

**Minutes of the 84<sup>th</sup> meeting of Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary (Environment) on 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> August, 2013 at 11.00 am at Sachivalay Gymkhana, Mumbai.**

List of Members present in the meeting is enclosed as Annexure-I

Municipal Commissioner, Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai, Mumbai; The Additional Chief Secretary, Revenue Department, Mantralaya, Mumbai; Principal Secretary, Industries Department, Mantralaya, Mumbai; Principal Secretary, Urban Development Department, Mantralaya, Mumbai; Commissioner Fisheries; Dr. M. C. Deo, Director, Veermata Jijabai Technological Institute (VJTI), Matunga, Mumbai and Dr. Baban Ingole, NIO could not attend the meeting. The meeting was adjourned for 30 minutes for want of quorum and then started.

**Item No.: 1                      Confirmation of Minutes of the 83<sup>rd</sup> Meeting of Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 6.8.2013.**

The draft minutes of the 83rd Meeting of Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 06.08.2013 were circulated to all members of MCZMA through email for confirmation. The members were requested to provide suggestions/ objections, if any, on draft minutes. Dr.M.Baba, Member, suggested some changes and additions, which have been incorporated in the draft minutes appropriately. Accordingly, the minutes were confirmed.

**Item No.2 :    Improvement to Sion- Panvel Special State Highway from BARC junction to Kalamboli junction by Public Works Department, GoM**

The Authority noted that earlier, the proposal regarding "Improvement to Sion- Panvel Special State Highway from BARC junction to Kalamboli junction by Public Works Department, GoM" was considered in the 82<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 10.6.2013; wherein the proposal details were as follows-

1. The proposed project is for road Improvement from B.A.R.C. Jn. to Kalamboli Jn., Maharashtra
2. The project is spread in 3 districts:
  1. Mumbai: BARC Jn to Vashi bridge (approx 4.53km),
  2. Thane: Vashi to Kharghar and (approx 12.8 km)
  3. Raigad: Kharghar to Kalamboli (approx 7.5 km)
3. Length of the alignment is 23.09 km
4. Project Details
  - Alignment: 23.09 km. From B.A.R.C. Jn. to Kalamboli Jn.
  - Widening: ROW of 60 m . From 30 m to 60m.
5. Flyovers:
  - Proposed:3 Nos. at Sanpada Junction, Uran Junction and Kamothe Junction

- Dual carriage: 2 Nos. at Taloja Junction & CMLR Junction
- Widening: 1 No. at Turbhe Flyover on both sides
- Bridge: Widening of Taloja Bridge & Jui Creek Bridge up to 14 Lanes
- Toll Plazas: 1 No. at Kamothe with 15+15 Lanes

• Others:

Pavement	Underpasses	Road Appurtenances
Footpath	CD Works	Junction Improvements
Drains	Landscaping	FOB' & ROB's
Bus Bays/Stops	Utility Shifting	Tree Cutting Transplantation

In the 82<sup>nd</sup> meeting, Authority observed that toll plaza is proposed substantially in mangrove area which would affect the mangrove vegetation. To overcome this issue, Authority directed the project proponent to explore alternate possibilities of setting up of toll plaza.

Accordingly, Project Proponent submitted the reply vide its letter dated 21.8.2013 along with revised proposal of Toll Plaza.

As presented by the proponent, it was noted that revised proposal of Toll plaza is with 9 + 9 lanes instead of 15 + 15 lanes proposed previously. In order to save the mangroves, Toll Plaza is planned in a staggered manner within existing ROW of 60M. The Pune bound Toll Plaza (RHS) is planned at existing location at Kamothe and Mumbai bound Toll Plaza (LHS) is proposed at Kopra.

Details of the revised proposal of Toll Plaza is as follows-

Previous toll Plaza details				Revised Toll Plaza details			
Location	No. of lanes	Mangrove cutting involved	Land acquisition	Location	No. of lanes	Mangrove cutting involved	Land acquisition
Kamothe	LHS: 15 lanes	7 ha	6 ha	Kopra	LHS: 9 Lanes	Nil	Nil
	RHS: 15 lanes			Kamothe	RHS: 9 Lanes	Nil	Nil

The revised project details falling in proposed alignment are as follows:-

S. No.	Description	Unit	Qty.
1	Alignment Length	km / Ha	23.09 / 143.75
2	Alignment Width	M	30
3	Alignment passing through CRZ I	km / Ha	4.3 / 12.9
4	Alignment passing through CRZ II	km / Ha	7.3 / 21.9
5	Area within 50 M buffer Zone	km / Ha	7.2 / 9.2
6	Mangroves within proposed alignment	km	Nil



The Authority after details discussion and deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to compliance of following conditions-

- 1) The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2) No construction should be carried out in mangroves area.
- 3) No mangroves shall be cut during implementation of project.
- 4) Disposal of debris during construction phase should be as per MSW (M&H) rules, 2000.
- 5) Proponent should have proper Environment Management Plan and specific financial budget should be allocated for protection of coastal zone.
- 6) Mitigation measures during construction phase for controlling air pollution shall be adopted.
- 7) Control measures shall be adopted for high noise generating construction activities.
- 8) Hon'ble High Court permission should be obtained, since the construction is proposed in 50 m mangroves buffer zone area.
- 9) All the other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work

**Item No. 3: Reconstruction of Municipal Dispensary & Staff Quarters at Banganga in 'D' Ward at C.S.No.18, Malbar Hill Dn. Mumbai**

Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the following proposal details-

<b>Proposal Details:</b>	The proposed reconstruction of Municipal Dispensary & Staff Quarters comprises of Ground + 4 upper floors <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ground + upper two floors - Municipal Dispensary</li> <li>• 3<sup>rd</sup> + 4<sup>th</sup> upper floors – Staff Quarters</li> </ul>
<b>Location of the Project:</b>	Plot bearing at Banganga in 'D' Ward at C.S.No. 18, Malabar Hill Division, Mumbai
<b>Proposal Category:</b>	Redevelopment
<b>CRZ Category of the proposed site:</b>	As per the approved CZMP, Greater Mumbai, The plot falls in CRZ II and Situated on seaward side.
<b>DP Remarks,</b>  a) <b>Zone:</b> b) <b>Reservation:</b>  c) <b>Proposed Use:</b>	As per the Development Plan Remarks, a) Residential Zone. b) Municipal Dispensary (Part of large reservation). c) Municipal Dispensary & Staff Quarters purpose

<b>FSI Details,</b>  <b>a) Permissible FSI:</b> <b>b) FSI proposed to be consumed:</b>	As per the layout plan,  a) 1.33 b) 1.05
<b>Area Details,</b>  <b>a) Total area of the plot:</b> <b>b) Deduction of road setback area:</b> <b>c) Balance area of plot:</b> <b>d) Net area of plot:</b> <b>e) Addition for FSI (deduction of road setback area 100 %):</b> <b>f) Permissible built up area:</b> <b>g) Existing built up area (before demolition)</b> <b>h) Existing shed area proposed to be retained:</b> <b>i) Proposed built up area:</b> <b>j) Total proposed BUA:</b>	As per the layout plan submitted by PP, a) 1064.39sqm b) 16.37sqm c) 1018.02sqm d) 1048.02sqm e) 16.37sqm f) 1415.63sqm g) 865.00sqm h) 202.75sqm i) 914.95sqm j) 1117.70sqm

The Authority noted that as per para 4(ii) (i) of the CRZ Notification, 2011; Demolition and reconstruction of (a) buildings of archaeological and historical importance, (ii) heritage buildings; and buildings under public use which means buildings such as for the purposes of worship, education, **medical care** and cultural activities; requires prior approval of MoEF.

The Authority resolved that such proposals which are meant for public use as defined in para 4(ii) (i) may not be sent to MoEF, New Delhi. However, due to the provisions of para 4(ii) of CRZ Notification, 2011; the proposal has to be sent to MoEF.

The Authority after discussion and deliberation, decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. Reconstruction of authorized building to be permitted subject with the existing Floor Space Index or Floor Area Ratio Norms and without change in present use.
3. The concerned planning authority should ensure that there is no change of present use for the proposed redevelopment of existing authorized building.
4. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, lay out plan, height involved in the proposal is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 19.2.1991
5. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.



**Item No. 4: Uran- Chakhan-Shikrapur LPG Pipe Line Hindustan Petroleum Corporation Ltd.**

The Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the following proposal details-

1. The proposal is for underground LPG Pipe Line from Uran to Chakan/Shikrapur for transportation of LPG. The proposed construction of 165 km long 12" dia underground seamless LPG pipeline connecting BPC LPG plant at Uran to HPC/ IOC LPG plants at Chakan and BPC LPG plant at Shikrapur.
2. The pipeline is crossing the Karanja Creek at Ghasakoshi Village and Patalganga River at Kasarbhat Village. The pipeline alignment at Karanja creek falls in CRZ area and between the Karanja Creek and Patalganga River, the pipeline is crossing High Tide Line (HTL).
3. As per the CZMP of Raigad, the plot falls in CRZ III. The CRZ map (1:4000 scale ) prepared by Institute of Remote Sensing, Anna University submitted by the proponent shows, the pipeline is passing through CRZ I, III area.
4. The total length of the Project is 164.632km. The pipeline is passing in CRZ area for about 970m at two locations Karanja Creek (550m at Road Bridge near Ghasakoshi Village), Uran and Patalganga River (420m at Kasarbhat Village). In these areas the pipeline is proposed to be laid across the Karanja Creek and Patalganga River at 90 degree crossing and through Horizontal directional drilling method.
5. The pipeline is laid underground at a depth of 1.5 metre from the pipeline top to the surface and trench width is 2m.
6. The width of karanja creek at the point of crossing is 234m and mangrove cover is 156m to one side and 222m to the other side.

Name	Uran- Chakan-shikrapur LPG pipeline
Transport material	LPG
Pipeline length	164.632, including spur line length 13.2km
Tap off point	Usar Bottling Plant – 17.473km HPCL Chakan – 114.496km IOCL Chakan – 132.486km
Terminal	BPCL Shikrapur – 150.063km for Main line and HPC Chakan – 9.0km IOC Chakan – 4.2km for spurlines
SV station	6
Block Valves	17
ROU	18m & 10m all along the pipeline route aggregation 2.92 sqkm (10 m for forest area)
Design capacity of the pipeline	1.0 MMTPA

Line size & thickness	12" dia& 8.38mm / 7.14/ 6.35 mm thickness for the main line 10" dia& 7.09mm / 6.35mm thickness for the spurline
ROW (m)	18m all along pipeline length, 10m width near forest lands, developed areas
Burial depth (m)	1.2m for normal terrain, 2.5m for cased railway crossings, 5.0 m HDD for river crossings.

The Project proponent presented that the pipeline is proposed to be laid underground by Horizontal directional drilling method across the Karanja Creek and Patalganga River and no construction is proposed at these places. No mangroves would be destroyed / cut. The pipeline is laid normally at a depth of 1.5m and across the water bodies the pipeline is laid at a depth of 4m below the water bed.

The Authority discussed the proposal at length and suggested that two end points of pipeline across Karanjacreek and Patalganga River should be in Non CRZ area. The pipeline should be laid underground at a depth of 10 metre, wherever mangroves vegetation is present, in order to avoid their destruction /cutting.

It was noted that as per Para 4 (ii) (d),of CRZ Notification, 2011; Laying of pipelines requires prior approval from the MoEF.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. Site preparation, installing pipeline and site restoration in CRZ area should be undertaken without damaging the coastal-geomorphological features, mangroves vegetation present in CRZ area.
3. Two end points of pipeline across Karanja creek and Patalganga River should be in Non CRZ area.
4. The pipeline should be laid underground at a depth of 10 metre, wherever mangroves vegetation is present, in order to avoid their destruction. No mangrove destruction / cutting is allowed due to the project.
5. Natural course of Karanja Creek and Patalganga River water should not be hampered due to proposed activities. Proper measures should be undertaken in order to avoid contamination of creek water.
6. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.



**Item No. 5: Proposal for development & beautification of Chaityabhoomi Phase III at Dadar in G/ North Ward by MCGM**

Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. Proposal is for development & beautification of Chaityabhoomi Phase III (Situating in CRZ I) at Dadar in G/ North Ward to MCGM.
2. As per the letter dated 14<sup>th</sup> May, 2013 of MCGM, the land under reference falls in CRZ I and is abutting to HTL. The proposed elevated walk way is to be constructed over single pillar. The width of proposed elevated walkway 12 m and 3.10 m above sand level.
3. DP remarks for the land comprising F.P. No. 1140 (pt) of TPS IV ( Mahim ) and C.S.No.2118 (pt) , 1/354 (pt) of Mahim Division in G/North Ward, mentions that the land is situated in Residential Zone.
4. The proposal involves the construction of elevated walkway as a exit from the "Stupa" and construction of "Toran (entrance gate)" and "Ashok Stumbh" at exist points.

The Authority observed that the elevated walkway of width 12 m. and 3.10 m above sand level is proposed on beach area, which is CRZ I. Construction on beach is against the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority discussed various alternative options for the elevated walkway. After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to make a site visit to the Chaityabhoomi spot.

**Item No. 6: Construction of bridge across Ulhas creek near Motagoan on Mankoli- Motagoan Missing link in Kalyan, Dist- Thane by MMRDA**

The Mumbai Metropolitan Regional Development Authority (MMRDA) presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. Proposal is of construction of bridge across ulhas creek near Motagoan on Mankoli- Motagoan Missing link in Kalyan, Dist- Thane
2. MMRDA has proposed construction of Bridge (with approaches) over Ulhas River part of missing link of Dombivali – Bhiwandi Section from Mankoli to Motagoan. The proposed road would avail direct approach to NH3 from Dombivali (W) of KDMC limit
3. Proposed Bridge includes approaches chainage 2316 m to 3750 m of proposed Mankoli Motagoan Road ( 0/0- 3/700). Construction of missing link will require installation of pier for support above water level.
  - Length of missing link – 980 m
  - Width of bridge – 22 m – 4 lane
  - Bridge area –  $980 * 22 = 21560$  Sqm
  - Approaches Mankoli Site ( Bhiwanditaluka ) –  $226 * 45 = 10170$  sqm
  - Approached Motegoan Site ( KDMC ) –  $228 * 45 = 10260$  sqm
  - Nearest Road- Kalyan Bypass Road
  - Nearest Station- Dombivali&kopar



4. As per the CZMP prepared by CESS, Kerala submitted by the project, the site falls in CRZ I, CRZ II, CRZ III. Mangroves vegetation will be disturbed by the proposed construction. The proposed activity also falls in CRZ IV as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.

Authority observed that the site under reference has more potential than 4 lanes proposed for the road. It was suggested that the MMRDA may lay piers along the Ulhas creek considering the more potential of the lanes, so that in future, wider road can be proposed without proposing additional piers across the Ulhas River and thereby causing less disturbance to the coastal ecology of the Ulhas River.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF time to time.
2. Bridge Construction activities should not affect free flow of tidal water
3. Disposal of debris during construction phase should be as per MSW (M&H) rules, 2000 and debris should not be disposed in CRZ area.
4. Proponent should have proper Environment Management Plan and specific financial budget should be allocated for protection of coastal zone.
5. Mitigation measures during construction phase for controlling air pollution and water pollution will be adopted.
6. Appropriate control measures shall be adopted for high noise generating construction activities.
7. Hon'ble High Court permission is mandatory for construction activity in mangroves or its 50 meter buffer zone area, if any.
8. Mangrove re-plantation plan (10 times of mangroves affected) along with survey number, location, agency, pert chart etc. should be submitted by the proponent.
9. All the other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work

**Item No. 7: Proposed construction of link between NH 3 and Ghodbunder road bypass road by MMRDA.**

The Mumbai Metropolitan Regional Development Authority (MMRDA) presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. The proposed Godbunder Road by pass to NH 3, starts from Gaymukh to Ghodbunder road and ends near Toll Naka at approach to Kasheli Bridge. The length of this road is 15 km
2. This 15 km link road with 45 width is approved in the Development plan of Thane Municipal Corporation. And runs between Gaimukh to Majiwade connecting Thane- Ghodbunder SH-42 and Mumbai- Nasik NH 3. The CRZ area under proposal is as follows-



Sr No	CRZ zone	Area under CRZ ( Sqmt )
1	I (i)	212545.020
2	I (ii)	0.00
3	II	7144.580
4	III	207104.720
5	Buffer	141462.20

The Authority discussed the alignment of the road and noted that the proposed alignment of bypass road is passing through rich biodiversity area of Ghodbundar. It would shift all the city traffic towards creek area, thereby disturbing pristine ecology of the area and shall pose pollution problems to the water body due to probable commercial activities. .

