangrove Cell along with the Division Forest Officer and the Range Forest Officer. During the site visit the officials of the Municipal Corporation and MSRDC were also present. As per the said site visit report the proposed project area is near to mangrove patch which is not a notified forest land and no mangroves were visible on site. The report stated that there was clearing of bushes/shrubs all along the 50 m buffer area of present mangrove patch and the dried bushes were observed on one corner of the mangrove buffer zone. During the visit it was found that there was ground leveling work in the 50 meter buffer zone which was done prior to the possession of land as submitted by the Project Proponent.

The site visit report to the said casting yard was considered by this MCZMA in its 128^{th} meeting held on 20^{th} December, 2018, wherein it was noted that this Hon'ble Court had directed the Mangrove Cell to visit the site once again and hence the proposal for casting yard was deferred by the Authority.

The Hon'ble Court on 7th January, 2018 the site visit was once again conducted and the report has been submitted before the Hon'ble Court & from the said report it concludes that there was no signs of mangrove destruction observed at the site, no obstruction to tidal water flow and that the area demarcated for casting yard is more than 50 meters away from the mangroves which has been cordoned off with fencing.

The Authority noted the Hon'ble High Court order dated 8th February, 2019 in PIL (Lodg) No. 120/2018 wherein it was stated that MCZMA will consider the matter in the light of report of the Mangrove Cell, Forest Department.

The MSRDC officials presented that the land belongs to Government. It is being transferred to MSRDC for casting yard which is temporary in nature and

Member Secretary

Page 5 of 38

hairman

would be handed over to Government The land is situated partly in CRZ I and CRZ II area. MSRDC officials further presented that casting yard activities is proposed in CRZ II area only and not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area. All the necessary measures will be taken to protect the mangroves.

The Authority noted that proposed casting yard is temporary in nature and site shall be restored to its original conditions after the work is done. Activities should be restricted to CRZ II area only, as per approved CZMP of the Greater Mumbai.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. This CRZ recommendation is for temporary casting yard for period of 5 years only. After 5 years, the MSRDC should restore the site to its original condition.
- MSRDC to strictly ensure that casting yard activities should be restricted to CRZ II areas only, as per the approved CZMP of the Greater Mumbai. No activities are allowed in CRZ I areas.
- 4. MSRDC to strictly ensure that construction of the casting yard is not proposed in mangroves or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone area. All the necessary measures should be taken to protect the mangroves.
- 5. There shall not be violation of the Hon'ble High Court order dated 17th September, 2018 in PIL 87/2006.
- 6. MSRDC to ensure that activities to be carried out without damaging the coastal-geomorphological features of the area.
- Debris/ solid waste should not be dumped in the CRZ area and beach area.
 It should be disposed in a scientific manner at a predetermined designated site.
- 8. No chemical manufacturing, processing / treatment shall be allowed.
- 9. Hazardous and toxic waste generated due to casting yard related activities should not be released into the sea/ creek.
- 10. Noise level during operation phase should not exceed the permissible limit.
- 11. Best engineering practices & construction should be followed for fire safety measures and for conservation of coastal environment

Member Secretary

Page 6 of 38

- 12.MSRDC should ensure that livelihood activities of the fishermen communities should not be hampered due to project activities.
- 13. Untreated sewage and effluent should not be discharged into the coastal water body. Project proponent should take all effective steps for protection of environment.
- 14. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 15. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.4:</u> Proposed construction of Residential Servant quarters at Chief Justice House Bungalow premises building on CTS 215 at N. D. Road, Malabar Hill, Mumbai by PWD

The PWD officials presented that the proposal of grant of post facto CRZ clearance to Residential Servant quarters at Chief Justice House Bungalow premises building on CTS 215 at N. D. Road, Malabar Hill, Mumbai by PWD, GoM, in the light of MoEF notification dated 6th March, 2018 was deliberated in 125th meeting of the MCZMA held on 21st August, 2018. The proposal was also deliberated in 184th EAC, New Delhi meeting on 24.01.2018 and sought recommendation from the MCZMA.

The Authority in its 125th meeting noted that the site of residential servant quarter is situated in CRZ II area of Greater Mumbai and landward side of existing road, as per the approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai under CRZ Notification, 1991 and as per CZMP under CRZ Notification, 2011. The PWD Officials presented that construction of servant quarter is as per the applicable town and country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991 i.e. Development control Regulations of 1967.

The Authority in its 125th meeting noted the proposal of residential servant quarter is a permissible activity as per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 1991 and 2011. It was further observed that, had the proposal came before the MCZMA prior to construction, the MCZMA would have granted the CRZ recommendation to the project.

Based on the decision taken in 125th meeting, the MCZMA vide letter dated 4th October 2018 recommended the matter to MoEF&CC, New Delhi.

Member Secretary

Page 7 of 38

The PWD officials presented that the MoEF&CC, New Delhi vide letter dated 21st December, 2018 sought specific recommendations on following:

"the concerned Coastal Zone Management Authority shall give specific recommendations regarding regularization of such proposals and shall certify that there have been no violations of the CRZ regulations, while making such 4.3

The Authority on again noted that construction of the Residential Servant quarters at Chief Justice House Bungalow premises building is situated in CRZ II area. The PWD officials presented that FSI involved in the proposal is as per the applicable town and country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991 i.e. Development control Regulations of 1967. Thus, the construction was allowed on the site, in accordance with the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

In the light of above, the Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal for grant of post facto CRZ clearance in accordance with amended CRZ recommendation dated 6th March, 2018 published by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi.

<u>Item No.5:</u> Proposed development in sustainable way under 'Paryatanatun Swayam Rojagarakade' scheme in Sindhudurg District by Collector office, Sindhudurg

The Project proponent was absent for the meeting. The Authority noted that the proposal is for the development of wooden cottages with public private partnership model is proposed on 23 locations under 'Paryatanatun Swayam Rojagarakade' scheme in Sindhudurg District.