Hence, Proponent was directed to explore other alternative for the bypass road,

When, proponent informed that TMC is also planning for the same road; the Authority after deliberation decided that the Thane Municipal Corporation may submit the proposal with all other possible alternatives considering the EIA studies and coastal protection plan for the project.

**Item No. 8: Proposed construction of Kalyan Ring Road by MMRDA**

The Mumbai Metropolitan Regional Development Authority (MMRDA ) presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

Mumbai Metropolitan Regional Authority (MMRDA) vide letter dated 15.7.2012 forwarded a proposal of construction of Kalyan Ring Road. As per the MMRDA's letter-

1. The proposed Ring Road is having approximately 29.7 km road length and is divided in 3 parts, most parts of alignment runs parallel to Ulhas creek and Railway line. This is one of the links sanctioned as DP road in KDMC.
2. The work is approved under extended MUIP programme and included in annual plan 2013-14 by the Authority in the 132<sup>nd</sup> meeting held on 23.3.2013 under the chairmanship of Hon'ble Chief Minister of Govt. of Maharashtra.
3. This 29.70 km Ring Road with 45m width is approved in the DP plan of Kalyan Dombivali Municipal Corporation and recommended in CTS Plan
3. The road broadly consists of three sections as follows-

Section 1: Construction of new link from Motagoan to Katai Naka under KRR

Section 2: Construction of new link from Motagoan to Govindwadi Bypass under KRR

Section 3: construction of new link from Durgadi Bridge to Titwala

All these 3 sections of the new alignment, with 6 lane configurations which passes through cross country, it crosses railway tracks at three locations and sub tail crossing of Ulhas creek at one location near.

Sr No	CRZ zone	Area under CRZ ( Sqm )
1	I (i)	34760.720
2	I (ii)	38379.040
3	II	23648.540
4	III	221`892.465
5	Buffer	17359.430

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to MoEF subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF time to time.
2. Construction of road should be on the stilt in CRZ I area
3. Construction of road should not affect free flow of tidal water
4. Disposal of debris during construction phase should be as per MSW (M&H) rules, 2000 and debris should not be disposed in CRZ area.
5. Proponent should have proper Environment Management Plan and specific financial budget should be allocated for protection of coastal zone.
6. Mitigation measures during construction phase for controlling air pollution and water pollution will be adopted.
7. Control measures shall be adopted for high noise generating construction activities.
8. Hon'ble High Court permission should be obtained, since construction activity is proposed partly in mangroves or its 50 meter buffer zone area.
9. Mangroves re-plantation plan (10 times the mangroves affected area ) along with survey number, location, agency, port chart etc. should be submitted by the proponent.
10. All the other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work

**Item No. 9: Proposed redevelopment & reconstruction of Fire Station with Fire brigade quarters on plot bearing No. 29/1A on reservation plot in Mumbra under Thane Municipal Corporation**

Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. The proposed project comprises of Firemen quarters (P+8), Fire Office building (G+2) and Fire Officers Quarters (P+3) in CRZ – II area by demolishing Fire Brigade office & Firemen Quarters. Garden is proposed on mangroves buffer zone area.
2. As per Development plan the land under consideration is reserved for Fire Brigade.
3. The CZMP of Thane indicates the land under reference partly falls in in CRZ II and partly in mangroves 50 mtr buffer zone.
4. FSI Details:  
As per the layout plan submitted by Project Proponent,
  - Total area of the plot = 4069.53 sqm.
  - Area under Mangroves buffer zone = 869.674 sqm



- Area under Water dept. = 814.225 sqm
- Permissible built up area = 4069.53 sqm
- Total proposed area = 4069.53 sqm
  - a. Fire Office building (G+2) = 1263.479 sqm
  - b. Firemen quarters (P+8) = 2315.736 sqm
  - c. Fire Officers Quarters (P+3) = 211.361 sqm
  - d. Garden = 869.674 sqm
  - e. Water dept. (Existing) = 278.954 sqm
- Total construction area = 5426.89 sqm
  - f. Fire Office building (G+2) = 1861.00 sqm
  - g. Firemen quarters (P+8) = 3200.83 sqm
  - h. Fire Officers Quarters (P+3) = 365.06 sqm

5. As per Form – I Submitted by Project proponent,

- Total area of the plot = 4069.53 sqm
- Permissible FSI = 1
- Total Built up area = 3425.03 sqm
- Total construction area = 65426 sqm

It was noted that Thane Municipal Corporation (TMC) replied to the points raised by the MCZMA's letter. The said reply is as follows-

1) Zoning and reservation of the plot under reference.

The plot S. No. 29/1A is under Public and Semi Public zone and is reserved for Fire Brigade as per Development Plan of the Thane Municipal Corporation approved on 4.10.1999.

2) Exact CRZ Status of the plot under reference.

As per CESS survey, landward side of existing road is affected by CRZ II and Mangroves buffer zone. As there exist quarters on site, which are coming under buffer zone. However, TMC has not proposed any structure in the buffer zone.

3) Total construction area (area counted in FSI + area free of FSI)

As per D.C. Rule as on 19.2.1991 permissible FSI is One. The area of the plot is 4069.53 Sqm and existing area is 3123.00 Sqm The construction area under redevelopment and reconstruction of Fire brigade is 4069.53 Sqm The area counted in FSI is 4069.53 as per DCR as on 19.2.1991.

The project proponent presented that the site under reference partly falls in CRZ II, as per the CZMP prepared by CESS, kerala. Further, site is also affected by the 50 m mangroves buffer zone area. However, no construction is proposed in 50 m mangroves buffer Zone area, instead recreational garden (RG) is proposed in the said area.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal to Thane Municipal Corporation (TMC) subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. Mangroves 50 m buffer zone should be kept open and protected and no construction is allowed in this area.
3. Reconstruction of authorized building to be permitted subject with the existing Floor Space Index or Floor Area Ratio Norms and without change in present use.
4. The concerned planning authority should ensure that there is no change of present use for the proposed redevelopment of existing authorized building.
5. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, lay out plan, height involved in the proposal is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 19.2.1991
6. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No.10: Proposed redevelopment of building under the provision of DC Regulation 33(6) of the existing building on plot bearing C.S.No. 63, Colaba Division, situated at ShahidBhagatsinghmarg, A ward, Mumbai**

The proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the following-

1. The proposal is for redevelopment of dilapidated building situated at Colaba division under DC regulation 33(6) of DCR 1991 in accordance with para 8.v.(c) of CRZ Notification, 2011.
2. The Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM) has forwarded the proposal of "Proposed redevelopment of existing building under the provision of DC Regulation 33(6) of DCR 1991 on plot bearing C.S.No. 63, colaba Division, situated at Shahid Bhagatsinghmarg, A ward, Mumbai" vide letter dated 30.4.2013 to MCZMA.
3. In 78<sup>th</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2012, under Item No. 5, took a policy decision, wherein it was decided that the proposals for CRZ recommendations should come before the MCZMA only after obtaining the Intimation of Disapproval (IOD) by the Project Proponent from the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.
4. Further, in 82<sup>nd</sup> meeting of MCZMA held on 10.6.2013 it was decided that "proposals should come before the MCZMA for CRZ recommendation only after obtaining IOD from the MCGM. Accordingly, the MCZMA is considering the proposals. Authority decided that if the Authority feels the requirement of UDD's remarks; the proposal would be sent to UDD for their remarks". Accordingly, the Authority may decide whether UDD remarks is required or not.
5. The proponent has submitted IOD dated 22.7.2008 issued by the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai. Further, the MCGM letter dated 30.4.2013 mentions that ; the Municipal Commissioner has accorded "in principal" approval for the proposed building having height of 127.53 mts.
6. As per DP remarks of the MCGM dated 27.12.2006; the plot under reference falls in Residential Zone with shop line facing the shahidBhagat Singh Road.
7. As per the CZMP approved by MoEF in 2000; the plot under reference falls in CRZ II and situated on landward side of existing road.



8. The MCGM remarks dated 30.4.2013 mentions that there are dilapidated "A" category two cessed building on C.S. No. 63 of Colaba division. These building were declared dangerous by concern authority. Existing building area 3842.08 Sqmt consuming FSI 2.66 was demolished and proposed building with 2.05 FSI area of 3841.40 Sqmt as per DR regu. 33(6) is in progress.
9. The MHADA letter dated 27.2.2008 mentions that portion of building on premises Rashid Mansion, situated at Opp Colaba post office, 149, S.B.S. Road, Colaba, Mumbai-05 is in ruinous condition likely to fall and dangerous to any person occupying. The Copy of similar letter dated 27.2.2008 for 149-A building has been submitted, which also mentions that the structure is in ruinous condition likely to fall and dangerous
10. Copy of the MCGM letter dated 2.2.2009 has been submitted which shows the permission is granted to demolish the building No. 149 & 149 A, Rashid Mansion No. 1 & No. 2 respectively, S.B. Road, Colaba, Mumbai.
11. There was earlier NOC from CRZ point of view from UDD ( TPB-2007/3148/CR-273/07/UD-11 dated 2<sup>nd</sup> February, 2008 ) for proposed building comprising of Ground + 1 podium + 15 upper floors with height 58.08 Sqm. Copy of the same is submitted.
12. The IOD for the same was granted on 22.7.2008 and CC upto plinth was also granted on 21.7.2009.
13. Thereafter the plans were amended, reducing the floor plate of the building from fire safety point of view and increase the height of the building upto 158.58 m. As per amended plans, the building comprises of basement + ground + 9 podium + girder level + stilt + service + 29 upper floors, accordingly CC upto 46.04 m was endorsed on 27.8.2010
14. MHADA has granted NoC dated 17.4.2009 for reconstruction of property situated at C.S. No. 63 of Colaba Division, Ward No. 149 & 149A, cess no. A-205(1), A-205(2), Mumbai under 33(6) of DCR 1991.
15. As per MCGM remarks dated 30.4.2013; amended plans modifying refuse area was submitted availing the benefit as per CRZ Notification, 2011. Accordingly, the proposed building comprises of Basement + Ground + 9 podium + girder level + stilt + service + 22<sup>nd</sup> upper floors with height upto 127.53 m The plans for the same have been submitted.
16. Municipal Commissioner, MCGM approved the building height of 127.53 m subject to NoC from High Rise Committee. Accordingly, the amended plans were approved on 25.3.2013 for height of building upto 68.83 m and CC is not endorsed for want of revised NoC from MCZMA.
17. As per the plans approved upto 68.83 m submitted (along with IOD) -
 

• Area of plot –	1860.79 sqm
• Proposed area-	1071.20 sqm
• Total built up area proposed-	1118.42 sqm
• Balance area kept in abeyance till the clearance from High Rise Committee for Height more than 70.00 m	2722.66 sqm
18. Public hearing was conducted on 2.7.2013 by MPCB. Copy of report for the same was submitted to MCZMA. The environment related points are-
  - a) To treat the sewage, the STP consisting of primary, secondary and tertiary treatment will be provided and the treated sewage will be connected to MCGM sewerage.



- b) The solid waste generated will be segregated into dry and wet bins and wet solid waste will be disposed to MCGM for further treatment and dry waste will be sold to recycler.
- c) The rain water harvesting and solar system will be provided.
- d) Tree plantation as per the MCGM norms on open space is available
- e) At the time of construction, necessary precaution will be taken to control noise pollution.
- f) No written representation / objection were received from the residents.

19. A letter dated 23.8.2013 has been sent to MCGM for seeking certain information. Proponent has submitted a reply to MCZMA.

During the meeting, the proponent submitted NoC from High Rise Committee since the height of the proposed building exceeds 70 m.

The Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. Reconstruction of authorized building to be permitted subject with the existing Floor Space Index or Floor Area Ratio Norms and without change in present use.
3. The concerned planning authority should ensure that there is no change of present use for the proposed redevelopment of existing authorized building.
4. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, lay out plan, height involved in the proposal is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 6.1.2011
5. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, non FSI area and FSI concessions granted by Municipal Commissioner is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 6.1.2011
6. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No. 11: Proposed redevelopment of C.S. No. 2085 and 2086 of Bhuleshwar Division at JagannathShankarshet Road, C- Ward, Thakurdwar, Mumbai**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the following-

1. The proposal is submitted through Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai vide letter dated 31.8.2012, which was forwarded to Urban Development Department to offer its comment on permissible FSI, land use, height and land reservation etc. Accordingly, the Urban Development Department sent the file back with remarks that on receipt of in-principal approval from Municipal Commissioner, MCGM on the proposal, the remarks from UDD will be provided.
2. The matter of in principal approval from Municipal Commissioner, MCGM to the CRZ proposals was deliberated in 78<sup>th</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2012, under Item No. 5. In the said meeting, it was decided that the proposals for CRZ recommendations should come before the MCZMA only after obtaining the Intimation of Disapproval (IOD) by the Project Proponent from the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai. Further, the MCGM vide its letter dated

*Ref*



- 15.1.2013 submitted the detailed technical scrutiny from regulation point of view and In principal approval from Municipal Commissioner.
3. Accordingly, the proponent has approval of the Municipal Commissioner to the said proposal under D.C. Regn 33(7) of DCR 1991. Further, the IOD dated 11.6.2013 issued by the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai has been submitted.
  4. As per remark of MCGM dated 31.8.2012, the plot under reference is in residential zone with shop line facing JagannathShankarsheth Road and not reserved for any public purpose as per DP of 1967 as well as Revised DP of 1993.
  5. The CZMP of Mumbai (scale 1:25000) and as per MCGM letter dated 2.3.2012 shows that the plots under reference partly falls in CRZ II & partly in Non-CRZ and situated on the landward side of existing road.
  6. The CRZ map ( scale 1:4000) prepared by the IRS Chennai shows the plots under reference partly falls in CRZ II && partly in Non-CRZ and situated on the landward side of road.
  7. The Brihan Mumbai Mahanagarपालिका vide its letter dated 25.5.2007 mentions the property bearing C-ward No. C-4258-59 situated at 345-49, JagannathShankarsheth Road is assessed for repair-cess under the category "A".
  8. As per remark of MCGM dated 31.8.2012, the existing Cessed buildings are located partly in CRZ- II and partly in non CRZ.
  9. As per remark of MCGM dated 31.8.2012, the existing use of the old building is residential and commercial.
  10. As per remark of MCGM dated 31.8.2012, on C.S. No. 2085 on Ground + 4 story 'A' category Cessed building with existing built up area adm. 1581.32 sq.m and on C.S. No. 2086 another 'A' category Cessed building of Ground + 3 upper floors with existing built up area 1161.77 sq.m The existing FSI consumed is 2.64.
  11. As per MCGM letter dated 15.1.2013,
    - a) The CRZ II line is passing through the existing 'A' category cessed structures.
    - b) For CRZ affected portion of the plot, FSI required for rehab portion in CRZ part of existing building + 60% incentive FSI is permissible as per DCR 33(7) dated 25.1.1999 according to CRZ Notification, 2011.
    - c) For non-CRZ portion, FSI required for rehab portion in non CRZ par of existing building + 60% incentive FSI plus rehab area exceeding 70 sq.mtr. carper area is permissible as per DCR dated 21.5.2011 as two plots of 'A' category css are being redeveloped together as per DCR 33(7).
    - d) The proposed building is beyond the CRZ affected line,
    - e) The proposal envisages utilization of admissible potential of CRZ-II area of the plot, on non CRZ of the plot. The FSI potential of CRZ portion of the plot is restricted as per DCR in force as on 6.1.2011 and no fungible compensatory FSI is claimed on the FSI potential of CRZ -II portion.
    - f) Proposed building comprises of Basement for water tank + ground + 2 upper floors for existing non-residential use + 3 to 7<sup>th</sup> upper floor for parking + 8<sup>th</sup> service floor + 9<sup>th</sup> to 36<sup>th</sup> upper floors for existing non residential use & residential use of existing tenants as well as sale purposes including society office and refuge areas and fitness center. A fire check floor is proposed at 22<sup>nd</sup> floor.
    - g) Plot area details as per the MCGM-
      - a) Total area of the plot = 1038.56 sqm  
(C.S. No. 2085 = 545.25 Sqm & C.S. No. 2086 = 493.31 sqm)
      - b) Plot Area falls under CRZ = 107.78 sqm

*Ref*



- c) Plot Area falls under non CRZ = 930.78 sqm
- h) Permissible area details as per the MCGM-
- a) CRZ portion of plot -
    - FSI required for rehab portion in CRZ part of existing building + 60% incentive FSI - 165.77 Sq.m
    - BUA equivalent to 25% of setback land (148.46 X 25%) = 37.11 Sq.m
  - b) Non CRZ portion of plot -
    - FSI required for rehab portion in non CRZ part of existing building + 60% incentive FSI + Rehab area exceeding 70 Sq.mtr carpet area - 4617.25 Sq.mtr.
  - c) The fungible BUA - 1345.77 Sq.m (Fungible compensatory FSI is permissible on the FSI potential of non CRZ portion of the plot only)
- i) Proposed Built up area details as per MCGM-
- a) Proposed BUA - 4820.13 sq.m.
  - b) Total proposed BUA (including fungible BUA) - 6165.90 Sq.m
12. The MHADA has granted revised No Objection Certificate vide its letter dated 30.12.2011 for redevelopment of captioned property with FSI 2.5 or rehab + FSI required for rehabilitation of existing occupiers plus 60 % incentive, whichever is higher.
13. As per CRZ Notification, 2011, the public hearing was conducted on 27.6.2012 as per procedure laid down under EIA Notification. Proceedings of public hearing have been submitted.
- As per Public Consultation report:
- Present Status- The redevelopment work is yet to start on site. But buildings are partly demolished as it was declared by BMC that the structure is unsafe to stay.
  - Allotted 4.25 FSI - Number of tenants of the project are 44. Based on minimum area calculation & regulation of MHADA, 4.25 FSI is admissible to the said redevelopment
  - Solar Energy - Use of Solar energy for water heating purpose.
  - Provision of STP - Proposed GREY Water Treatment Plant for treatment of kitchen waste water. Remaining domestic waste water will be connected to MCGM sewer.
  - Provisions of MSW treatment plant - Plot is very small & there is space constraint to install MSW treatment plant.
  - Project comes in CRZ-II & redevelopment is permissible subject to abatement of pollution load imparted to the area. So it is necessary to install MSW treatment plant. Space required for installation of Mechanical composters will be very small like dust bins - PP will think on it.

The Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions-

1. No construction should be undertaken in CRZ portion of the plot area.
2. Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai should ensure that the construction should not be undertaken in CRZ area.
3. The FSI of CRZ portion of the plot is allowed to utilize as per DCR existing as on 6.1.2011 on the Non CRZ portion of the same plot.
4. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.



**Item No. 12: Proposed redevelopment under 33(6) of D.C.R.1991 on plot bearing C.S.No. 1A/698 of Malbar Hill Dn. At Desai Road in D Ward Mumbai**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. The Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM) has forwarded the proposal of "Proposed redevelopment under 33(6) of DCR 1991 on plot bearing C.S.No. 1A/698 of Malabar Hill Division, at Bhulabai Desai Road, in D ward, Mumbai" vide letter dated 18.6.2012 to MCZMA. The proposal was forwarded to Urban Development Department with a request to offer its comment on permissible FSI, land use, height, use and land reservation etc. Accordingly, the Urban Development Department sent the file back with some queries and mentioned that proposal has no prior in-principal approval of Municipal Commissioner, MCGM. It is requisite that the proposal needs to have in principal approval of MC, MCGM. On receipt of in-principal approval from Municipal Commissioner, MCGM on the proposal, the remarks from UDD will be provided.
2. The MCZMA, in 78<sup>th</sup> meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2012, under Item No. 5, took a policy decision, wherein it was decided that the proposals for CRZ recommendations should come before the MCZMA only after obtaining the Intimation of Disapproval (IOD) by the Project Proponent from the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.
3. The proponent has submitted IOD dated 11.7.2013 issued by the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai.
4. The proposal details are as follows-
  - a) Project category  
Redevelopment of Dilapidated building under 33(6) of DCR 1991 as per para 8.V (c) of CRZ Notification, 2011
  - b) DP remarks of the plot  
As per DP remarks of MCGM dated 1.11.2011, the plot bearing C.S.No. 1A/698 of Malabar Hill division is in Residential Zone.
  - c) CRZ status of plot  
As per the CZMP approved by MoEF in 2000; the plot under reference falls in CRZ II and situated on landward side of existing 90 feet wide Bhulabai Desai road
  - d) Existing structure on land  
The MCGM remarks dated 18.6.2012 indicates that existing building prior to 1957. Copy of 4<sup>th</sup> edition C.S. Plan has been submitted.
  - e) Existing building declared as Dilapidated  
MCGM remarks dated 18.6.2012 mentioned that there are two notices issued to the owner of the property dated 15.4.2010 and 27.12.2010 by A.E. ( B & F ) D- Ward informing that the building under reference is in dangerous and dilapidated condition. Further, notices u/s 354 of MMC Act was issued to pull down the dangerous buildings. The copies of the letter dated



15.4.201 & 2.12.2010 have been submitted. Copy of pull down notice dated 21.2.2012 sent by MCGM has been submitted.

Public hearing report dated 29.8.2012; mentioned that existing building was demolished because it was in very dangerous condition, after obtaining permission from BMC.

f) Proposed structure

- As per MCGM letter dated 30.1.2013; the architect has proposed to construct a residential building of 2 level Basement + Stilt of greater height ie. 7.20 m + Mezzanine floor + 8 Nos of parking level + service floor + 1<sup>st</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> upper floors for residential purpose and 70.00 m check floor with total height of building 120.85 m upto terrace level.  
( The MCGM letter dated 18.5.2013 indicates that ; Municipal Commissioner, MCGM has approval for “ to accord in principal approval for the proposed building having height of 120.85 m and to allow to issue approval upto 70.00 m and to issue approval and CC for full height after submission of NoC from High Rise Committee” )
- Earlier MCGM forwarded the proposal vide letter dated 30.1.2013 mentioning that ; the Architect has proposed residential building comprising of 2 level Basement + stilt + 8 podium levels + Service level + 20 upper floors with total height of 130.00 mt. The use of the proposed building is Residential.

g) FSI Details

As per MCGM letter dated 18.6.2012-

- Plot Area- 2075.88 sqm
  - Permissible FSI for proposal under 33(6) is existing built up area OR permissible zonal FSI whichever is higher.
  - Existing built up area to be protected- 3577.54 Sqm
  - Total permissible built up area- 3577.54 Sqm
  - Non FSI area ( Such as staircase, lift, lift lobby balcony, 10% passages, niches, flower bed, podium, basement, service etc.- 14485.61 Sqm
  - Total construction Area- 18063.15 Sqm
- As per the plans dated 11.7.2013 submitted along with IOD –

- |  |              |
|--|--------------|
| • Area of plot-  | 2075.88 Sqm  |
| • Setback area-  | 107.46 Sqm   |
| • Net area of Plot-  | 1968.42 Sqm  |
| • Total permissible floor area-  | 3577.54 Sqm  |
| • Proposed built up area-  | 3439.54 Sqm  |
| • Balance area kept in abeyance till the clearance from Highrise committee for height more than 70 m | 1570.08.Sqm. |

h) Municipal Commissioner Approval

The MCGM letter dated 18.5.2013 indicates that ; Municipal Commissioner, MCGM has approval for “ to accord in principal approval for the proposed building having height of 120.85 m and to allow to issue approval upto 70.00 m and to issue approval and CC for full height after submission of NoC from High Rise Committee”



i) IOD issued on 11.7.2013 by MCGM

IOD was issued on 11.7.2013 by the MCGM. The lay out plan attached with IOD is for basement + stilt + mezzanine + 8 podium level + service level + fire check floor + 10 upper floors.

j) Public hearing report submitted

The public hearing was conducted on 29.8.2012. The MPCB forwarded the minutes of public hearing on 27.11.2012. Necessary measures to avoid the air & noise pollution in the nearby vicinity would be taken.

The Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. Reconstruction of authorized building to be permitted subject with the existing Floor Space Index or Floor Area Ratio Norms and without change in present use.
3. The concerned planning authority should ensure that there is no change of present use for the proposed redevelopment of existing authorized building.
4. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, lay out plan, height involved in the proposal is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 6.1.2011
5. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, non FSI area and FSI concessions granted by Municipal Commissioner is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 6.1.2011
6. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No. 13:**

**CRZ Clearance for the proposed Modernization of existing Unit # 6 by change of fuel from oil to coal at Trombay Thermal Power Station by M/s. Tata Power Company Limited, Mumbai**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. The Trombay Thermal Power Station (TTPS) of M/s. Tata Power Company Limited is operational since 1956 with the installed capacity of 1580 MW having its Unit # 4, Unit # 5, Unit # 6, Unit # 7 and Unit # 8. These units are operated on Coal, Oil and Gas as fuel. The Unit #6 (500 MW) is experiencing serious shortage of natural gas supply for its operation. Though there are no constraints in the availability of oil, LSHS/LSFO of desired sulphur content is not available locally in adequate quantity to meet environment norms. The same has to be imported at very high cost resulting in uneconomical generation cost of Unit #6. Modernization of Unit #6 at TTPS to facilitate coal firing is essential to meet the growing demand of power at reasonable cost to consumers.





2. Two coal conveyers are proposed from captive coal berth to the Unit #6 for feeding the coal from the west side of the power plant. The coal conveyer will be partially of belt type with proper covering arrangement. All existing system of captive coal berth will be utilized during the proposed modernization and there is no anticipation of any additional construction except installation of equipments for coal unloading such as additional coal unloader of 1500 TPH for enhancing coal unloading capacity, stacker reclaimer and conveying system.
3. The CRZ mapping has been carried out by CESS, Thiruvananthapuram for proposed modernization project. Existing Unit # 6 is out of CRZ but the coal berth and related activities falls in CRZ-II area

It was noted the MCZMA wrote a letter dated 28.5.2013 seeking certain information from M/s. Tata Power Company Limited. Accordingly, M/s. Tata Power Company Limited submitted its point wise reply vide letter dated 4.7.2013, which was discussed and taken on record.

- A. A report of Environment Impact Assessment from reputed third party agency as authorized by MoEF. The EIA report is prepared by the same agency belonging to Tata Group of companies, which indicates in-house preparation of EIA. The EIA prepared by Third agency is required.

Tata Power had received ToR for the proposed modernization of Unit # 6 by change of fuel in the month of January 2012 from MoEF. After grant of ToR, Tata Power carried out EIA studies through Tata Consulting Engineers Limited (TCE) for the period from March 2012 to May 2012. TCE is an independent company of Tata Group which is an accredited Consulting Organization by National Accreditation Board for Education and Training (NABET - a wing of Quality Council of India) as a consultant for conducting EIA studies. This is as per the requirement of MoEF. TCE is working with several private as well as government organization for conducting EIA studies. The Marine Impact Assessment has been carried out by Central Marine Fisheries Research Institute (CMFRI), established by Government of India, which an expert body in the field of marine impact assessment. Also TCE had engaged MoEF accredited laboratory for carrying out air, water and soil quality monitoring during the EIA study period. The EIA report has been carried out in accordance with EIA Notification 2006 and through an accredited consulting organization and not necessary to carry out the EIA report by third party.

- B. A report of Public Hearing conducted by MPCB on basis of Point No.1

After the completion of EIA studies as per ToR prescribed by MoEF, Tata Power submitted Draft EIA study report to MPCB for conduct of Public Hearing. Accordingly, Public Hearing for the proposed modernization of Unit # 6 by change of fuel was conducted at RCF Krida Kendra, Near Ashish Theatre, Chembur by MPCB on 15<sup>th</sup> January 2013 as per the procedure laid down in the EIA Notification 2006 and its subsequent amendment from time to time. The proceedings of Public Hearing have already been forwarded by MPCB to MoEF for consideration of Environment Clearance.

- C. Whether additional coal handling system will be installed? (Crushing of Coal, Screening of Coal, etc.)



Trombay Thermal Power Station has a Captive Coal Berth for handling coal required for Unit # 5 and Unit # 8. Same Captive Coal Berth will be augmented by addition of coal handling equipments like Stacker Reclaimer, Screw Unloader, Coal Conveyor upto Unit # 6 etc for handling coal required for Unit # 6 coal conversion project. There will not be increase in the length of the existing coal berth after the augmentation. Coal mills will be installed for crushing of coal.

- D. Whether additional water consumption & effluent generation (Domestic & Industrial) will be involved? Whether New STP will be required?

Unit # 6 is running since 1990 hence no additional water allocation is envisaged after coal conversion project. Also no additional effluent will be generated after proposed modernization of Unit # 6 project. The water consumption and effluent generation will be as per the limits stipulated in existing Consent to Operate granted by MPCB. TTPS has already set up two STP of 125 m<sup>3</sup>/day capacity each for treatment of domestic waste water. No additional STP is envisaged.

- E. Whether space is available for installation of Flue Gas Desulphurization?

Space provision has been made in the existing premises for setting up of Flue Gas Desulphurisation Plant for Unit # 6.

- F. Percentage of Ash content and sulphur content in the imported coal

Imported coal will have maximum 5% ash and 0.28% sulphur.

- G. Purpose of displacing the Mangrove forest

FGD is proposed for Unit # 6 as a part of pollution control measures to control SO<sub>2</sub> emission. This FGD will be using sea water and same after the treatment will be discharged in the existing cooling water channel. Area of 50X40m (0.2 ha. within existing land) will be required for the construction of outfall point in the existing cooling water discharge channel.

Sea water after passing through condenser gets cooled in cooling channel and conforms to the norms prescribed by MPCB. The channel has a total length of 1.2km, out of which 251m is within plant area with channel width of 90m. Width of cooling channel reduced because of growth of mangroves which has reduced the width of the channel in plant area to 25m as compared to earlier of 90 m and needs to be restored back. It is now proposed to remove mangroves present in the discharge channel within plant area so as to get sufficient area for cooling of sea water. Area of 0.7177 ha. will be required to be made free of mangroves from the discharge channel which will help in better cooling of sea water before discharging to sea. It is estimated that around 520 mangroves will be required to be shifted from the discharge channel.

H. Details of Brick Manufacturing in CRZ area

A brick making unit is proposed in CRZ area towards the south side boundary wall of TTPS. The bricks will be prepared by using bottom ash. It is estimated that around 10000 bricks will be prepared per day by using bottom ash. This will help in 100% utilization of bottom ash as per the fly ash notification.

I. Compliance of Fly ash notification

Trombay Thermal Power Station has achieving 100% fly ash utilization every year as per the fly ash notification.