Sr. No.	Location	Project details	CRZ classification of the plot as per new approved CZMP
1	1	temporary type wooden cottage with:	CRZ III area and within 200 m from the HTL of the seafront
		Total area of plot- 2710	
	(Land owner-Dev	Sqm	t ii
	Rameshwar Aachre)	Built up area - 159.419	
		Sqm	

Member Secretary

Page 8 of 38

2	Sr No. 200/3. at	temporary type wooden	CRZ I area
i i se ta	Kochare, Tal:		
	Vengurla	(A.S.)	(Intertidal area and
	8.00	total plot area - 17170	touching to mangrove area)
	(Land owner - Mr.	Sqm	727
	Yogesh Teli)	total built up area- 84.49	
		Sqm	
3	Sr No. 11/1, 11/2,		
	11/3 at Bhogave,	cottage with:	m from the HTL of the
	Tal: Vengurla	+-+-l ulah awas 10030	seafront i.e. NDZ area.
		total plot area - 19930	
	(Land owner -	Sqm	
	Sanjay Samant)	total built up area- 61.26	
4	Sn No 1650/1/0 +	Sqm temporary type wooden	CRZ III area and partly
4	165B/1/8 at	a contract of the contract of	within 200 m from the HTL
	Wayanagani, Tal:	corrage with	of the seafront i.e. partly
	Malvan	total plot area - 13760	15 S
	(13.11.3.1	Sqm	
īā	Land owner -Abhay		
	Pednekar)	100.817 Sqm	
5	Sr. No. 71/(2+1/4),		CRZ III area and partly
	at Tondavali, Tal:		within 50 m from the HTL
	Malvan	with:	of the seafront i.e. NDZ
	2 12		area.
	1995 (CONT.) 100 (CONT.) 100 (CONT.)	total plot area - 8400	
	Shobhana Patil	Sqm	
		total built up area- 23.10 x 4= 92.40 Sqm	
		7- 72.70 Jym	
6	Sr No 50/2 at	2 types temporary type	CRA I A (sand Dune/
	Velbhag	wooden cottage (single &	
	Mithmumbari, Tal:		Commission (1971) (1971) (1971) (1971) (1971) (1971) (1971) (1971)
	Devgad		
		total plot area - 8100	
	Land owner -	Sqm	
	Suchitra Dambari	total built up area-	
		239.107 Sqm	
L			

Member Secretary

Page 9 of 38

7	KothewaDA(Hadi), Tal: Malvan	6 units of temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 3600 Sqm total built up area- 30.64x 6= 183.84 Sqm	(i)
8	16/21, 16/22, 16/23, 16/24 at	4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 1000 Sqm total built up area- 31.720 x 4= 126.88 Sqm	CRZ III and NDZ area
9	Sr. No. 31/36,	4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 810 Sqm total built up area- 102.02x4= 408.08 Sqm	Within 100 m from creek, CRZ III and NDZ area
10		2 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 810 Sqm total built up area- 102.02x4= 408.08 Sqm	Partly in CRZ I and CRZ III area i.e NDZ of the creek.
11	1	2 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 1700 Sqm	CRZ III area and partly within 50 m from the HTL of the seafront i.e. NDZ area

Member Secretary

Page 10 of 38

	Randive	total built up area- 75.63x 2= 151.26 Sqm	
12	Sr. No. 41/1 at Korjai Chipi, Tal: Vengurla Land owner - Sainath Mandye	total plot area - 1400	Partly within CRZ I and partly within CRZ III, NDZ area of the creek.
13	Sr. No. 34/4/2 at Bhigave, Tal: Vengurla Land owner -Yogesh Nerrurkar	2 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 1420 Sqm total built up area- 60.56 x 2= 121.12 Sqm	CRZ III area and partly within 100 m from the HTL of the seafront i.e. NDZ area
14	Sr.No. 5(25) 34/1, at Gaonkarwada (Hadi), Tal: Malvan Land owner - Ramchandra Gaonkar	The second secon	CRZ III area, within 100 m from the HTL of the creek i.e. NDZ area.
15	Sr. No. 4/14& 4/13B, at Siddharthwadi (Ubhadanda) at Vengurla Land owner - Dinanath Vernekar	2 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 3090 Sqm total built up area- 81.03 Sqm	CRZ III area, within 50 m from the HTL of the seafront i.e. NDZ area.

Member Secretary

Page 11 of 38

	The second secon	19-7	
16	Chipi at Vengurla	2 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 1013 Sqm total built up area- 81.60 Sqm	CRZ III area, partly within 100 m from the HTL of the creek i.e. NDZ area.
17		4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 1500 Sqm total built up area- 31.236x4= 124.944 Sqm	CRZ III, within 100m from the creek i.e. NDZ area of the creek.
18	32.6, 32.7B at Dhamapur, Tal: Malvan	4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 2230Sqm total built up area- 17.153x4= 68.612 Sqm	CRZ III, within 100m from the river i.e. NDZ area of the river
19	19/4/8 at Shelpi, Tal: Bhogave	3 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 990 Sqm total built up area- 23.725x3= 71.175 Sqm	CRZ III, within 100m from the river i.e. NDZ area of the river
20	Sr. No. 79/12/80/12/81/12 at Tondavali Tal: Malvan Land owner - Shivranjan Patil	4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 7710 Sqm total built up area- 19.555x4 x 4= 78.220 Sqm	CRZ III, touching to HTL of creel i.e. NDZ area of the creek

Member Secretary

Page 12 of 38

Chairman

21	Kochare, Tal: Vengurla Land owner -	total plot area - 4850 Sqm	CRZ I area (Intertidal)
	Devdatta Salgoankar	total built up area- 101.2795qm	
22	Sr No. 2/1/1, at Bhogave, Tal: Vengurla Land owner - Purushottam Samant.	temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 8900 Sqm total built up area- 51.87 Sqm	Beyond applicable CRZ setback area from seafront and creek.
23	Sr No. 74/2/1, at Tondavali, Tal: Malvan Land owner - Tilottama Hadkar	4 units temporary type wooden cottage with: total plot area - 14040 Sqm total built up area- 94.16 Sqm	CRZ III area & partly within 200 m (NDZ are) from the seafront.

The Authority noted that out of 23 locations, most of the sites are situated in CRZ I and No Development Zone (NDZ) of the CRZ III area, wherein development of wooden cottages would not be permissible as per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. The same shall be communicated to District collector Sindhdurg.

The Authority further noted that it appears that proposals on sites no. 7 & 22 could be allowed, however, deliberations with officials of the Sindhudurg Collector is necessary in the matter, in order to authenticate the location of the sites.

Accordingly, the Authority after deliberation decided to defer the proposal for want of present of officials Sindhudurg Collector for deliberations in the matter.

Member Secretary

Page 13 of 38

<u>Item No.6:</u> Proposed development of infrastructure facilities for fishermen community at Mumbai Subarban, Raigad, Ratnagiri, Sindhudurga districts by Commissioner of Fisheries

Officials of the Fisheries Department presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for development of infrastructure facilities for fishermen community at Mumbai Subarban, Raigad, Ratnagiri, Sindhudurga districts.