J. Existing pollution load and pollution load after modernization

The air quality modeling has been carried out using ISCST 3 model. Existing pollution load and pollution load after Unit # 6 modernizations by coal conversion is tabulated below:

Particulars	SO <sub>2</sub> (µg/m <sup>3</sup> )	NOx (µg/m <sup>3</sup> )	PM (µg/m <sup>3</sup> )
Scenario 1: Existing Operations on oil	3.91	4.58	2.24
Scenario 2: After modernization on coal	3.85	4.43	1.94
Change	-0.06	-0.15	-0.3
Change %	-1.5	-3.3	-13.4

Pollution load after the proposed modernization of Unit # 6 by change of fuel is going to reduce due to installation of pollution control equipments like ESP and FGD. The worst case maximum GLC is observed at 4.5 KM in SE direction (in sea) from the TTPS.

K. Prior approval under the Water (Prevention & Control of Pollution) Act, 1974 is required for discharge of effluent

Tata Power has already applied for Consent to Establish for the proposed modernization project to MPCB on 20<sup>th</sup> February 2013. The application is under process with MPCB.

L. EMP to reduce CO<sub>2</sub> gas emission

As a responsible member of the society, Tata Power is committed to the cause of climate change and has been taking significant efforts in the field of climate change. Tata Power is committed to tackling the issues of climate changes by adopting sustainable and responsible growth. As a strategy Tata Power has decided that about 20-25% of its generating capacity will be from non-carbon emitting/renewable sources like wind, solar, hydro etc. They are calculating CO<sub>2</sub> emission across Tata Power & reporting to CDP, UK. Tata Power will continue to report to CDP, UK as well maintain strategic intent to generate 20-25% generating capacity from non-carbon emitting sources.



M. Alternate technology, if any, studied for CO<sub>2</sub> gas minimization

Unit # 6 is already running since 1990. As the project is of modernization and hence no alternate technology is studied for CO<sub>2</sub> minimization. As mentioned above, Tata Power will maintain strategic intent to generate 20-25% generation capacity from non-carbon emitting sources. This will help in minimizing CO<sub>2</sub> emission.

N. Mangrove re-plantation plan

An area of 25 Ha. has been identified in the Village Sarsole in Navi Mumbai area for re-plantation of mangroves along with the Forest Department. A tripartite agreement will be executed along with Forest Department and M S Swaminathan Foundation (an NGO expert in mangrove plantation) for the carrying out mangrove plantation at the identified area. The application has already been filled and is under process with the Forest Department, Government of Maharashtra.

It was noted that M/s. Tata Power Company Limited vide letter dated 31.7.2013, submitted report prepared by NEERI on the EIA report of Tata Consulting Engineers Limited (TCE).

Proponent presented that a brick making unit is proposed in CRZ area towards the south side boundary wall of TTPS. The bricks will be prepared by using bottom ash of the TTPS.. The Authority suggested proponent to propose a brick manufacturing unit in Non CRZ area, as CRZ Notification, 2011 prohibits setting up new or expansion of the industries in CRZ areas.

Further, the Proponent presented that the mangroves vegetation is present along the outfall channel for effluent discharge. Due to presence of mangroves and siltation in the channel, cooling of discharge water is hampering due to reduction in the area. Hence, removal of mangroves from the coolingchannel is proposed.

The Authority discussed the issue of removal of mangroves and suggested that project proponent should consult Hydraulic Engineer for removing siltation through streamlining the flow without disturbing mangrove vegetation so that the silt is removed and the free flow of effluent through outfall discharge channel is ensured for adequate cooling.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to direct the proponent to explore other alternatives and designs for removal of siltation in the outfall channel so as to avoid destruction of mangroves and directed to submit a revised proposal. Authority further observed that brick manufacturing unit be located in non CRZ area and untreated effluent from FGD and other sources shall not be discharged in CRZ area.

**Item No. 14:** Development of all – weather multi cargo port in a green field site at village Nandgaon, Dist – Thane by JSW Port Limited

Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. M/s JSW Infrastructure Ltd. has proposed to develop an All-weather Multi-cargo Greenfield Port at village Nandgaon Taluk; Palghar, Dist. Thane in the state of Maharashtra.



2. The proposed Nandgaon Port would cater to the local demands of the MIDC as well as the national demand of the Container traffic, since the JNPT port is not able to meet the demand. The traffic of containers would be further strengthened once the Dedicated Freight Corridor is operational. The proposed port is expected to handle about 17.35 million tonnes of cargo in the year 2017 rising to about 28.72 million tonnes in year 2020. The cargo to be handled in the first phase would mainly consist of solid cargo such as Coal, Coking Coal, Fertilizer, Cement and clinker, Iron and Steel Containers, Automobiles, Miscellaneous cargo such as Food Grains Sulphur, Sugar, Pulp, Newsprint, scrap and Liquid cargo such as LNG, Chemicals and POL. Therefore, 6 berths for solid cargo handling is proposed during Phase-I, with a total continuous quay length of about 1500 m. In addition there would be a dedicated berth for Coal, LNG and 3 berths for chemicals and other liquid cargo.
3. Alternative sites were examined along the coastline spanning between the Mumbai region and the Maharashtra-Gujarat border. After rigorous multi-criteria analysis site at Nandgaon, in the vicinity of the Tarapore Industrial Area was selected. The proposed Nandgaon Port is envisioned to act as an alternative to the existing ports in the Mumbai region. The location is 110 km south of Mumbai, and is about 8 km from the Boisar railway station and 23 km from the National Highway number 8. The approximate geographical co-ordinate of the Port lies between Lat. 19° 45' 44" and 19° 47' 03" N and Long. 72° 41' 10" E. The port will be designed to handle Panamax sized vessels in the first phase and cape size carriers in the final phase. The Port will have two breakwaters protecting the berths and offer tranquility inside the Port. The first phase channel will have a navigable depth of around 15 m which would be increased to 19.8 m in the final phase. The handling equipment's would be fully or semi-mechanized equipped to prevent pollution while achieving high degree of efficiency. The first phase of the port would be developed at a cost of about 3400 crores.
4. The ToR was awarded to the proposed port project by EAC of MoEF in its 108<sup>th</sup> meeting dated 10<sup>th</sup> January 2012. Public hearing for the project is completed by the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board (MPCB).
5. CRZ Details:
  - As per Form- I submitted by Project Proponent, the Project area comes under CRZ- I (B) and CRZ – III.
  - As per the CRZ demarcation carried out by IRS, Chennai, the LNG Jetty, Pol jetty, Tankage area comes under CRZ- IV area and remaining allied activities falls in CRZ- I (B) and CRZ – III.

The Authority took on record the letter dated 3.10.2012 forwarded by the Commissioner, Fisheries Dept mentioning that Maharashtra Machchimar KrutiSamiti has objection for proposed commercial harbor by M.J.S.W. infrastructure Ltd, Mumbai at Nandgoan via Boisar, Tal- Palghar, Dist- Thane. Further, it was requested not to grant permission without hearing to the fisheries Department.

Taking cognizance of the objections raised by the Fisherman Communities; the Authority decided to direct the project proponent to submit the NoC of the fisheries Department and revert.

It was further decided that while deciding the proposal, Commissioner, Fisheries department would be called for the meeting for hearing and consultation.



**Item No. 15:** The proposed project admeasuring about 38920.00 sq.m plot area located onplot no bearing old S.No. 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 75/5,75/6, 75/7, 75/8, 80/1, 82, 81/3, 83/1/1, 83/1/2, 83/1/3(pt), 83/1/3(pt), 83/2,83/3(pt), 83/3(pt). New S.No. 150/17A, 150/17B, 150/17C, 150/17D, 152/5,152/6, 152/7, 152/8, 157/1, 159, 158/3, 160/1A, 160/1B, 160/1C, 160/1D,160/2, 160/3B, 160/3C. At Village Balkum, Tal & District Thane by M/s. Siddhi Krish Developers.

1. The Authority noted that earlier the proposal was discussed in 79th and 81st meeting of the Authority held on 5.1.2013 & 26.4.2013 respectively.

Description	Details
Type of project	Residential Cum Commercial Project
Location of project site	Village – Balkum, Taluka& Dist. Thane.
Total plot area	38920 sq.m
RG provided	11551sq.m
Building details	Total 8 buildings, out of which 2 buildings have configuration (Gr+st+pod+20 flrs) and 5 buildings have configuration of (st+pod+19 flrs). And 1 bldg have configuration of (st+pod+18 flrs).

2. In 79<sup>th</sup> meeting, the Authority noted the proposal details which is as follows-  
**FSI & Non FSI**

S.N	FSI & Non FSI	Area (sqm)
	<b>FSI Area</b>	<b>32813.49</b>
1	Excess Balcony	77.42
2	Built Up Area	31972.23
3	Commercial Area	451.04
4	15% Club House Area	312.80
	<b>Non FSI</b>	
5	Stilt	1505.19
6	Staircase & Passage	10982.06
7	Lift	767.65
8	10% Balcony	3197.29
9	C.B Area	882.09
10	Refuge Area	1250.70
11	Club House	650.32
12	Podium	13496.21
13	Temporary Structure	600
14	Total	33331.51
15	<b>Total Construction Area</b>	<b>66145.00</b>

*Ref*



**Area Statement**

	<b>A</b>	<b>Area Statement</b>	<b>Sq.m.</b>
		Area of Plot (As per 7/12 Extract)	38920.00
		Area of Plot (As per Triangulation Method)	39618.39
1		Area of Plot Consider for FSI	38895.51
2		Deductions For	
	a	15.00 m wide D.P Road (North+South)	905.24
	b	20.00 m wide D.P Road (East+West)	1178.35
	c	20.00 m wide D.P Road (North+South)	1115.26
	d	15.00 m wide D.P Road (North+South)	2490.90
	e	20.00 m wide D.P Road (North+South)	2115.87
	f	Area under MH Reservation	2358.02
	g	Area under Garden Reservation	1402.38
	h	Area under Shopping Center	4.54
	i	Area under M.R.T.S	2121.92
	j	Area under CRZ-II (Under R- Zone)	4935.66
	k	Plot B (24.32 sq.mt.)+ (328.90 sq.mt)	353.22
	l	Area under subplot – C (V.P.No. S05/0054/12)	1310.81
3		Net Gross Area of Plot(1-2)	18603.34
4		Recreation Ground As Per Regulation 58	2790.50
5		Balance Area of Plot (3-4)	15812.84
6		Addition for FAR (Total Built Up Area) Purpose	
	a	Area under CRZ II	3701.74
7		Addition For	
	a	15.00 m wide DP road (under R-Zone)	905.24
	b	20.00 m wide DP road (under R-Zone)	1178.35
	c	20.00 m wide DP road (under CRZ)	1115.26
	d	15.00 m wide DP road (under CRZ)	2490.90
	e	20.00 m wide DP road	2115.87
	f	Area under MH Reservation	2358.02
	g	Area under Garden Reservation	1402.38
	h	Area under Shopping Center	4.54
	i	Area under MRTS	2121.92



j	Permissible 80% TDR of Net Plot Area Total TDR Generated in own plot = 13692.48 sq.mt. Balance TDR = 1190.19 sq.mt.	
	Total (a to j)	13692.48
8	Total Area (5+6c+7j)	33207.06
9	FAR Permissible as per Appendix B Total Built Up Area+ Area permissible Max. Ground Coverage x max no of storages	1.00
10	Permissible Total Floor Area	33207.06
11	Proposed Area	32813.49
12	Total Built Up Area Consumed (B/7)	0.988

3. In 79<sup>th</sup> meeting, the Authority decided to direct the project proponent to submit the following information to the Authority -

- Details of designated reservations, as per development plan/ regional plan as on 19.02.1991 and as per current prevailing development plan of the area.
- Details of construction of Old S.No.80/2, & New S. No. 150/16A, 150/17B, 150/17C, 150/17D, 152/5, 6, 7, 8, 157/1, 2, 3, 159
- Verification of exact total plot area and plot area falls in CRZ (survey No wise).
- Zoning, reservation on CRZ land as per DCR as on 19.02.1991.
- Details of proposed construction in CRZ.
- Permissibility of the Height as per DCR enforce as on 19.02.1991 and as per current prevailing DCR.
- Permissible FSI in CRZ as per DCR as on 19.02.1991.

4. The Project Proponent vide letter dated 28.3.2013 has submitted details/ compliance, which was discussed in 81<sup>st</sup> meeting. The reply was as follows-

- Details of designated reservations, as per development plan/ regional plan as on 19.02.1991 and as per current prevailing development plan of the area.

The list of designated reservation, which is affected by CRZ belt with area, is as follows:

As per development plan as on **19.02.1991**

SR NO	TYPE OF RESERVATION	AREA UNDER RESERVATION AND AFFECTED BY CRZ II BELT
1	NONE	NONE

As per current development plan

SR NO	TYPE OF RESERVATION	AREA UNDER RESERVATION AND AFFECTED BY CRZ II BELT (SQ.MTR)
1.	ROAD	3606.16

*Ref*



2.	SHOPPING CENTER	4.54
3.	GARDEN	1402.38
4.	MATERNITY HOME	2358.02
5.	MRTS	1989.82

- Details of construction of new Survey. No. 150/17B, 150/17C, 150/17D, 152/5, 6, 7, 8, 157/1, 159 are as under.

1	150/17B	NOT IN CRZ II , PARTLY IN 20.00 M ROAD and NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
2	150/17C	NOT IN CRZ II , PARTLY IN 20.00 M ROAD and NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
3	150/17D	NOT IN CRZ II, PARTLY IN 20.00 M ROAD and NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
4	75/5	NOT IN CRZ II AND CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
5	75/7	NOT IN CRZ II AND CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
6	75/6	PARTLY R ZONE PARTLY IN 15.00M ROAD PARTLY IN SHOPPING CENTER RESERVATION & PARTLY CRZ II BUT CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED ONLY IN NON CRZ R-ZONE AREA AND NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED IN CRZ II AREA
7	75/8	PARTLY R ZONE PARTLY CRZ II BUT CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED ONLY IN NON CRZ R-ZONE AREA AND NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED IN CRZ II AREA
8	157/1	PARTLY IN M.H. RESERVATION, PARTLY IN GARDEN RESERVATION, PARTLY IN 20 M AND 15 M ROAD AND PARTLY IN CRZ BUT NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED
9	159	PARTLY R ZONE PARTLY CRZ II BUT CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED ONLY IN NON CRZ R-ZONE AREA AND NO CONSTRUCTION PROPOSED IN CRZ II AREA

Please note that we are not proposing anything in CRZ II but construction is proposed only in NON CRZ II R-ZONE area and no construction is proposed in CRZ II AREA but using FSI of CRZ belt in the NON CRZ AREAS. More so as on 19/02/1991 FSI Permissible in "R" ZONE was 1.00 and plans are proposed accordingly.

- Verification of exact total plot area and plot area falls in CRZ II but construction proposed only in non CRZ R-ZONE area and no construction is proposed in CRZ II area (survey No wise). Below is the table:

SR NO	OLD S. NO.	NEW S. NO.	AREA NON CRZ sq.m	AREA CRZ II sq.m.	TOTAL Sq.m.
1.	73/17(P.T)	150/17 A,B,C,D	2090		2090.00

*Signature*



2.	75/5	152/5	3260.00		3260.00
3.	75/6	152/6	382.83	2347.17	2730.00
4.	75/7	152/7	1900.00		1900.00
5.	75/8	152/8	1536.42	1063.58	2600.00
6.	80/1	157/1		7690.00	7690.00
7.	82	159	6127.72	1557.79	7685.51
8.	81/3	158/3	225.81	1564.19	1790.00
9.	83/1/1	160/1A	830.00		830.00
10.	83/1/2	160/1B	1370.00		1370.00
11.	83/1/3(pt)	160/1C	1570.00		1570.00
12.	83/1/3(pt)	160/1D	3090.00		3090.00
13.	83/2	160/2	880.00		880.00
14.	83/3(pt)	160/3B	680.00		680.00
15.	83/3(pt)	160/3C	720.25	9.75	730.00
TOTAL AREA			24663.03	14232.48	38895.51

- Zoning, reservation on CRZ II land as per DCR as on 19.02.1991

All survey nos. of our proposal on CRZ II land currently were in R-Zone as per MMRDA plan in force as on 19.02.1991 and permissible FSI was 1.00 as per D.C.Rules in force as on 19/02/1991.