The proposal was earlier deliberated in 128th meeting of the MCZMA wherein the Authority sought certain information from the fisheries dept. Accordingly, fisheries department submitted the details of the proposal, which is tabulated as below:

Village Name	Activity	CRZ area / Mangrove Remarks
1. Chimbai, Andheri Taluka,	Existing: Jetty with Sloping Ramp	CRZ I (B), CRZ II
Mumbai Subruban	& Net mending sheds.	Proposed activities are not in mangrove or its 50 m buffer
	Proposed: 2 boat yards with 2 ramps each, 2 net mending	zone area.
19°03'24.36"N 72°49'19.50"E	sheds and widening and extension of existing jetty	
2. Borya, Guhaghar, Ratnagiri	Existing: Jetty & Approach Road.	CRZ I (B), CRZ III & CRZ IV
17°23'07.00"N 73°11'26.00"E	Proposed: extension of existing approach road, new jetty and rubble protection	Proposed activities are not in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
 Vijaydurg, Deogad, Sindhudurg 	Existing: Jetty & Approach Road.	CRZ I (B) and CRZ IV
-	Proposed: A Wharf with 2	Proposed activities are not in
16°33'27.09"N 73°20'09.27"E	ramps and rubble protection	mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.

Member Secretary

Page 14 of 38

Village Name	Activity	CRZ area / Mangrove Remarks
 Medha, Malvan, Sindhudurg 16°03'14.91"N 73°27'32.37"E 	Existing: sloping ramp Proposed: Approach road Wharf and rubble protection	CRZ I (A) and CRZ IV Proposed activities are not in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
5. Madha- Talapsha,Taluka Andheri, Mumbai Suburban.	Existing: Wharf cum Approach Road	
	Proposed: Boat yard with Boat Basin, Jetty and widening of existing road	Proposed activities are not in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
19°08'13.16"N 72°47'45.60"E		
6. Borli-Mandla, Murud, Raigad	Existing: Approach channel, Retaining wall, Common Platform for Boat yard & Net mending with sloping	CRZ I (B) and CRZ III Proposed activities are not in
18°30'16.54"N 72°54'39.56"E	ramp soping	mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
	Proposed: Wharf, Jetty, Groynes, protection & Maintanance of Navigational Channel with ancillary facilities	
7. Waredi, Pen, Raigad	Existing: Wharf cum Approach Road	CRZ I and CRZ IV Proposed activities are not in
18°46'22.54"N	Proposed: Upgradation of	mangrove. However, situated
73°03'57.13"E	Fish Drying Yard,	within 50 m buffer zone area.

Member Secretary

Page 15 of 38

Village Name	Activity	CRZ area Remarks	1	Mangrove
	Upgradation of Boat Yard, Sloping Ramp, Upgradation of Approach Road & Solar Street Light		W. W. I	

The PP presented that advice from CWPRS, Pune was also sought while planning & designing of above 7 works in which environmental factors such as avoiding disturbances to mangroves in the vicinity were also considered.

The Authority noted that project aims for up gradation in existing facilities/create permanent safe basic infrastructures of post -harvesting facilities to meet demands of fishing community from different fish landing centres. Thus, upgrading the basic requirement of local fishermen will boost their fish Catch/landing/transporting, eventually helping to enhance state's fish production. The Authority noted the Rapid EIA/EMP for the project.

The Authority noted that, at Medha, Malvan, the site is located in CRZ IA i.e. Ecologically Sensitive Area. The site is situated within the buffer zone of the Malvan Marine Sanctuary, which is a protected area. This also attracts the provisions of the wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972. No construction will be permissible in the said area. Hence, activities need to be shifted outside the ESA area.

The Authority observed that rest of the sites could permitted for developing the infrastructure facilities for the fishermen community, as per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority noted that as per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 Construction and operation for harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities. And, as per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, clearance from the SEIAA is required for the said projects.

Member Secretary

Page 16 of 38

haikmah

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal, except site at Medha, Malvan from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. At Chimbai, sedimentation rate is high, hence, the location and alignment of jetty needs to be designed properly in order to avoid excessive siltation on downward side. Mangrove patch near the site should not be destroyed.
- At Borya, Guhaghar, beach near the site should not be disturbed.
 Construction debris should not be dumped in the beach area. Existing approach road should be strengthened instead of constructing new road.
- 4. At Madh Talapsha, sedimentation rate is high, hence, the location and alignment of jetty needs to be designed properly in order to avoid excessive siltation on downward side. Existing approach road should be strengthened instead of widening of the road in CRZ I area.
- 5. At Borli Mandla, there is small creeklet lined with mangrove vegetation which runs parallel to seafront. There is village settlement in between seafront and creeklet. Thus, overall coastal environment is vulnerable. PP to ensure that dredged material from the navigation channel should not be dumped in the creeklet or mangrove area. Mangrove Patches present near the sites should not be destroyed. Design of jetty near the creeklet should not result in closing of the creeklet.
- At Waredi, Pen, Raigad, proposed activities area situated within 50 m mangrove buffer zone. Prior High Court permission should be obtained for the proposed activities.
- 7. Debris generated during the construction activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be ensured that debris is disposed in a scientific manner at a designated site.
- 8. PP to ensure that no mangrove should be cut/destroyed for the proposed project. If the project is proposed in 50 m mangrove buffer zone, prior High Court permission should be obtained.
- There shall not be violation of the Hon'ble High Court order dated 17th September, 2018 in PIL 87/2006.
- 10. Adequate nos. of Channels/culverts/pipes shall be put across jetty in order to ensure free/natural tidal flow in the mangrove area and drainage pattern of the area should not be disturbed

Member Secretary

Page 17 of 38

- 11. Natural course of creek/river water should not be hampered due to proposed activities.
- 12. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 13. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.7: Regarding Advertisement hoardings, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai by M/s Guju Ads. (SLP Nos. 6085-6087/2018 before Hon Supreme Court)

The project proponent presented the matter before the Authority. The PP presented that the proposal was for 8 nos. of Advertisement hoardings, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai. The Authority noted the order of the Hon'ble Supreme court which is as follows:

Hon. Supreme Court vide Order dated 08.03.2018 in the SLA No. 6085-6087 /2018 mentions "Having heard learned counsel for the petitioner, we are only inclined to grant liberty to the petitioner to move the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM) or any other appropriate competent authority for grant of permission to put up hoardings and signs. The said application shall be filed within three days hence. The authority concerned shall take appropriate decision within two weeks therefrom, after affording an opportunity of hearing to the petitioner and to respondent No.2 and also to any other authority. The structure shall not be demolished for a period of four weeks and status quo, existing as on today, shall be maintained till then. The special leave petitions stand disposed of accordingly."