- Details of proposed construction in CRZ II

The subject plot is partly affected by CRZ II & non CRZ also. The CRZ II affected area is left without any construction thereon. The FSI of the CRZ II affected plot is consumed in the development on Non-CRZ affected part of the plot.

- Permissibility of the height as per DCR enforce as on 19.02.1991 and as per current prevailing DCR

As there is no construction is proposed in CRZ II area and only FSI is proposed to be consumed in the Non-CRZ area, the height permissibility as per DCRs in force as on 19.02.1991 will not be applicable in the instant case.

In non CRZ areas, the building is proposed as per DCRs in force as on today.

- Permissible FSI in CRZ II as per DCR as on 19.02.1991

The permissible FSI in CRZ II for Residential zone is 1 as per clause no 12 Table below and clause 12 (b) of DCR in force as on 19/02/1991 (i.e. DCR of 1974).

It may be further mentioned that Thane Municipal Corporation has approved plan by using FSI of CRZ land in non- CRZ portion vide V.P.No. S/05/0040/11 dated: 06/02/2013.

*xy*



In the 81<sup>st</sup> meeting, the Authority after deliberations decided to get the information from the Thane Municipal Corporation regarding the reservation / zoning as on 19.2.1991 of the CRZ portion of land.

The Thane Municipal Corporation forwarded reply vide letter dated 2.7.2013. said letter dated 2.7.2013 mentions, as per Thane Industrial complex Plan sanctioned on 1973 which is part of Mumbai Mahanagar Regional Plan on 19.2.1991, the plots bearing Old S.No. 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 73/17 (pt), 75/5, 75/6, 75/7, 75/8, 80/1, 82, 81/3, 83/1/1, 83/1/2, 83/1/3(pt), 83/1/3(pt), 83/2, 83/3(pt), 83/3(pt). New S.No.150/17A, 150/17B, 150/17C, 150/17D, 152/5, 152/6, 152/7, 152/8, 157/1, 159, 158/3, 160/1A, 160/1B, 160/1C, 160/1D, 160/2, 160/3B, 160/3C. At Village Balkum, Tal & District Thane falls in Residential Zone.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA / Thane Municipal Corporation from CRZ point of view subject to following conditions-

- a) No construction should be undertaken in CRZ portion of the plot area.
- b) Thane Municipal Corporation should ensure that the construction should not be undertaken in CRZ area.
- c) The FSI of CRZ portion of the plot is allowed to utilize as per DCR existing as on 19.2.1991 on the Non CRZ portion of the same plot.
- d) All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No. 16:                      Revalidation of Environmental and CRZ clearance earlier accorded for the development of Multipurpose Port at Rewas, Raigad by M/s. Rewas Port Ltd**

The Authority noted the background of the proposal which is as follows-

- The Ministry of Environment and Forests (MoEF), New Delhi was granted the Environmental clearance (EC) under the EIA Notification 2006 and CRZ Notification 1991 for the construction of Multipurpose Port at Rewas, Raigad, vide letter dated 3.5.2007 and corrigendum issued vide letter dated 8.6.2007.
- The said Environmental Clearance was valid for a period of 5 years. i.e. till 2.5.2012.
- The proposal for revalidation of EC was submitted by the Rewas Port Limited to the MoEF in 2011 and it has been deliberated in Expert Appraisal Committee meetings held on 5th – 7th March, 2012 and 19th – 21st September, 2012.
- The MoEF vide letter dated 17.4.2013 requested the MCZMA to examine the proposal for extension of validity of Environmental Clearance and comments / recommendations in view of the CRZ Notification, 2011.
- The Rewas Port Limited vide letter dated 3.7.2013 mentions, the location of the project remains unchanged, whereas the scope of the project has reduced due to reduction in actual land area available. The project activities could not commence for various reasons beyond control and delay in handling over of the ITZ and Govt. land by GoM, procedural delay in obtaining various approvals, the EC was required to be revalidated.
- The comparison of the project facilities of Rewas Port with respect to CRZ Notification, 1991 and 2011 is as follows-



Activity	Planned in	CRZ Notification, 1991	CRZ Notification, 2011
Construction of Port complex – (Jetties, wharves, quays etc)	Intertidal land without mangroves	CRZ I (ii) area.	CRZ I (B) area.
Reclamation & bunding	Intertidal land without mangroves	Construction, modernisation or expansion of ports, harbours, jetties	Setting up, construction, modernisation or expansion of foreshore facilities like ports, harbours, jetties
Navigational Channel	27 km long beyond LTL, 300m wide to be dredged to 14.5	Water area beyond LTL was not covered	The water area from LTL up to 12 NM has been classified as CRZ IV

The Authority noted that MCZMA vide letter dated 4.1.2007 had recommended the project from CRZ Point of view to MOEF. Conditions of the recommendation letter were noted and discussed.

On inquiry, project proponent informed that there is no change of project profile to which, the MoEF, New Delhi granted the Environmental clearance (EC) vide letter dated 3.5.2007 and corrigendum issued vide letter dated 8.6.2007 to the project.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. Project profile should not be changed to which the MoEF, New Delhi granted the Environmental clearance (EC) vide letter dated 3.5.2007 and corrigendum issued vide letter dated 8.6.2007 to the project.
2. The port authorities will undertake coastal erosion control measures in consultation with concerned departments which shall be incorporated in Environment Management Plan
3. Proper back up area will be provided to ensure that congestion is minimized.
4. Proponent should have proper Environment Management Plan and specific financial budget should be allocated for protection of coastal zone
5. All Environment aspects will be covered.
6. Oil spill response plan shall be prepared.
7. Prior High Court permission should be obtained, if the project involves cutting of mangroves and development in 50 m mangroves buffer zone area.
8. All the conditions stipulated in Environment clearance granted by the MoEF earlier should be complied with. Treated or untreated sewage / effluent should not be discharged into the sea.
9. Solid Waste generated during the construction phase of the port should not be dumped in the CRZ area
10. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

*Ej*



**Item No. 17: CRZ categorization at village Awas, Tal/ Alibag, Dist. Raigad, Amit Narang**

Proponent was absent for the meeting. The Authority decided to defer the matter.

**Item No. 18: Expansion of Redi Port, Redi Village, Vengurla Taluk, Sindhudurg District, Maharashtra**

The Authority noted that earlier the proposal was deliberated in 78<sup>th</sup> and 81<sup>st</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 3<sup>rd</sup> November, 2012 and 11<sup>th</sup> February, 2013. The proposal details are as follows-

1. The existing port at Redi village is located along the Konkan Coast in Vengurla Taluka of Sindhudurg district, Maharashtra. The site lies 85 km north of Goa and 150 km south of Ratnagiri. The Site is about 2.5 nautical miles north of Goa border.
2. The Redi Port Limited proposed expansion of the existing Redi port. It is to be all weather multipurpose port.
3. An all-weather multipurpose port is proposed to be developed in an area of 98 ha (242 acres). Out of this 98 ha, 55.5 ha of land is planned to be reclaimed for the port development purpose. Remaining 42.5 ha resemble of an elevated highland falling under survey no. 15 and 58.
4. The expansion of Redi Port is proposed towards 2.0 km south of the existing port.
5. The proposed expansion development to consist of port buildings, cargo storage area, greenbelt and infrastructure facilities. The details of the project is-

Proposed land use Break up (Phase I & Phase II)

S. No.	Description	Area (ha)
1	Storage area	42.6
2	Buildings	7.0
3	Infrastructure	2.0
4	Green belt	13.0
5	Internal road corridor	10.0
6	Other area available for Port operations	23.4
Total		98.0

The salient features of Port Layout are-

Length of Northern Breakwater	Phase I – 0 m Phase II – 100 m	
Length of Northern Breakwater	Phase I – 860 m Phase II 1800 m	
	Phase I	Phase II
Rock Bund	2150 m	Phase I facility will suffice Phase II requirement.
Diameter of Turning Circle	460 m	
Depth of the Turning Circle (below CD)	(-) 14.5 m	
Number of Berths	2 Nos	3 Nos (Cumulative)
Depth of Berthing area	(-) 13.9 m	(-) 13.9 m
Dredging quantity	3.36 MCM	-



Reclamation quantity	5.5 MCM (0.93 MCM of dredged material and remaining will be sourced from borrow material.	
Dredge spoil disposal	2.43 MCM will be disposed at identified offshore dredge spoil disposal site located in (-) 25 m to (-) 30 m.	
Approach Channel		
Length	4565 m	Phase I facility will suffice Phase II requirement.
Width	165 m	
Depth	(-) 15.1 m	

Cargo Handling Capacity in MTPA-

Type of Cargo	Phase I	Phase II
Coal	2.40	7.50
Iron Ore	2.76	4.89
General Cargo	-	1.35
Total	5.16	13.74

6. The Authority noted the CRZ status of the land under reference-  
The project site falls partly in in CRZ –I (B) and CRZ –III and the facilities falls in CRZ –IV.  
As per report of the demarcation of HTL, LTL and delineation of CRZ boundaries are proposed expansion of Redi Port,
- The proposed land for development meets the CRZ –III criteria.
  - The proposed port area mostly falls in CRZ –I (ii) between LTL and HTL.
  - The proposed port location does not contain environmentally sensitive areas such as national parks / marine parks, sanctuaries, wildlife habitat, corals / coral reefs. It also does not include breeding and spawning grounds of fish and other marine life, area of outstanding natural beauty / historically / heritage area, area rich in genetic diversity except a small patch of mangroves in the tidal marsh area.
7. Based on the decision taken in 78<sup>th</sup> meeting, the proponent submitted a Compliance vide letter dated 31.1.2013.

a) Present status of erosion of site under reference-

- ICMAM and INCOS (2009) have carried out a study using the satellite imagery to report violation of land use along the CRZ and impact of port structure on shoreline along the Indian coast. The report has consolidated information on eroding stretches along the Indian coast based on information provided by State govt. For the Redi port side, No erosion was reported for Sindhudurg district of Maharashtra
- NIO (1997) based on their studies along the coastal stretch of Redi conducted that the coastal stretch of Redi has negligible long shore sediment movement.
- It can be concluded that the study regions including the proposed Redi Coastal Stretch has negligible long shore sediment movement.

b) Impact of erosion due to proposed port on surrounding area.

- The modeling software GENEIS is used to examine long term shoreline change due to the proposed breakwater. The shoreline study has been carried out for the existing scenario and for the scenario including the proposed development, for a period of 10 years.
- The simulated result shows an average accretion rate of 2.5 m/year and diminishes over 600 m to negligible level. The rate of accretion diminishes with passing years indicating that the shoreline is in the verge of stabilization. No significant erosion/ accretion in the coastal stretch towards north or south of proposed port except in the vicinity of the proposed port breakwater.

c) Seasonal sediment flow around the proposed port.

- The major geomorphologic features along the study stretch includes headland, bay, pocket beach, wave cut cliff, rock outcrop, offshore islands, submerged bedrock and gently rising low peaked hills. The coastal stretch of Redi has negligible long shore sediment movement.
- This was based on the water sample analysis around the Redi which indicated suspended sediment distribution at the surface ranging from 1.7 to 10.01 mg/l in the surface and 4.8 to 19.7 mg/l in the bottom. Since no new development activities have come up after the survey, it is presumed long shore sediment transport rate at the site has remained the same.
- The calculated annual net potential transport rate ( 0.502 Million cum / year ) is closely matching with value cited in the literature ( 0.529 million cum / year )

d) Coral reef study around the proposed site.

- The coral reefs along the Sindhudurg coast have been recorded at Vengurla Rock Island, Malvan and Angira Bank. Of these sites, corals are most abundant at Malvan and along a shallow sunken atoll on the continent shelf in the area called the Angira Bank. Eleven species of the corals have been reported. Corals are found attached on rocky substratum intertidal and sub-tidal regions. Angira Bank is a thriving coral habitat. The bottom is composed of sand, shells and coral.
- The Redi port is located at a distance of 25 km from Vengurla Rocks, 40 km from Malvan Sanctuary and 175 km from Angira Bank. It is evident that there is no presence of coral reefs near Redi port area.
- The marine environment survey was carried out in the coastal waters of Redi port expansion area in order to assess the existing status of marine environment. No coral reefs were found / recorded in any of sampling locations during marine environment analysis.
- The shallow seismic survey as well as Side Scan Sonar Survey was carried out and during the study no presence of coral reefs was found.

e) Impact of proposed port on surrounding fishing villages, fishing routes, local fishing activities.

- There are 8 fishing villages / fish landing centres in the study area of 10 km radius from port expansion area.



- No fishing activities are observed near coastal stretch identified for the port expansion. In the vicinity of proposed expansion area, fishing trawlers enter the sea through Keruvada creek, Terekhol River which are located > 3.0 km (along the coast) from the proposed expansion area. The movement / route being followed by the fishing trawlers / fish crafts are > 3km away from the port expansion area.
- In order to avoid any hindrance due to proposed construction and operation activities of port expansion, necessary marker buoys shall be installed around the operational areas. Interaction shall be initiated with the fishing communities about the marker buoys indicating the areas of construction and operation.

f) Breakwater study report

The final alignment of the breakwater is chosen based on the planning parameters, existing site conditions and form requirement of tranquility conditions that is to be maintained inside the harbour for predominant wave and wind directions prevailing at the site.

In order to ensure the tranquility inside the harbour basin from these waves, two rubble mound breakwaters are proposed – one southern breakwater of 1800 m long and a northern breakwater of 100 m length.

g) Public hearing report.

In line with the requirement of EIA Notification, 2006 (as amended) for Category A projects, public hearing was conducted at Redi Port Staff Colony, Near Jilla Parishad Purna Primary School, village Vengurla Dist- Sindhudurg. For conducting public hearing, the draft EIA report was prepared in accordance to MoEF approved TOR and executive summary were submitted to MPCB. The public hearing was conducted on Sep 12, 2011 by MPCB in the presence of District Collector, Sindhudurg. (Minutes of hearing submitted)

In the 81<sup>st</sup> meeting, the Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation decided to direct the project proponent to submit the following information by carrying out physical survey and revert-

1. Ecological / biodiversity loss from the dredging activity involved in the proposal
2. Biomass and fisheries endemism within the breakwater and reclamation area. Rate of endemism
3. Existence of corals
4. Rock fisheries study
5. Studies of impact on fisheries activities and action plan for its protection
6. Action plan for control of erosion of coast
7. Details of area of Reclamation

The Authority noted and took on record the point wise reply submitted by the proponent, which is as follows-

- A. Ecological / Biodiversity Loss from the Dredging ( clearing Waterways) activity involved in the proposal



The capital dredging is proposed to be executed in various phases based on the Developmental Programme envisaged; however, capital dredging required upto Phase II development will be carried out during the Phase I itself.

The total estimated quantity of capital dredged material is about 3.36 MCM. The material to be dredged is of salty sand and clay material, no rock dredging is envisaged.

#### Diversity of Benthic organisms from proposed dredging area

The Marine Environmental surveys were conducted by Centre for Advanced Studies in Marine Biology (CASMB), Annamalai University. Marine Environmental surveys were carried out in the coastal waters of Redi port expansion area in order to assess the existing status of Marine Environment. A total of Nine (9) sampling locations were chosen and Marine Environment surveys were carried out. Five sampling locations (MSL-1,2,3,4,8 and 9) were at <5 m water depth; one sampling location (MSL-6) between 5 and 9 m depth; MSL -5 is located at a depth of 10m and MSL-7 between 25m and 20m water depth. The sampling locations map is shown in figure 2.

#### Anticipated Loss of Benthic Forms from Proposed Dredging Area

There will be an anticipated loss of benthic organisms at 0.07927 Nos./m<sup>2</sup> in the total dredging area of 919331 m<sup>2</sup>. Dredging would result in removal of benthic communities associated with bottom sediments. During dredging, sessile forms are removed along with sediments and mobile species tend to move away and are likely to increase species diversity in areas adjoining dredging site.

Further, studies carried out during dredging and post dredging in other coastal areas, it was observed that due to movement of mobile species and transfer of nutrients during dredging, there will be an increase in species diversity and density in areas adjoining dredging site.

#### B. Biomass and Fisheries Endemism within the Breakwaters and Reclamation areas. Rate of endemism

Centre for Advanced Studies in Marine Biology, Annamalai University a reputed academic and research institute, has been engaged to monitor the existing status of Marine physico-chemical and biological attributes in the proposed port expansion area. The Marine Environment was monitored in terms of:

- Marine water quality
- Marine sediment quality
- Marine ecology/ biological assessment

The Coastal Geomorphologic features along the stretch includes headland, bay, pocket beach, wave cut cliff, rock outcrops, offshore islands, submerged bedrock and gently rising low peaked hills. The rocky islands and submerged bedrocks are located offshore within 1 to 2 km from shore and are possibly part of the detached portions of coastal headlands. The sampling locations were identified according to the requirement of the proposed project and coastal



geomorphology of the location. Sampling locations covered the intertidal offshore, proposed dredging area including the approach channel and turning circle and as well as proposed reclamation area.

Marine Environment surveys were carried out in the coastal waters of Redi port expansion area in order to assess the existing status of Marine Environment. A total of Nine (9) sampling locations were chosen and Marine Environmental surveys were carried out. Six sampling locations (MSL-1,2,3,4,8 and 9) were at <5m water depth; one sampling location (MSL-6) between 5 and 9m depth; MSL-5 is located at a depth of 10m and MSL-7 between 25m and 30 m water depth. The sampling location map is shown in figure 2.

No rare, endangered, endemic and threatened species of fish and benthic organisms were recorded / observed in the samples collected in the samples collected from the proposed project location.

As per the fisheries data published in Fish Production Report (2011-12), Fisheries Department, Maharashtra, the following table 5 gives details of the species reported in Vengurla Taluka.

As per the above species list, it is evident that No endemic species of fish is reported in Vengurla Taluka, therefore endemic species of fish is not available in the port expansion area.

### C. Study of Existence of Corals

#### Coral reefs along Sindhudurg Coast

The coral reefs along the Sindhudurg coast have been recorded at **Vengurla Rock Islands, Malvan and Angria Bank**. Of these sites, corals are most abundant at Malvan and along a shallow sunken atoll on the continental shelf in the area called the Angria Bank. Eleven species of corals are reported from Malvan waters (ICMAM Project Directorate Report, 2002). Corals are found attached on rocky substratum in inter-tidal and sub-tidal regions. *Coscinarea* sp., *Pseudosiderastrea* sp., *Synarea* sp., *Tubastrea* sp. and *Turbinaria* sp. are the coral species recorded from the region. Among them *Turbinaria*, *Tubastrea*, *Porites lutea* and *Porites* lichen were the most dominant.

The occurrence of coral reefs off the west coast has been reported by Scientists from NIO and the Central Marine Fisheries Research Institute (CMFRI) in various cruise reports. A detailed analysis of echo sounding and side-scan sonar data revealed the presence of prominent shelf edge reefs, concentrated mostly in the central and southern parts. Their depth of occurrence varied between 85 and 136 m. The reefs were reported to be 1-12 m high and 0.1-2.6 km wide (average 700 m). Morphologically, they may be classified into simple and complex types. The former are single and broad or narrow (average width 350 m), while the latter are generally massive (average width 950 m) with several superimposed peaks.

Located within this reef system is the Angria Bank-a submerged, sunken atoll at the edge of the continental shelf off India's west coast, located approximately 105 km west of Vijaydurg. The bank has a depth of 20.1 meters and its dimensions around 40 km from north to south and 15 km from east to west. It is a thriving coral habitat. The bottom is composed of sand, shells, and coral. The Bank is steep -to on all sides, with great depths surrounding it.



### Redi port location

The proposed expansion of Redi port is located along the Konkan Coast in Vengurla Taluka of Sindhudurg district, Maharashtra (15 44' 05'' N Latitude and 73 40' 01'' E Longitude).

From the literature discussed in above section and above figure, the coral reefs identified in Sindhudurg district are located at Vengurla Rocks, Malvan Marine Sanctuary and Angri Bank. The Redi port is located at a distance of 25 km from Vengurla Rocks, 40 km from Malvan Marine Sanctuary and 275 km from Angria Bank. It is evident that there is no presence of coral reefs near Redi port area. However, the site specific surveys such as Marine Environmental surveys, shallow seismic and side scan sonar survey were carried out which also proved no presence of coral reefs near Redi port.

### Marine Environmental Surveys

Marine biological surveys were carried out by **Centre for Advanced Studies in Marine Biology, Annamalai University.**

Around 56 species of phytoplankton were recorded from the study area. Among the phytoplankton species, *Pleurosigmanormanjii*, *Pleurosigmadirectum*, *Cheateoceroscurvtus*, *CoscinodiscusCentralis*, *Cheateocerosaffinis*, *Bacteriostrumcomosum*, *Thalasionemanitzschoides*, *Ceratiumfurca*, *Ceratiumtripos*, *Protopoeridinium*, *Protoperidiumdepressum*, and *Trichodesmiumerythrea* were found to be present in most of the station monitored. Around 55 species of zooplankton were recorded from the study area. Among the zooplankton *Tintinnopsistubulosa*, *Acrocalanus gibber*, *Euterfinaacutifrons*, *Sagittabifunctata*, Bivalve veliger, gastropod veliger and copepod naupli were found to be common in all stations.

**No coral reefs were found/ recorded in any of sampling locations during marine environmental surveys.**

### Shallow Seismic Survey

The shallow seismic record indicates the sub bottom of the study area is composed of rock formation, which is overlain by sediment deposits of silt mixed clay. Buried rocks are exposed above the seabed in the near shore water. The sediment deposit in the survey area is predominantly composed of silty clay. The thickness of the sediment deposit is around 1m to 4m in the near shore area; this is varying from 10m to 12m in the offshore.

**No presence of coral reefs was found during the shallow seismic survey.**

### Side Scan Sonar Survey

The seabed of the project area is carpeted with fine sediments. The near shore area has exposed and submerged rocky patches. In the near shore area few sporadic sand patches is noticed.

**No presence of coral reefs was found during the Side Scan Sonar Survey.**



D. Rock fishery study

Marine biological surveys were carried out by Centre for Advance studies in Marine Biology, Annamalai University. Lobster fattening or culture centres and availability of ornamental fisheries were not observed / recorded in the surveys conducted by CAS in Marine Biology, Annamalai University.

E. Studies of impact on fisheries activities and action plan for its protection

There are no major fishing harbours in the study area of 10 km radius from port site. The fishing villages / fish landing centres in the study area and their proximities from the proposed port site.

A. Action plan for control of erosion of coast

The shoreline evolution study has been carried out for the existing scenario and for the scenario including the proposed port development for a period of 10 years. The simulated results shows an average accretion rate of 2.5 m /year on south of south breakwater which diminishes over 600 mt to negligible level. The simulated result also shows a negligible level of erosion of 0.09 m / year towards north of the proposed port.

The stretch identified under erosion is within area of proposed port expansion and the cumulative erosion at the end of ten years will be less than 1m which is very insignificant which do not warrant any shore protection, however the shoreline will be monitored on annual basis.

Satellite imagery will be used to monitor the shoreline change during construction and operational phases of the port expansion. During shoreline monitoring, in case of any significant erosion is observed due to the proposed port, same will be managed through suitable means such as sand nourishment, geotube, gyrones or seawall depending on the rate of erosion.

B. Details of area of Reclamation

Reclamation will be carried out within the port premises and about 5.5 MCM of material will be used for reclamation. About 0.93 MCM of capital dredging material will be used for reclamation and remaining material will be sourced from the nearby areas.

The Authority noted that MoEF, New Delhi has issued TOR for the project on 12.5.2010, which was prior to Moratorium imposed by the MoEF on consideration of projects under the EIA Notification, 2006 received by the MoEF or Maharashtra by SEIAA, after 16<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 for TOR and / or EC from Ratnagiri and Sindhudurg Districts of Maharashtra.

In light of the detailed background of the proposal, the Authority after deliberation, decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF subject to following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.



2. Proponent should consult the local fisherman communities and should strictly ensure that livelihood activities such as fishing activities of local fisherman communities are not hampered.
3. The port authorities will undertake coast erosion control measures in consultation with concerned departments which shall be incorporated in Environment Management Plan.
4. Solid Waste generated during the construction phase of the port should not be dumped in the CRZ area.
5. Proponent should have proper Environment Management Plan and specific financial budget should be allocated for protection of coastal zone
6. The port authority should have an oil spill response plan.
7. Treated or untreated sewage / effluent should not be discharged into the sea.
8. Prior Hon'ble High Court permission should be obtained, if the project involves cutting of mangroves and development in 50 m mangroves buffer zone area.
9. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No. 19:**                      **CRZ Clearance for proposed development of a shipyard at Dabhol creek, near TrishulSakhari village, Tal- Guhaghar, Dist- Ratnagiri**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

- 1) The proposed project consist of construction of a shipyard with launching cum fitting out berths, material handling berths and dry dock or floating dock with other infrastructural facilities.
- 2) The proposed ship yard is planned for building medium size vessels and repair small and medium size vessels.
- 3) The ship repair facilities will be centered on a floating dock. Floating dock will be moored at about 150 m from the shore line.
- 4) Access to the dock will be provided by pontoon bridge for workers and light material and by ferry crafts for heavy material and equipment.
- 5) The repair shops, stores, offices and personal accommodation facilities will be set up beyond the CRZ area.
- 6) Proposed site located at Dabhol creek, near TrishulSkhari village, Tal- Guhaghar, Dist- Ratnagiri
- 7) Total plot area within CRZ – 127000 Sqm
- 8) Total pot area outside CRZ – 553000 Sqm
- 9) Access road from the workshop area to water front is already exists.
- 10) Dimensions of structures-

1	Fitting Out Berth	100 m long X 15 m wide.	1 No.
2	Dolphins	15 m long X 10 m wide.	2 No.
3	Operational area	15000 Sqm	

The Authority observed that the proponent is not yet having the proposal of dredging for clearing of water ways.



The Authority after deliberation decided to direct the project proponent to submit the following information-

1. List of proposed activities along with respective CRZ categorization
2. Detailed Project Report
3. EIA and EMP for the proposed project
4. Site photographs along with Google images.

**Item No. 20:**

**Proposed crop storage on plot bearing No. 34/1, 34/3, 34/2C1/ 36/1, 37/1, 37/1B, 37/4, 37/5A,+ 7B, 37/5B, 37/6, 38/1A, 38/2A, 38/3, 39/1B1, 39/1B2, 39/1B3, 39/1B4, 40/1A, 40/1B, 109A/4A, 109A/4C, 109A/4B, 109A/4E, 110/3, 111/5 at Kanthawali – Dighode Tal- Uran, Dist- Raigad – M/s. Surveshwar LogisticPvt Ltd.**

The project proponent presented the matter before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

1. The proposal was considered in the 79<sup>th</sup> & 83<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 6<sup>th</sup> August, 2013. Authority in its 79<sup>th</sup> meeting deliberated the proposal of “proposed crop storage on plot bearing No. 34/1, 34/3, 34/2C1/ 36/1, 37/1, 37/1B, 37/4, 37/5A,+ 7B, 37/5B, 37/6, 38/1A, 38/2A, 38/3, 39/1B1, 39/1B2, 39/1B3, 39/1B4, 40/1A, 40/1B, 109A/4A, 109A/4C, 109A/4B, 109A/4E, 110/3, 111/5 at Kanthawali – Dighode Tal- Uran, Dist- Raigad – M/s. Surveshwar Logistic”.
2. Project proponent submitted the CRZ map prepared by IRS, chennai in the scale of 1:4000 in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011. ie. The map is showing the 100 mt CRZ area limit from the HTL of tidally influenced water body as per provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. The said map also has the demarcation of 150 mt CRZ line from the HTL of creek.
3. Based on the decision taken in the 79<sup>th</sup> meeting, the Authority vide letter dated 21st Feb, 2013 sought clarification from MoEF. However, clarification is awaited from MoEF.
4. M/s Sarveshwar Logistics Pvt Ltd wrote a letter dated 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2013 to MCZMA that Authority has considered the CZMP plan showing 100 mtr line from HTL of tidally influenced water bodies by one of the MoEF authorized agency in one of the case, as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 and therefore, it is requested to consider the case.
5. The matter was again re-considered in 83<sup>rd</sup> meeting, wherein the Authority discussed the issue at length and after deliberation decided to adopt following stringent criteria with respect to CRZ area limit along tidally influenced water bodies-

A. Wherever the width of the tidally influenced water bodies (river, creek, nalla, backwater etc ) is 100 m or less.

CRZ area limit from the HTL on the landward side shall be 100 m or width of the tidally influenced water bodies whichever less.

B. Wherever, the width of tidally influenced water bodies such as creek, river, nalla, backwater etc is more than 100 m,



CRZ area limit from the HTL on the landward side, shall be 150m.

The above criteria will be adopted by MCZMA till the new CZMP maps in the scale of 1:4000 are prepared and approved by MoEF, New Delhi, as per CRZ Notification, 2011.

6. The Authority noted the decision taken in the 83<sup>rd</sup> MCZMA meeting. An excerpt of the minutes of the said meeting is as follows-

*"In light of point no. B; for the case of M/s Surveshwar Logistics Services Pvt Ltd; wherein, the width of the creek is varying (at places, it is less than 100 m and at other places, it is more than 100 m), the CRZ area limit will be 150 m from HTL of the creek. Authority decided to direct project proponent to submit the lay out plan of the proposed activity considering the 150 m CRZ area limit from the HTL of the creek. After receipt of the said lay out plan of the proposed activities, the proposal will be examined in the MCZMA meeting"*

It was noted that proponent has submitted IRS, Chennai map (1:4000) demarcating 150 m CRZ line from the HTL, and accordingly, submitted the lay out plan of the proposed activities.

It was noted that the site under reference is partly falls within the 150m CRZ line from HTL of the creek. The proposed activities for warehouse such as "A" Type shed, "B" Type Shed, "C" Type Shed, "D" Type Shed, "E" Type Shed, "F" Type Shed, and "G" Type Shed are proposed beyond 150m CRZ line from HTL of the creek

The Authority after discussion decided to issue CRZ NoC to the project subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. Entire construction of warehouse & other allied activities should be undertaken beyond 150 m CRZ line from the HTL of Creek i.e. in non CRZ area.
2. Concerned planning authority should ensure that the construction should not be undertaken in CRZ area.
3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

**Item No. 21:**

**CRZ clearance for the proposed Residential Building, Service Apartment and Hotel at Gothivali village S.Nos.17,22/2, 22/4,4/1, 28/1, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 45, 49, 98, 99, 100,112,131 & Talavali village S.No.49, Navi Mumbai- Reliance Corporate IT Park Limited**

The Authority noted that earlier the proposal was discussed in the 79<sup>th</sup>, 81<sup>st</sup> and 82<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 5.1.2013, 26.4.2013 & 10.6.2013 respectively.

During the 79<sup>th</sup> and 81<sup>st</sup> meeting, the Authority noted the following proposal details-

1. As per the information submitted by the proponent, the proposed construction is development of residential building consists of Hotel, Service Apartments and Residential Building.