The Authority noted the details of the Hoarding and its location from the CRZ point of view:

Sr. No.	Advertisement Hoarding Size	Location	CRZ Status as per approved CZMP
1)	30 X 30	Near car Parking area, Besides Shiv Sagar Hotel, at Juhu Tara Road,	CRZ-II landward side of

Member Secretary

Page 18 of 38

chairman

		Andheri (W), Mumbai	Juhu Tara Road
2)	30 X 40	Near car Parking area, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II landward side of Juhu Tara Road
3)	35 X 40	Near car Parking area, Near Public Toilet, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai (back side of the Home Town Cafe)	CRZ-II landward side of Juhu Tara Road
4)	30 X 30	Near Hotel Ramada and car Parking area at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II Seaward side of the Juhu Tara Road
5)	30 X 30	Near Shivaji Maharaj Statue, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II Seaward side of the Juhu Tara Road
6)	30 X 30	Near Food Stall, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II Seaward side of the Juhu Tara Raod.
7)	30 X 30	In the Compound, near Police Chowki, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II Landward side of the Police Chowki
8)	30 X 30	Near Juhu Bus Stop, at Juhu Tara Road, Andheri (W), Mumbai	CRZ-II Landward side of the Police Chowki

The Authority noted the decision of the 96^{th} meeting of the MCZMA regarding the Hoarding policy which is as follows:

- Erection or installation of hoardings/ boards or structures of Advertisement to be allowed only in CRZ II areas and only on landward side of existing road OR existing authorized structure OR within the periphery/ terrace/wall of existing authorized structure.
- 2. Erection or installation of hoardings/ boards or structures of Advertisement to be allowed beyond 200 m from HTL in CRZ III area.

Member Secretary

Page 19 of 38

- 3. Hoardings/ boards or structures of Advertisement which are in existence and which were permitted by MCGM / concerned local planning Authority will also be examined from CRZ point of view for CRZ recommendation/NoC.
- 4. Hoardings / boards or structures of Advertisement will not be allowed in CRZ I area, 50 mangroves buffer zone area and No Development Zone areas of CRZ III.
- 5. No trees should be cut / destroyed during the installation of Hoardings.
- 6. Hoarding owner/advertiser will have to pay Rs. 1 Lakh per Hoarding/board or structure of Advertisement as Scrutiny fees to the MCZMA.

In the light of above, the Authority noted that Advertisement Hoarding listed at Sr. No. 1, 2, 3, 7 & 8 are situated on CRZ II and landward side of the existing road or existing structure. Hence, said Hoardings could be permitted from the CRZ point of view, in line with 96^{th} decision of the MCZMA regarding Hoarding policy.

The Authority further noted that Hoardings listed at Sr no.4, 5 & 6 falls in CRZ II area, however, situated on seaward side of the existing road. Hence, said Hoardings could not be allowed from the CRZ point of view.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the Advertisement Hoardings at Sr. No. 1, 2, 3, 7 & 8 from CRZ point of view subject to compliance of following conditions:

- Concern planning Authority to ensure that Hoardings/ boards or structures of Advertisement are in CRZ II areas and only on landward side of existing existing road OR existing authorized structure OR within the periphery/ terrace/wall of existing authorized structure.
- 2. No trees should be cut / destroyed during the installation of Hoardings.
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.8:</u> Proposed reconstruction of existing residential building on plot bearing S. No. 38, Hissa no. 2/2 at mauje Devbag, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg by Shri. Pravin Vasant Gawandi

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for reconstruction of existing residential building on plot bearing S. No. 38, H. No. 2/2 at mauje Devbag, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg. Total plot area is

Member Secretary

Page 20 of 38

880.00 sqm and proposed built up area is 146.39 sqm. The PP presented that she is a local inhabitant of the village Devbuag and reconstruction is proposed. The existing residential structure of the year 1986 will be demolished.

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP of the village Devbaug area, under CRZ Notification, 2011, the plot under reference is fronting to seafront & falls in CRZ III area and situated within 200 m from the seafront i.e. NDZ area.

The Authority noted that as per para 8.II. CRZ III (ii) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, in NDZ area, repairs or reconstruction of existing authorized structure not exceeding existing Floor Space Index, existing plinth area and existing density and for permissible activities under the notification including facilities essential for activities is permissible.

The Authority noted that repair/ reconstruction of existing house of local inhabitant of coastal area is permissible activity, as per provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. Proposed redevelopment should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- The Local Body to ensure that reconstruction of existing authorized structure not exceeding existing Floor Space Index, existing plinth area and existing density.
- 3. Local body to ensure no construction is initiated without prior permission of the MCZMA.
- 4. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.9:</u> Proposed reconstruction of residential building known as Beachwood House on plot bearing CTS No. 907/A of village Juhu at Juhu Tara Road, Vile parle (W), Mumbai by Shri Vikas Oberoi

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority which is as follows:

Member Secretary

Page 21 of 38

- 1. Proposal is for reconstruction of existing residential building on sub plot C on plot bearing CTS No. 907/A village, Juhu, Vile parle (W), Mumbai.
- 2. MoEFF, New Delhi vide letter dated 25.8.2011 had granted the CRZ clearance for reconstruction on site under reference and accordingly, plans were sanctioned by the MCGM on 20.1.2012.
- 3. MCZMA vide letter dated 19.1.2015 granted the CRZ recommendation to the amended proposal comprising 2 level basement + ground + 1st to 7th upper floors + 2 service floors, as per DCR 1967, in accordance with CRZ Notification, 2011.
- 4. As per the MCGM remarks, the existing building was declared dilapidated 23.9.2013 considering the proposal is ongoing proposal, the PP has amended the proposals under para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011.
- 5. Amended plans as per the DCR 2034 comprises of residential building comprising 2 level basement + ground floor + 1st to 6th upper floors. The proposal is in lieu of zonal FSI + 35% compensatory fungible area as per DCR 2034.
- 6. The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP dated 16.8.2018, the plot is situated in CRZ II area and situated on seaward side of the existing road / structure. As per the DP 2034, the plot under reference is in Residential zone.
- 7. FSI details:
 - Area of plot C: 2125.00 Sqm
 - Permissible FSI: 1 + 35 % compensatory fungible area= 2868.75
 Sqm
 - Free of FSI: 702.81 Sqm

The PP presented that the project is ongoing and building plans are amended as per DCR 2034, in accordance with para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time). It was further presented that there are no tenants in the buildings hence, public hearing report is not submitted. The PP shall submit the undertaking to that effect.

The Authority noted that redevelopment of dilapidated building declared as on 6.1.2011 is allowed as per prevailing DCR, in accordance with para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011. In the present proposal, building was declared dilapidated on 23.9.2013. The Authority further noted the judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court in WP no. 1108 of 2013 and Chamber summons no. 180 of 2013 in property redevelopers association and ors V/s Union of India, wherein para 8.V.C of the CRZ Notification will also apply to buildings which are declared dilapidated post

Member Secretary

Page 22 of 38

6.1.2011. The PP should submit the undertaking that there is single owner in the project and there are no tenants.

In the light of above, the Authority, after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to concerned planning Authority from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject strict compliance of following conditions:

- Proposed redevelopment should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. MCGM to ensure that the existing building was declared dilapidated.
- 3. MCGM to ensure that all the conditions of the para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011 is adhered to.
- 4. MCGM to ensure that redevelopment of existing building is restricted to authorized plinth only. No seaward side extension is allowed.
- 5. The PP should submit the undertaking that there is single owner in the project and there are no tenants.
- MCGM to ensure that proposed construction is as per DCR prevailing as on the date on which the project is granted approval by the competent Authority.
- 7. PP to implement environment measures proposed in the project such as solar water heater, STP, organic waste converter, rainwater harvesting.
- 8. PP to obtain the Environment Clearance from competent Authority, if total construction area in the project exceeds 20,000 Sqm.
- 9. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.10:</u> Proposed redevelopment of property bearing CS. no. 1878 of Mahim Division, Shivaji Park Estate Scheme situated at Road no. 5, Pandurang Naik Marg, Shivaji Park, Dadar (W), Mumbai by M/s. Ahbeearr Properties Pvt. Ltd.

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority, which is as follows:

The proposal is for redevelopment of property bearing CESS No. GN-4696(2) at CS. no. 1878 of Mahim Division, Shivaji Park Estate Scheme situated at Road no. 5, Pandurang Naik Marg, Shivaji Park, Dadar (W), Mumbai.

Member Secretary

Page 23 of 38

- 2. Proposed construction of new residential building comprising of Ground floor on stilt with Entrance Lobby, Electrical Substation + 1st to 4th Podium Floors used for car parking accessible by two car lifts + transfer Girder + Service floor (+01.20 mtrs) + 5th to 20th upper residential floor (20th floor part) with total height of 69.90 meter from general ground level to terrace level for residential use in lieu of 3.00 FSI + fungible FSI as per reg. 35(4) and by claiming the area of staircase, lift and lobby free of FSI, thereby proposing to demolish existing structures.
- 3. There are two structures existing on plot under reference. Category of Existing Building 'A' Residential, 'A' Non Residential & 'C' residential vide Ward no. GN-4696(2) comprising of Ground + 3 upper floor. Existing Structure having Ward No. GN-4696(2A) is Non Cess Structure.
- 4. As per the approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai, the site falls in CRZ II area.
- 5. As per DP of Greater Mumbai of 1991 & 2034, the plot under reference is falls in Residential Zone. The plot is not under any reservation as per the both of the development plans.

The PP further presented that the proposal is in accordance with para 8.v.c. of the CRZ Notification, 2011. The PP has submitted the public hearing report.

The Authority, after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to concerned planning Authority from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject strict compliance of following conditions:

- 1. Proposed redevelopment should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. MCGM to ensure that the existing buildings are cessed.
- MCGM to ensure that all the conditions of the para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011 is adhered to.
- 4. MCGM to ensure that proposed construction is as per DCR prevailing as on the date on which the project is granted approval by the competent Authority.
- 5. MCGM to ensure that issues raised in Public hearing of tenants are addressed.
- 6. PP to implement environment measures proposed in the project such as solar water heater, rainwater harvesting.
- 7. PP to obtain the Environment Clearance from competent Authority, if total construction area in the project exceeds 20,000 Sqm.
- 8. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Member Secretary

Page 24 of 38

Charman

<u>Item No.11:</u> Proposed capacity enhancement at existing Inland Water Jetty Facility on Kundalika River at Village Sanegaon, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad by M/s Indo Energy International Ltd

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal involves:

- 1. Direct berthing deep water jetty facility on Kundalika River, village Korlai and
- 2. Capacity enhancement at existing Inland Water Jetty Facility on Kundalika River at Village Sanegaon, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad.

The Authority noted that proposal was deliberated in 116th meeting of the MCZMA wherein 22nd March, 2017 wherein the Authority decided to visit the site. Accordingly, site visit was conducted on 16th July, 2017. The matter was again deliberated in 121st meeting of the MCZMA held on 15th & 16th September, 2017, wherein, the Authority deliberated the proposal and took on record the site visit report. After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal of direct berthing deep water jetty facility to MoEF, New Delhi subject to observations as stated above. Accordingly, the MCZMA vide letter dated 09.01.2018 recommended the proposal of direct berthing deep water jetty facility to MoEF, New Delhi. However, the proposal for Expansion of the Sanegoan jetty at village Sanegoan was kept on hold for compliance of certain observations.

During the 121st meeting, the Authority observed the followings:

- There will be change in hydrodynamic of the flow of the Revdanda creek due to the proposed construction of port and reclamation of 50 Ha area for stoppage of goods.
- 2. PP needs to make a detailed plan for traffic management for carrying cargoes, considering the availability of narrow road adjacent to proposed port. The PP to develop detail traffic flow management plan.
- 3. PP to redesign and construct, develop and monitor the existing roads proposed to be utilised for heavy cargo movement, considering its frequency.
- 4. PP to ensure livelihood of local fisherman is not impacted due to proposed port and also develop alternate livelihood means under the project.
- 5. PP to submit the compliance of the Environment Clearance granted to Sanegoan jetty. Expansion of the Sanegoan jetty may not be permissible at present without compliance of the issues raised by committee of the Maharashtra Legislative Assembly in July, 2017.

Member Secretary

Page 25 of 38

hairman

The PP presented that the proposed capacity / expansion project of Sanegoan jetty envisages induction of modernized material handling system, dredging of navigation channel to 3.1 m CD, operating higher capacity barges of 4500 DWT etc. The proposed capacity / expansion project will enable handling of more cargo at a faster rate. It was further presented by the PP that model studies of the Kurlai water front has been undertaken by DHI new delhi in June 2016 and the report has concluded that there will be no significant impact with the proposed development. Detail traffic flow management plan has been submitted. The existing tow land road is presently being used by 50 ton trucks of M/s JSW Steel Plant, Salav (adjacent to korlai), for transportation. M/s IEIL will be using the same road for transportation of cargo from Korlai to the various destinations. There are state highways near the proposed korlai jetty. -As per the policy of the MMB, the port developer is responsible for development of road connectivity to the nearest State highway. This connectivity will be provided by M/s IEIL.

The PP further presented that M/s IEIL has allocated certain budget (Rs. 36 crores) for social responsibility at Korlai. The activities include development of fisheries, education, health, women empowerment, youth development and social development programs and will be in consultation with the korali Gram Pahchayat.

The PP further presented that committee of the MLA visited the M/s IEIL Sanegoan jetty on 13.7.2017. As a follow up to the issues raised by the committee, M/s IEIL was issued the proposed directions dated 13.7.2017 under section 33A of the Water (P&CP) Act, 1981 and Hazardous waste Rules, 2008. M/s IEIL has complied with the observations and the same was verified by the MPCB o 30.10.2017. Compliance report is sent to MPCB.