	No. of Podia	No. of Building	Configuration of the Building
<b>Hotel</b>	2	1	Ground + 3 upper floor
<b>Service Apartments</b>	1	1	Ground + 8 upper floor
<b>Residential Buildings</b>	1	5	Ground + 28 upper floor

**Area Statement:**

	FSI area	Non FSI area	Total Built up Area
<b>Hotel</b>	10952.00	7500.00	18452.00
<b>Service Apartment</b>	13811.00	3622.00	17433.00
<b>Residential Buildings</b>	92484.00	48535.00	141019.00
<b>Total built up area</b>	117247.00	59657.00	176904.00

**FSI Details:**

As per the layout plan,

- Total area of plot – 87,323.00sqm
- Permissible FSI – 1.00
- Permissible built up area – 87,323.00sqm
- Total Proposed Hotel BUA – 14675.526sqm
- Total proposed Residential BUA – 57896.940sqm
- Total Built up area – 72572.466sqm
- FSI proposed to be consumed – 0.99
- Balance Built up area – 14750.534sqm
- Proposed staircase area – 9150.260sqm
- Total gross area – 76887.690sqm
- Proposed stilt area – 6680.262sqm

As per the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation-

1. As per the sanction Development Plan of Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation, the plot under reference is in residential zone.
2. The NMMC vide their letter dated 05.12.2012 mentioned that as per the approved CZMP of Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation, the plot falls partly in CRZ II and situated on landward side of existing bund road.
3. The total area of plot is 87,323.00sqmt
4. The proposal has got earlier C.C dated 04.06.2012 by NMMC for the plot area which is outside the CRZ-II limit. Now, the development is proposed on CRZ-II portion of plot, hence, now amended development permission is proposed.
5. In the Form I, submitted by the project proponent mentioned that, the proposal is for the development of Hotel, Service Apartments and Residential building by demolishing existing structure.



In the 79<sup>th</sup> meeting, the authority decided to get the following information from the project proponent-

- Whether any construction activity is going on site under reference. If yes, then status of the ongoing construction activities in CRZ area.
- List of proposed activity in CRZ and Non CRZ area.
- Existing use Vs proposed use of the activities proposed in CRZ area.
- CRZ status of restaurant / Hotel on land under reference.

The project proponent has forwarded their reply dated 27<sup>th</sup> May, 2013 on the points raised by the project proponent (Reliance Co. IT Park Ltd). The Authority noted the point wise reply of the proponent, which is as follows-

In the 81<sup>st</sup> meeting, the Authority took the point wise reply of the project proponent on record, which is as follows-

1. Whether any construction activity is going on site under reference. If yes, then status of the ongoing construction activities in CRZ area.  
No construction work has commenced at site. The work will commence only after all permission are in place and all requisite clearances are obtained.
2. List of proposed activity in CRZ and Non CRZ area.  
Part of the Residential Complex and Service Apartment is in the CRZ area which falls on the landward side of the existing bund road while the proposed Hotel is in non CRZ area.
3. Existing use Vs proposed use of the activities proposed in CRZ area.  
According to the project proponent, the present use is residential and the proposed use will be also for residential purpose.
4. CRZ status of restaurant / Hotel on land under reference.  
The proposed Hotel is in non CRZ area.

In the 81<sup>st</sup> meeting, the Authority directed project proponent to get the 150 mt CRZ line demarcated from HTL from the IRS, Chennai (1:4000 scale) and revert.

Accordingly, Project Proponent submitted the CRZ map in the scale 1:4000 prepared by IRS, Chennai showing 150 mtr CRZ line with superimposition of project layout.

The Authority examined the CRZ map showing 150 m CRZ line from the Creek, which shows that proposed Hotel activity is affected by 150 m CRZ line. It was concluded that since the proposal of hotel activity amounts to change of present use while redevelopment of existing residential / guest house structures, which is not permissible, as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority directed project proponent to submit the proposal of redevelopment through Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation in conformity with the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.



**Item No. 22: Seeking N.O.C. for the proposal affected by CRZ having plot No.40, Sector-20, Koparkhairne, Navi Mumbai.**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the followings-

<b>Proposal Details:</b>	The proposed residential building comprises of Stilt + Podium (1 <sup>st</sup> floor) + 26 <sup>th</sup> floor.
<b>Location of the Project:</b>	Plot bearing plot No. 40, Sector -20, Koparkhairne, Navi Mumbai
<b>Proposal Category:</b>	New Development
<b>CRZ Category of the proposed site:</b>	As per the approved CZMP, Navi Mumbai, The plot falls in CRZ II Situating on landward side of existing bund road.
<b>DP Remarks,</b> <b>d) Zone:</b>  <b>e) Proposed Use:</b>	As per the Development Plan, d) Residential Zone.  e) Residential use
<b>FSI Details,</b>  <b>c) Permissible FSI:</b> <b>d) FSI proposed to be consumed:</b>	As per the layout plan,  c) 1.5 d) 1.49
<b>Area Details,</b>  <b>k) Total area of the plot:</b> <b>l) Total permissible BUA:</b> <b>m) Area of the stilt at ground floor:</b> <b>n) Area of the podium at 1<sup>st</sup> floor:</b> <b>o) Total proposed BUA:</b>	As per the layout plan submitted by PP, k) 1933.76sqm l) 2900.646sqm  m) 504.668sqm  n) 434.073sqm o) 2898.330sqm

The Authority after deliberation decided to direct the project proponent to submit the information through Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation as to whether Proposed construction is situated on the landward side of the existing road constructed prior to 19.2.1991 or on landward side of existing authorized structure.



**Discussion / Policy Items**

**Item No. 1: Review of District Coastal Zone Monitoring Committee- Thane District**

The Authority noted that in exercise of powers conferred under the provision 6 (C) of CRZ Notification, 2011; the Environment Dept, Govt. of Maharashtra has constituted the District Coastal Zone Monitoring Committee vide order dated 23.3.2011. The Collector of the district is the chairperson of the Committee.

Function of the committee includes the protection and conservation of coastal stretch of the district, identification of violation of CRZ rules, taking action against the violations, identify the ecological sensitive areas and formulate the plan for it etc.

As per the decision taken in 83rd meeting of the MCZMA; the work of the Thane, DCZMC is proposed to be reviewed. The District Collector or its Representative is requested to apprise the MCZMA for the functioning of DCZMC, Thane.

The Collector, Thane attended the meeting, who appraised the Authority about the working of DCZMC, Thane. He further presented that Thane, DCZMC receives CRZ violations complaints from the MCZMA, Divisional Commissioner, Konkan as well as directly from public domain and they are mainly pertains to destruction of mangroves.

Thane, DCZMC has received 6 Nos of complaints from the MCZMA. Out of 6 cases, FIR has been lodged on 3 cases. 2 cases were without substance and 1 case is pending for the investigation.

DCZMC, Thane in all received 90 complaints of CRZ violations, FIR has been lodged in 30 cases, 32 cases were without substance and 28 are pending for investigation.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to constitute a sub-committee comprising SDO, Thane, DFO, Thane Mr. Mali and a representative of Thane Municipal Corporation at DMC/Chief Engineer level as suggested by TMC to do the baseline survey of the Coastal areas of Thane District in order to identify CRZ violations such as degradation / destruction of mangroves, encroachments and illegal construction in coastal areas.

**Item No. 2: Shoreline change map of Maharashtra prepared by National Centre for Sustainable Coastal Management**

National Centre for Sustainable Coastal Management (NCSCM) was requested to make presentation on shoreline change maps of Maharashtra Coast before the Authority. However, on telephonic request from Director, NCSCM, the matter was deferred. In next MCZMA, Director, NCSCM would make detailed presentation on shoreline change map of Maharashtra.





**Item No. 3: CRZ proposals of Malvan area which is declared as Critical Vulnerable Coastal Area (CVCA)**

The Authority noted that the new CRZ Notification, 2011 ( amended till date ) published by the Ministry of Environment and Forest, New Delhi has categorized as **Malvan, Achra in Ratnagiri** as Critical Vulnerable Coastal Area (CVCA) area. The provision is as follows-

- (a) **Critical Vulnerable Coastal Areas (CVCA)** which includes Sunderbans and other identified ecological sensitive areas which shall be managed with the involvement of the local coastal communities including the fisher folk;-
- (b) the entire Sunderbans mangrove area and other identified ecologically important areas such as Gulf of Khambhat and Gulf of Kutch in Gujarat, **Malvan, Achra in Ratnagiri** in Maharashtra, Karwar and Coondapur in Karnataka, Vembanad in Kerala, Gulf of Mannar in Tamil Nadu, Bhaitarkanika in Orissa, Coringa, East Godavari and Krishna in Andhra Pradesh shall be declared as Critical Vulnerable Coastal Areas (CVCA) through a process of consultation with local fisher and other communities inhabiting the area and depend on its resources for their livelihood with **the objective of promoting conservation and sustainable use of coastal resources and habitats;**
- (c) the process of identifying planning, notifying and implementing CVCA shall be detailed in the guideline which **will be developed and notified by MoEF in consultations with the stakeholders like the State Government, local coastal communities and fisherfolk and the like inhabiting the area;**
- (d) the **Integrated Management Plans (IMPs)** prepared for such CVCA shall inter alia keep in view the conservation and management of mangroves, needs of local communities such as, dispensaries, schools, public rain shelter, community toilets, bridges, roads, jetties, water supply, drainage, sewerage and the impact of sea level rise and other natural disasters and the IMPs will be prepared in line with the para 5 above for preparation of Coastal Zone Management Plans;
- (e) till such time the IMPs are approved and notified, construction of dispensaries, schools, public rain shelters, community toilets, bridges, roads, jetties, water supply, drainage, sewerage which are required for traditional inhabitants shall be permitted on a case to case basis, by the CZMA with due regards to the views of coastal communities including fisherfolk.

It was further noted that issue was deliberated in 77<sup>th</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 9<sup>th</sup> October, 2012 wherein, the authority after deliberation decided the followings-

1. The MCZMA to request MoEF for guidelines regarding preparation of Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for Achra in Ratnagiri and Malvan- Sindhudurg at the earliest.
2. The CRZ Notification, 2011 is silent on the permissibility of reconstruction / redevelopment / new construction on vacant plot in Achra- Ratnagiri and Malvan. However, MCZMA is receiving the number of proposals for reconstruction/ new construction from Malvan region. Therefore, MCZMA shall request a clarification regarding the same from MoEF.

Accordingly, the MoEF has been requested to provide guidelines for preparation of Integrated Management Plan (IMP). However, the reply from MoEF is still awaited in the matter.

The MCZMA has been receiving construction / reconstruction proposals from Malvan(CVCA) region. Following list of the construction / reconstruction proposals received before the MCZMA in the year 2012 & 2013.



Sr. No.	File No	Subject
1	CRZ 2012/CR-73/T.C.3	CRZ permission for construction of residential building at DhuriwadaMun.Council area, C.T.S.No.2844(pt) S.No. 331(935)B1- MalvanMun.Council
2	CRZ 2012/CR-261/T.C.2	CRZ clearance for construction of Dharmashala Building in Malvan, on MalvanAachara Road, Tal.Malvan, Distt. Sindhudurg in plot bearing CTS No. 2914 - MalvanMun.Council
3	CRZ 2013/CR-42/T.C.2	NOC for reconstruction of M.M.C. House No.12 C.T.S.No.33, Survey No. 1407(955P), Hissa No.6 at Medha-Malvan, Distt.Sindhudurg-MalwanMun.Corporation
4	CRZ 2013/CR-66/T.C.4	NOC for construction of residential construction on land bearing C.T.S.No.2334/A/2, 2334/A/3, 2334B, 2334C, 2335, 2336, 2638 at village Medha, Tq.Malvan, Distt.Sindhudurg
5	CRZ 2013/CR-110/T.C.4	CRZ permission for construction of residential Quarter for Officers & staff at Rural Hospital Malvan, Tal.Malvan, Distt.Sindhudurg at S.No.2309, 2310, 2311, 2312,2313, 2314, 2315 at Malvan, Tal.Malvan, Distt.Sindhudurga-MalvanMun.Council
6	CRZ 2013/CR-111/T.C.4	CRZ permission for construction of Central Administration building on land bearing C.T.S.No. 1253( 929C) Part 1 & C.S.No.'1256 (929 A2) Part 5B & property No.1,2,3 at Malvan, Tal.Malvan, Distt.Sindhudurga-MalvanMun.Council
7	CRZ 2013/CR-127/T.C.4	Proposed building for PanchayatSamitiMalvan in CTS 2260 & 2290 Dist.Sindhudurg

The Authority observed that as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011; proposals of construction / reconstruction of Malvanarea (CVCA) would be regulated in accordance with the integrated Management Plan prepared for the Malvan( CVCA ) area.

Further, it was noted that till such time the IMPs are approved and notified, construction of dispensaries, schools, public rain shelters, community toilets, bridges, roads, jetties, water supply, drainage, sewerage which are required for traditional inhabitants shall be permitted on a case to case basis, by the MCZMA with due regards to the views of coastal communities including fisherfolk.

Since, the IMP of the Malvan region is yet to be prepared in absence of guidelines from MoEF and approved by the MoEF; the MCZMA could not process the said proposals. The Authority after discussion decided to return the above proposals back to Malvan Municipal Council requesting him to resubmit these proposals once IMP is in place. It was further decided to send a reminder letter to MoEF for guidelines towards preparation of IMP for the CVCA areas as early as possible.



**Item No. 4: List of CRZ Reclassification proposals.**

The MCZMA has received following CRZ reclassification proposals in the year 2012 & 2013.

Sr. No	File No	Subject
1	CRZ 2011/CR-67/T.C.3	Proposed redevelopment of existing building on plot bearing No.K-4, D.N.Nagar, Andheri(W) - Sanjay B.Shah
2	CRZ 2011/CR-68/T.C.3	Submission of documents for the Godavari Pravara CHS Building No.K-4 bearing CTS No.195(pt), D.N.Nagar, village Andheri (West)- Shree SaiSagar Consultants.
3	CRZ 2012/CR-23/T.C.3	CRZ NOC in respect of reclassification Coastal/Creek Regulations- Plot No.CTS No.900A/3 of Bandra, D- village located on 19th Road, Khar(W), Mumbai -White Lion Real Estate Developers Pvt.Ltd.
4	CRZ 2012/CR-29/T.C.3	S.No.268 & 269 of village Gorai- Cognizance thereof & considering HTL from 150 mtrs. To 100 mtrs. As per MoEF Notification
5	CRZ 2012/CR-100/T.C.3	Seeking clarification about the current CRZ II applicable to plot No. G-412 in Santacruz West
6	CRZ 2012/CR-107/T.C.3	Confirmation of demarcation of HTL Line in respect of Final Plot No. 83/B/8 and 83/B/9- TPS II Santacruze
7	CRZ 2012/CR-192/T.C.3	Proposed redevelopment on plot Nos.85/86/76/77 bearing C.T.S.No.G/399/C,D & E of village Bandra situated at 17th Road, Santacruz(West), Mumbai- Ganga Jamuna CHS Ltd.
9	CRZ 2012/CR-246/T.C.3. (Ref.MCZMA 2006/CR-8/T.C.II)	Delineation of HTL & CRZ boundary along and across the property bearing No. 1'42/1/A, CTS No.832/6 of village Ambivali, Tq.Andheri, 'K' Ward, Andheri(W),Mumbai-400053.
10	CRZ 2012/CR-271/T.C.2	Reclassification- CZMP- Mumbai MahanagarPalika area deletion of land from the CRZ for CTS B/645 Bandra(W), Mumbai- 400050- Designer's Point
11	CRZ 2012/CR-32/T.C.3	Confirmation of CRZ line as demarcation for the plot bearing F.P.No.1116, T.P.S.No.IV of Mahim Dn. In Prabhadevi on MurariGhagMarg, Mumbai- YMS

As per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011; preparation of new Coastal Zone Management Plan (CZMP) by the MoEF authorized agencies is under process. Work of preparation of new CZMP in accordance with provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011 is under progress by the MoEF authorized agencies.