The Authority deliberated the proposal of the Capacity enhancement of the sanegoan jetty. It was noted that the jetty is on Kundalika River and surrounded by the mangrove vegetation, hence, expansion of the existing land area could not be allowed. The PP presented that the proposal involves only upgradaton of the existing jetty facility by installing modern machinery / equipment so that capacity of the cargo handling could be enhanced. There will be no expansion of the land area for the capacity enhancement of the sanegoan jetty. No mangrove cutting is involved in the project. The PP has submitted the Rapid EIA/ EMP for the project and all environmental precautions would be taken in order to protect the coastal environment.

Member Secretary

Page 26 of 38

In the light of above, the Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF&CC, New Delhi subject to compliance of certain conditions:

- 1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. Observations of the site visit report should be complied with by the PP.
- 3. PP to strictly ensure that capacity enhancement of the Sanegoan jetty is not proposed in mangroves or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone area. All the necessary measures should be taken to protect the mangroves.
- 4. There shall not be violation of the Hon'ble High Court order dated 17th September, 2018 in PIL 87/2006.
- 5. PP to ensure that activities to be carried out without damaging the coastalgeomorphological features of the area.
- 6. Debris/ solid waste should not be dumped in the CRZ area / water area of the Kundalika River.
- 7. Best Engineering practices should be followed for safety measures and for conservation of coastal environment.
- 8. Cargo should be handled properly without polluting the water quality of the Kundalika River.
- Untreated sewage and effluent should not be discharged into the coastal water body. Project proponent should take all effective steps for protection of environment.
- 10. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 11. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Items with the consent of the Chairman, MCZMA

<u>Item No.1:</u> Proposed establishment of Multispecies Hatchery Complex on plot bearing survey no. 47 A, Vagheshwar, Ubhadanda, Tal: Vengurla, Sindhudurg

Officials of the Mangrove Cell presented the proposal before the Authority. Mangrove Cell has proposed to establish Multispecies Hatchery Complex at Vagheshwar, Ubhadanda, Tal: Vengurla, Sindhudurg. The Hatchery complex will have separate units of crab hatchery, bivalve hatchery(oyster and mussel) and sea bass hatchery along with common facilities like pumping of sea water, reservoirs, over head tanks, live feed / algae culture etc and it was further decide to

Member Secretary

Page 27 of 38

establish the said hatchery complex with technical collaboration for crab hatchery component from MPEDA-RGCA, for Bivalve component technical collaboration with ICAR- CMFRI and for seabass component technical collaboration from ICAR-CIBA.

It was further presented that production capacity of the said hatchery complex will be 1 million crab instarts/ year. 10 million seeds/ year each for oyster and mussel and 2 million seabass fry/ year and the said hatchery complex will be set up in an area of 1.25 hectares. Multispecies Hatchery complex will solve the problem of procuring separate land area for these hatcheries and give a boost to the aquaculture activities of crab, bivalve and seabass farming by providing a regular supply of seeds to the aquaculture farmers in coastal Maharashtra.

As per the approved CZMP dated 16.8.2016, the plot is situated in CRZ III area and within 200 m from the Seafront i.e. NDZ. The land belongs to MTDC and given to Mangrove Cell on lease basis.

The Authority noted that, the project aims to generate livelihood opportunities for local fishermen community. As per para 3(iii) and 8.III. CRZ III (I) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, Hatchery and Natural fish drying in permissible activity.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. Proposed activities should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. Waste water generated should not be discharged in beach / CRZ area.
- 3. Construction debris should not be dumped in CRZ area.
- 4. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.2:</u> Proposed improvement / beautification of existing upper promenade & dead concrete walls at Dadar beach, from Dnyaneshwar Udyan to Pandurang Naik marg, Mumbai by Harbour Engineer Division

Officials of the Harbour Engineer Division presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for improvement / beautification of existing upper promenade & dead concrete walls at Dadar beach, from Dnyaneshwar Udyan to Pandurang Naik marg, Mumbai. The project involves following activities:

· Beautification of upper promenade.

Member Secretary

Page 28 of 38

Cháirman

- Landscaping to provide harmonious environment.
- Texture painting on walls highlighting the basic theme or any other form of public art.
- Visarjan circuits retained and incorporated in design. (Channelizing of existing circuit).
- Solar-based low level / low intensity lightening to reduce night sky pollution and provided sense of safety.

The Authority noted that proposal intends to revive the public space, close to seafront at Dadar. Improvement/ strengthening of upper promenade along the tetra pods, may also help in addressing the issue of erosion at Dadar beach.

It was further activities are proposed in CRZ II area as per the approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 2011. However, Park/ open spaces in CRZ II areas indicated in DP of the MCGM is treated as CRZ III area. As per the para 8.v.(e)(f) of the CRZ Notification, 2011:

- (e) In order to protect and preserve the 'green lung' of the Greater Mumbai area, all open spaces, parks, gardens, playgrounds indicated in development plans within CRZ-II shall be categorized as CRZ-III, that is, 'no development zone'.
- (f) the Floor Space Index upto 15% shall be allowed only for construction of civic amenities, stadium and gymnasium meant for recreational or sports related activities and the residential or commercial use of such open spaces shall not be permissible.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. Proposed activities should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. PWD to ensure that no construction is proposed in CRZ I area.
- 3. Construction debris should not be dumped in beach area.
- 4. Solar based Low level, low intensity lighting should be installed to reduce night sky pollution
- 5. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Member Secretary

Page 29 of 38

Thairman

<u>Item No.3:</u> Proposed redevelopment of dilapidated building on plot bearing C5 No. 941 of Worli Division, Dr. Annie Besant Road, G/South Ward, Mumbai by M/s. Sirius Land Holdings LLP (RAD Suit No. 1468 of 2018)

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority.

- Proposal is for redevelopment of existing Commercial Building which is declared dilapidated on plot bearing CS No. 941 of Worli Division, Dr. Annie Besant Road, G/South Ward, Mumbai.
- 2. proposed commercial office building comprises of three basement for car parking and utilities + ground floor for parking and entrance lobby + 1st to 9th podium for parking + 10th refuge and 11th to 17th floor + 18th (part) floor for commercial office purpose. The proposal is within permissible FSI norms as on dated i.e. as per Clause 33(7)(A) of DCPR 2034. MC, MCGM has granted various concessions on 17.12.2018.
- 3. There exists ground floor + 1^{st} to 2^{nd} upper old building structure constructed prior to 1961-62 declared dilapidated by MCGM on 17.10.2018. The existing use of the structure was commercial.
- 4. As per Development Plan of Greater Mumbai of 1991 & 2034, the plot under reference is falls in Residential Zone. The plot is not under any reservation as per the both of the development plans. The user of Commercial is permissible as per land use and zoning as well as sanctioned DCPR2034 in force as on date.
- 5. As per the approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai, the site falls in CRZ II area and situated on landward side of the existing road, in existence prior to 19.2.1991.
- 6. The MCGM has issued IOD for the proposal, as per which, area of plot is 1214.26 Sqm, Total proposed BUA including fungible is 4069.54 Sqm and total construction area is 16310.31 Sqm. The PP further informed that additional TDR will also be included as per the applicable DCR rules.

The PP further presented that the proposal is in accordance with para 8.v.c. of the CRZ Notification, 2011. MCGM has sanctioned the proposal. Public hearing report has been submitted by the PP. The PP informed that Suit No. 1468 of 2018 filed by the tenants has been disposed off with consent terms.

The Authority noted that redevelopment of dilapidated building declared as on 6.1.2011 is allowed as per prevailing DCR, in accordance with para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011. In the present proposal, building was declared dilapidated on

Member Secretary

Page 30 of 38

hairman

17.10.2018. The Authority further noted the judgment passed by the Hon'ble High Court in WP no. 1108 of 2013 and Chamber summons no. 180 of 2013 in property redevelopers association and ors V/s Union of India, wherein para 8.V.C of the CRZ Notification will also apply to buildings which are declared dilapidated post 6.1.2011.

The Authority, after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to concerned planning Authority from CRZ point of view subject strict compliance of following conditions:

- Proposed redevelopment should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. MCGM to ensure that the existing building was declared dilapidated.
- 3. MCGM to ensure that all the conditions of the para 8.v.c of the CRZ Notification, 2011 is adhered to.
- 4. MCGM to ensure that proposed construction is as per DCR prevailing as on the date on which the project is granted approval by the competent Authority.
- 5. MCGM to ensure that issues raised in Public hearing of tenants are addressed.
- 6. PP to implement environment measures proposed in the project such as STP, organic waste converter, rainwater harvesting.
- 7. PP to obtain the Environment Clearance from competent Authority, if total construction area in the project exceeds 20,000 Sqm.
- 8. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.4:</u> Proposed addition and alteration to the existing building on plot bearing CTS No. 825 of village Juhu, plot no. B/1, Kapole CHSL, Vile Parle (W), Mumbai by M/s Pushkar Consultants

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. Hence, the matter was deferred.

Item No.5:

Proposed construction of various activities of Metro Car Shed (storage & allied activities, stabling lines, construction of compound wall & road, diversion of nala, reconstruction of existing cemetery) at Mandale for Metro Line-2B at CTS No. 6/1 (pt) Mandale and CTS No.10(pt) Turbhe by MMRDA

Member Secretary

Page 31 of 38

The officials of MMRDA presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for proposed construction of various activities of Metro Car Shed (storage & allied activities, stabling lines, construction of compound wall & road, diversion of nala, reconstruction of existing cemetery) at Mandale for Metro Line-2B on plot bearing CTS No. 6/1 (pt) Mandale and CTS No.10 (pt) Turbhe.

The Authority noted following activities are proposed which are located in CRZ II area as per approved CZMP:

- Storage & allied activities area = 3.83 Ha.
- proposed Nala diversion area = 350 Sq.mt.
- proposed road area = 246 Sq.mt.
- compound wall length = 868 m
- reconstruction of Cemetery area = 3000 Sq.mt.
- stabling lines (Part) = 3600 sq. mt.

As per High court order in PIL No.87 of 2006 dtd. 17/09/2018, compound wall is allowed in 50 m mangrove buffer zone for the protection of mangroves. Proposed diversion of RCC open Nalla having 10 m width and 30m length is affected in CRZ-II area. Also, 6 m wide proposed road is affected in CRZ-II area for length of 41 m. Pyres and shed of Cemetery is affected in CRZ-II area.

The Authority noted that, proposed nalla diversion falls partly in CRZ-II and partly in non CRZ area. The MCGM has granted permission for the said diversion of nalla. The diversion of nalla shall not impact the existing flow of water and High Tide line.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposals to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- The Proposed activities should be as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 2. MMRDA to ensure that activities are not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 3. MMRDA to ensure that construction is not allowed CRZ-I area.
- 4. MMRDA to ensure that construction debris are not dumped in CRZ area.
- 5. MMRDA to ensure that activities are not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 6. Proper effluent treatment measures should be undertaken by MMRDA. Only treated effluent should be discharged into the sea/creek.

Member Secretary

Page 32 of 38

- 7. Best engineering practices & construction should be followed for fire safety measures and for conservation of coastal environment
- 8. No chemical manufacturing processing / treatment shall be allowed.
- 9. Hazardous and toxic waste generated due to casting yard related activities should not be released into the creek.
- 10. Ail other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained

<u>Item No.6:</u> Proposed construction of Casting yard at Mandale for Metro Line-2B by MMRDA

The officials of MMRDA presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for proposed construction of Casting yard at Mandale for Metro Line-2B on total land area of 4.06 Ha, out of which, 3.16 Ha. is situated in CRZ-II area and 0.9 Ha falls in non CRZ area.

It was further presented that, the said plot will be utilized temporarily for construction of pre-cast girders required for Metro projects.

The Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation, decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to compliance of the following conditions:-

- 1. The Proposed activities should be as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 2. The CRZ recommendation is only for setting up of a casting yard on temporary basis for 5 years. After the completion of the work, site should be restored to its original condition.
- 3. MMRDA to ensure that activities are not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 4. No permanent structure is allowed to construct on site under reference.
- 5. No chemical manufacturing processing / treatment shall be allowed.
- 6. Proper effluent treatment measures should be undertaken by MMRDA. Only treated effluent should be discharged into the sea/creek.
- 7. Noise level during operation phase should not exceed the permissible limit.
- 8. Hazardous and toxic waste generated due to casting yard related activities should not be released into the creek.
- All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

Member Secretary

Page 33 of 38

<u>Item No.7:</u> Proposed construction of Casting yard for Metro Line-4 at CTS No. 4207, Block G, BKC, Mumbai by MMRDA.

The officials of MMRDA presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for proposed construction of casting yard for Metro Line-4 at CTS No. 4207, Block G, BKC, Mumbai. Total area of the land is 3.6 Ha, out of which 1.4 Ha. falls in CRZ-II area. It was further presented that, land is situated on the landward side of existing road and retaining wall. The said plot will be utilized temporarily for construction of pre-cast girders required for Metro projects.

The Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation, decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to the concerned Planning Authority subject to compliance of the following conditions:-

- The Proposed activities should be as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 2. The CRZ recommendation is only for setting up of a temporary casting yard for 5 years. After the completion of the work, site should be restored to its original condition.
- 3. MMRDA to ensure that activities are not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 4. No permanent structure allowed to erect on site under reference.
- 5. No chemical manufacturing processing / treatment shall be allowed.
- 6. Proper effluent treatment measures should be undertaken by MMRDA. Only treated effluent should be discharged into the sea.
- 7. Noise level during operation phase should not exceed the permissible limit.
- 8. Hazardous and toxic waste generated due to casting yard related activities should not be released into the creek.
- 9. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

<u>Item No.8:</u> Proposed Labour Camp for Metro Line-4 on land bearing CTS No.6, Wadala, Mumbai by MMRDA

The officials of MMRDA presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for proposed Labour Camp for Metro Line-4 on plot bearing CTS No.6, Wadala, Mumbai. Total area of the land is 1.30 Ha, out of which 0.50 Ha falls in

Member Secretary

Page 34 of 38

Chairman

CRZ-II area. The said plot will be utilized temporarily for construction of Labour Camp for Metro projects.

The Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation, decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to the concerned Planning Authority subject to compliance of the following conditions:-

- The Proposed activities should be as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 2. The CRZ recommendation is only for construction of Labour Camp for Metro projects for 5 years. After the completion of the work, site should be restored to its original condition.
- 3. MMRDA to ensure that activities are not proposed in mangrove or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 4. No permanent structure allowed to erect on site under reference.
- 5. Proper sewage treatment measures should be undertaken by MMRDA. Only treated sewage should be discharged into the creek.
- 6. Prior Environment Clearance should be obtained under EIA Notification, 2006 from SEIAA, if the Total BUA of labour camps exceeds 20,000 sqm.
- 7. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

<u>Item No.9:</u> Proposed construction of Metro Line-6 alignment near Swami Samarth Nagar, Mumbai by MMRDA

The officials of MMRDA presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for proposed construction of Metro Line-6 alignment near Swami Samarth Nagar, Mumbai. Total length of Metro Line-6 alignment is 14.5 km. out of which part alignment at swami Samarth nagar (0.917 km) falls in CRZ area.

It was further presented that alignment comprising of 634 m (Piers 26 nos, Area= 650 Sq.mt) falls in 50 m Mangrove buffer zone) and 48.49 m (Piers 2 nos, Area= 50 Sq.mt) falls in CRZ-II area. Proposed mmetro alignment will be entirely elevated and. Metro Piers (area= 25 SqMt. of size $5m \times 5m$) will be constructed on existing road, which is in 50 m mangrove buffer zone.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:

Member Secretary

Page 35 of 38

Chairman

- The Proposed activities should be as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- MMRDA to ensure that no mangroves should be cut for the proposed activities.
- Prior High Court permission should be obtained by MMRDA, since 650 sqm area of elevated alignment of the Metro line on existing road is passing through 50 m mangrove buffer zone area.
- 4. MMRDA to implement the Environment Management Plan while implementation and operation phase of the project.
- 5. MMRDA to ensure that construction debris should not be disposed of in CRZ area.
- 6. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item no.10:</u> Proposed construction of tourism jetties and allied facilities at Survarndurg Fort and Harnai, Ratnagiri by MMB.

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of tourism jetties and allied facilities at Survarndurg Fort and Harnai, Ratnagiri. Project activities area as follows:

- RCC pile jetty at Suvarnadurg Fort- 48 mx 6m
- Berthing jetty- 32 mx6 m
- RCC pile jetty near PI Office (Harnai)- 120m x 6 m
- Berthing jetty- 38.85 mx 6 m
- Aluminium link span- 16 m x 6 m

The jetties are extremely necessary to ensure safe and convenient embarking / disembarking of tourists at the fort. Due to such enhance facilities/capacity augmentation number of tourists will increase.

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP under CRZ, 2011, the project activities are proposed in CRZ IV and CRZ I-B area. It was further noted that Rapid EIA submitted by the MMB. The MMB to undertake site specific Environment Management Plan for the project.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposals of anti-sea erosion bund to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

Member Secretary

Page 36 of 38

hairman

- The proposed activity should be undertaken strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. There shall not be obstruction to free flow of the sea water.
- 3. The MMB to implement the Environment Management Plan during construction and operation phase.
- 4. The MMB to ensure that design of the jetties should be undertaken taking into account the Archaeological and heritage value of the Survaranadurg Fort.
- 5. Construction debris should not be dumped in the sea.
- 6. MMB to put up signage and boards to jetty instructing tourists not to through plastic and other solid waste into the sea.
- 7. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

Discussion Items:

Item No.1:

Clarification on implementation of projects falling in CRZ area in Maharashtra as per para 6(i) of the CRZ Notification, 2019

The Authority noted that the MoEF&CC, New Delhi vide GSR 37(E) dated 18th January, 2019 published the CRZ Notification, 2019. A clarification was sought vide letter dated 18.1.2019 from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi pertaining to para 6(i) of the CRZ Notification, 2019.

The Authority noted that the MoEF&CC, New Delhi vide letter dated 26.2.2019 issued a clarification in this respect, which states that:

"Until CZMPs of the Maharashtra prepared under the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011 are updated/ revised under the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2019 issued vide GSR 37(E) dated 18.1.2019, the provisions of this new notification shall not apply and the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 shall continue to be followed for appraisal and CRZ clearance of projects in the CRZ areas"

The Authority took on record the above said clarification issued by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi and the same will be followed.

Member Secretary

Page 37 of 38

hairman

Item No.2: Regarding CZMP of the Thane, Palghar and Navi Mumbai area.

The Authority noted that draft CZMPs of the Districts Thane, Palghar and Navi Mumbai were in the process of finalization by the Central Government authorized agencies and with necessary approval of the State Government, the CZMPs were recommended to MoEF&CC, New Delhi for approval. The MoEF&CC, New Delhi vide letter dated 28.2.2019 has conveyed its approval to the CZMPs of the Thane, Palghar and Navi Mumbai area. The Authority took on record the said approval of the MoEF&CC, New Delhi.

------Meeting ended with vote of thanks------Meeting ended with vote of thanks------

Annexure I

List of the members present in the meeting:

- 1. Mr. Vasudevan, Additional Principal Chief Conservator of Forest, Mangrove Cell, Mumbai
- 2. Mr. Vidale, Commissioner Fisheries.
- 3. Mr. Kandalkar, Dy. Chief Engineer, Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.
- 4. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 5. Dr. Khot Mahadev Satappa, Principal, Chh. Sambhaji Raje Sainik School, Ratnagri, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 6. Mr. Kudale, Ex director, CWPRS, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 7. Mr. Suryakant K. Nikam Member Secretary, MCZMA

Page 38 of 38