In the light of this, the Authority observed that the above mentioned reclassification proposals would be considered/addressed at the stage of public consultation to be carried out on draft CZMPs prepared under CRZ Notification, 2011. The project Proponent would be informed accordingly.



**Item No. 5: Discussion on uniform guidelines for preparation of CZMP maps as per CRZ Notification, 2011**

The Authority noted that the Ministry of Environment and Forests, Govt. of India has published CRZ Notification, 2011 on 6.1.2011. As per the said notification State Coastal Zone Management Authorities have to prepare new CZMP of their state in the scale 1:25000 & 1:4000 through the MoEF authorized agencies.

IRS, Chennai is preparing CZMP of Mumbai, Raigad, Ratnagiri and NaviMumbai area. The CESS is preparing the CZMP for Thane and Sindhudurg district.

Both the agencies are preparing the draft CZMPs in accordance with the guidelines stipulated in the Annexure I of the CRZ Notification, 2011. The Annexure I stipulates guidelines for demarcation of High Tide Line, preparation of Coastal Zone Management Maps, superimposition of ecologically sensitive features and other features on the CZMP maps, classification of different coastal zones, adoption of national or international color codes to highlight sub-classifications and the ecological sensitive features etc. In addition, as per the requirement in the notification, MCZMA requested IRS and CESS to incorporate the details mentioned in the Memorandum of Understanding.

The matter was discussed in the 83<sup>rd</sup> meeting held on 6.8.2013 wherein the issues raised by CESS (MoEF authorized agency) were deliberated. The authority also decided in the said meeting it is necessary to have uniformity in preparation of draft CZMPs by both the MoEF authorized agencies. Based on the decision taken in 83<sup>rd</sup> meeting of the MCZMA; Both MoEF authorized agencies namely IRS and CESS were called for the meeting. Accordingly, representatives of IRS and CESS attended the meeting.

Both the agencies have informed that work preparation of draft CZMPs are being undertaken in accordance with guidelines prescribed in Annexure I of the CRZ Notification, 2011 and the MoU referred above.

Both the agencies raised certain queries towards bringing the uniformity in preparation of draft CZMPs. These were discussed and decided as follows-

1. Uniformly take 5 ppt salinity criteria as an indicator of extent of CRZ area along the tidally influenced water bodies.
2. Width of the tidally influenced water body will be from HTL to HTL
3. Starting of the CRZ of the tidally influenced water bodies at the mouth will be decided based on geomorphology.
4. Comparison of previous CZMP with new CZMP shall be provided on a case to case basis with justification as a text and in GIS
5. In case of sea front, demarcation of 100 m, 200 m and 500 m CRZ line from HTL in CRZ III areas and 200m and 500m in CRZ -II areas.
6. Uniform color code for CRZ I (A), CRZ I (B), CRZ II, CRZ III and CRZ IV were decided.

The Authority is in the process of obtaining the required information from concerned Govt agencies / authorities, as requested by both agencies. Efforts will be made to forward the same to both agencies at the earliest.



The Authority directed both agencies to submit the draft CRZ maps to MCZMA before 25<sup>th</sup> Sept, 2013.

**Item No. 6: PIL (Lodging) No. 56/2013 (AmitMaru V/s the State of Maharashtra) (Sukhada /Shubhada, CHSL), Worli, Mumbai**

The Authority observed that representative of Urban Development Department was not present during the meeting. Since the matter is related mainly with UDD, the Authority decided to seek detailed information on the issue from UDD and till then decided to defer the matter.

**Table Item No.1: Proposed Redevelopment Scheme of Municipal Property bearing New C.S. No. 1004 ( old C. S. No. 777(pt) to 780(pt) ) and of Worli Division, G/South ward, known as "New Municipal Labour Camp" at Sasmira Marg Worli, Mumbai.**

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the detailed background of the matter-

**A. Clearance to old proposal by MoEF**

The proposal of Re-development of Municipal tenented property on the plot bearing C.S. NO. 777(pt) to 780(pt) of worli Division" was discussed in 35<sup>th</sup> meeting of MCZMA held on 26<sup>th</sup> sep, 2006. After deliberations, the MCZMA recommended the proposal to MoEF for grant of CRZ clearance vide letter dated 16.10.2006.

The MoEF vide letter No. 11-81/2006-IA-III dated 24<sup>th</sup> January, 2007 accorded CRZ Clearance under CRZ Notification, 1991 for redevelopment project of property "Prerna Co-op. Hsg. Soc." Situated at C. S. NO. 777(pt) to 780(pt) of Worli Division vide letter dated 24.1.2007.

The MoEF granted the CRZ clearance for-

1. One Residential building having 2 wings each having Stilt + 13 upper floors
2. Three shops are proposed on ground floor of one these wings
3. Additional 6 nos of shops as separate ground floor structure
4. Built up area- 15744.28 Sqm

MOEF CRZ clearance reflected built up area as 15744.68 Sqm (only FSI component). SEAC directed the project proponent to get CRZ clearance for total construction area ( FSI component + Non FSI component )

(As per MCGM letter dated 3.7.2013, the earlier NoC is issued as per FSI available on the plot in which non FSI area is not considered.)

**Stop work notice to the project**

Proponent has been served with stop work notice dated 21 June 2011 from the Secretary, Environment Department of the State Government stating that since the petitioner's project construction is more than 20,000 sqm, it was obligatory on the petitioner's part to obtain prior



environmental clearance from competent authority as per EIA Notification dated 14 September 2006 before starting any building construction activity.

The notice further stated that since the petitioner had failed to obtain prior environmental clearance before starting construction activities, there is a violation of Notification dated 14 September 2006 and, therefore, the petitioner must stop the construction work forthwith. Consequently the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai has also issued stop work notice dated 27 July 2011

SEAC directs proponent to get CRZ clearance from MCZMA

The proponent had accordingly submitted its application to the SEAC in June 2011. The SEAC directed project proponent to obtain CRZ clearance as per 4(d) of CRZ Notification, 2011 which states that any construction involving more than 20000 m<sup>2</sup> BUA in CRZ-II, prior recommendation of concerned CZMA shall be essential for considering grant of environmental clearance as per EIA Notification 2006 or grant of approval by the relevant planning authority.

Accordingly, the project proponent forwarded the proposal through MCGM on 1.10.2012. Proponent has submitted the New proposal under 8.V.(c) of CRZ Notification, 2011 to avail the FSI as per DCR as on 6.1.2011. As per the 8.V.( C) of CRZ Notification, 2011; **Redevelopment of Cess building** in CRZ II area of Mumbai is permissible as per DCR as on 6.1.2011.

COURT MATTER (WP 470/2013)

Project proponent filed an WP No. 470/2013 in Hon. Mumbai High Court. The High court passed the order dated 6<sup>th</sup> march, 2013 in the matter. **Excerpts of the order is as follows-**

*"Accordingly, the petition is partly allowed and the stop work notices dated 21 June 2011 issued by the Secretary, Environment Department, (Exhibit "I") and 27 July 2011 (Exhibit AA) issued by the Executive Engineer (Building Proposal, City) Municipal E-Ward of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai shall stand modified to the effect that the petitioner is restrained from putting up any construction in excess of 20,000 sq. meters computed on the basis of the MOEF Notification 4 April 2011, including the construction of the rehabilitation building for 99 flats, 9 shops and the municipal school building already constructed or almost constructed. An undertaking to this effect shall be filed by a Director of the petitioner company within two weeks from today and the petitioner shall commence construction only after such an undertaking is filed before this Court".*

81<sup>st</sup> meeting of MCZMA

Accordingly, the proposal was placed in 81<sup>st</sup> meeting of the MCZMA wherein, the project proponent during the meeting submitted a letter dated 25.4.2013 informing that the present proposal to MCZMA would have to be revised, as per sanctioned and approved plans ( IOD dated 9.5.2008 & CC dated 5.1.2009 ) as well as orders of Hon. High Court of Mumbai. Proponent requested authority to consider the proposal in next MCZMA meeting after submission of revised proposal to MCZMA



Revised proposal submitted to MCZMA

The MCGM vide letter dated 3.7.2013 has forwarded the proposal of "Redevelopment Scheme of Municipal Property bearing on New C.S. No. 1004 (old C. S. No. 777(pt) to 780(pt)) of Worli Division, G/South ward, known as "New Municipal Labour Camp" at Sasmira Marg Worli, Mumbai"

**Proposal details of the revised proposal is as follows-**

Proposal category

Redevelopment of existing structures under DC regulation 33(7) of DCR 1991 as per para 8.V.C of CRZ Notification, 2011

DP remarks

DP remarks of MCGM dated 8<sup>th</sup> July, 2011 mentions that land comprised in C.S.No. 777 (pt) to 780(pt) of Worli division, is partly reserved for the public purpose for Municipal Primary school & partly designated for existing Municipal Housing and partly for the existing garden. The land is situated in a Residential Zone.

CRZ status of the plot

As per approved CZMP of Mumbai (1:25000 scale ), the plot under reference falls in CRZ II and situated on landward side of existing sasmira road. Proponent has submitted a CRZ map (1:4000) scale prepared by IRS, Chennai shows, the plot bearing New C.S. No. 1004 ( old C.S. No. 777(pt) to 780(pt) ) falls in CRZ II and situated on landward side of road.

Existing structure

As mentioned by MCGM letter dated 3.7.2012 –

Authenticity of building – MCGM Estates tenanted property

Total BUA of existing structure - structures are demolished. The area certified is 2115.01 Sqm. Existing use of building – Residential.

IOD and CC issued by the MCGM

The MCGM letter dated 4.7.2013 mentions that-

1. As per PR card, the plot belongs to MCGM. The MCGM has issued LOI to develop to New Municipal Labor Camp, Worli. The Society has appointed M/s Saumya Buildcon Pvt Ltd to develop the said property. Estate Dept has issued LOI to redevelop the said plot under Reg 33(7) with FSI 2.00 on gross plot area. The plans has been approved / issued by Building proposal Dept.
2. The layout has been approved by MCGM on 18.12.2006 which was subsequently amended on 9.10.2007.



3. The IOD for Rehab Building No. 1 has been issued under No. EB / 1552/GS/A on 18.12.2006 for residential tenants and subsequently amended on 9.10.2007. CC upto plinth for Rehab building No. 1 has been issued on 6.3.2009. Construction work up to 10 floors has been completed.
4. IOD for Rehab Building No. 2 of Non Residential tenants has been issued under No. EB /3080/GS/A on 18.10.2007. CC up to part plinth has been issued on 30.11.2009. Construction work upto part plinth has been completed as per approved phase programme. IOD for Municipal primary School building has been issued under No. EB/3066/GS/A dated 13.12.2007.
5. CC up to plinth level has been issued on 23.1.2008 and further CC upto 4<sup>th</sup> floor has been issued on 23.12.2008. The building comprises of total 5 floors, construction work has been issued on 23.12.2008. The building comprises of 5 floors, construction work has been completed up to 4 floor as per further CC issued.
6. IOD for sale building has been issued under No. EB/3525/GS/A on 9.5.2008. CC has been issued on 5.1.2009 up to 9<sup>th</sup> podium level slab, however, only piling work has been done.

#### Proposed building

As per the MCGM letter dated 3.7.2013,

Proposed height of the building

1. Rehab building No. 1- 42.05m
2. Rehab building No. 2- 7.95 m
3. Municipal primary school- 22.95 m
4. Sale building – 205.35 m

Permissible height-Proposal is as per DC Regulation 33(7) hence as per DC 33(1), the restriction shall not be applicable

#### FSI details

As per the MCGM letter dated 3.7.2013-

1. Plot area- 7872.14 Sqm
2. Setback area- Nil
3. Reservation – Municipal Primary School- 523.16 Sqm
4. Net plot area – 7348.98 Sqm
5. Permissible BUA-  $7872.14 * 2 = 15744.28$  Sqm
6. Proposed BUA- 15645.70 Sqm
7. Free of FSI area – 50952.12 Sqm
8. Total BUA including Free of FSI – 66597.82 Sqm

The project proponent has obtained CRZ NoC from MoEF. The earlier NoC is issued as per FSI available on the plot in which non FSI area is not considered. In this case, the plans are approved





as per Reg 33(7) of DCR 1991, on the basis of redevelopment of existing municipal structures existing prior to 1940.

Public consultation

MPCB has forwarded a public consultation report vide letter dated 27.7.2012. Public hearing was done on 20.6.12.

The Authority noted that total construction area, as per the MCGM letter no CHE/1232/DPBPC dated 3.7.2013 is 66597.82 Sqm; whereas, as per the report submitted by the proponent, total construction area is 50,952.12 Sqm

On inquiry, the project proponent clarified that the total construction area involved in the project is 50,952.12 Sqm, which was taken on record by the Authority.

Further, the Authority noted that for redevelopment of Municipal Primary School with built up area 1045.00 Sqm; the MoEF has earlier granted CRZ clearance dated 16.10.2006. IOD for Municipal primary School building has been issued under No. EB/3066/GS/A dated 13.12.2007. CC up to plinth level has been issued on 23.1.2008 and further CC upto 4<sup>th</sup> floor has been issued on 23.12.2008. The building comprises of 5 floors, construction work has been completed up to 4 floor as per further CC issued. The proposed built up area of primary school in revised proposal is remains same i.e. 1046.32 Sqm.

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ Point of view to SEIAA/MCGM subject to compliance of the following conditions-

1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. There should not be violation of provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011, which shall be ensured by MCGM.
3. MCGM should ensure that total construction area involved in the project is 50,952.12 Sqm.
4. MCGM should ensure that built up area proposed for primary school is 1045.0 Sqm.
5. Reconstruction of authorized building to be permitted subject with the existing Floor Space Index or Floor Area Ratio Norms and without change in present use.
6. The concerned planning authority should ensure that there is no change of use for the proposed redevelopment of existing authorized building.
7. The concerned Planning authority should ensure that FSI, lay out plan, height involved in the proposal is as per town and country planning regulations existing as on 6.1.2011.
8. The MCGM should ensure that FSI, non FSI and concessions granted by Municipal Commissioner, if any, is strictly as per the provisions of DCR existing as on 6.1.2011.
9. Project proponent should implement green initiatives such as Rainwater Harvesting system for ground water recharge, Solar panel for generation of renewable energy for captive consumption.
10. All other mandatory <sup>clearances</sup> from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work



**Table item: 2**      **Honorarium of non- official members (expert members) of the MCZMA.**

The Authority noted that the matter was discussed in 74<sup>th</sup> meeting of the MCZMA held on 23<sup>rd</sup> April 2012, wherein it was decided that –

The sitting fees, site visit charges and TA / DA to the members, invitees, experts etc. will be given as follows:

- 1) Sitting fees/site visit per day Rs.2000
- 2) Food bills and taxi charges as per actual use.
- 3) Travel by train in AC 2 tier or economic class air or actual expenditure required for travel by road not exceeding the economy class air fare or AC 2 tier fare.
- 4) Stay in Government guest house, MTDC, Central Government guest house as per Government of India norms.
- 5) Expenditure on above will be incurred from the funds given to MCZMA or from the processing fees received by MCZMA.

The Authority decided the followings-

- 1) Stay in Government guest house, MTDC, Central Government guest house or as per Central Government norms will be applicable to members,
- 2) Call information about admissible Sitting fees/site visit per day to members from MoEF. .

-----Meeting ended with vote of thanks-----

**Annexure I**

**Members present for the meeting-**

1. Dr. M. Baba, Expert member
2. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, Expert Member
3. A. T. Fulmali, Member Secretary

Dr. Gitanjali Deshmukh was present as deputed by the Director, CIFE

**Invitee Members**

Shri.Vasudevan, CCF, Mangroves Cell.

