

MINUTES OF THE 158th MEETING (Day 3) OF MAHARASHTRA COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY HELD ON 4th May, 2022

The 158th meeting (Day 3) of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) was held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary (Environment). In view of present pandemic situation of COVID-19, it was decided to appraise the proposals by using information technology facilities. Hence, the matters were appraised through Videoconferencing technology on Cisco WebEx platform on 4th May, 2022.

List of members present in the meeting is at **Annexure-I**.

Item No.1: Proposed dredging work to clear navigational channel in Bankot creek near Mahad city, District Raigad by Maharashtra Maritime Board

Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) officials presented the proposal before the Authority. MMB has proposed to carry out dredging in a stretch of 5.6 km of Bankot Creek (Savitri River) channel adjacent to Mahad city from village kemburli to village Rajewadi. The dredging operation will clear the channel and increase the depth, thereby increasing the carrying capacity of the river. This will also help in mitigating flooding situation in Mahad City, Raigad. Maintenance dredging upto Kemburli been proposed, since the navigability of the creek is only possible till village Kemburli.

MMB officials further presented that maintenance dredging is proposed in Bankot creek by mechanical means by employing suitable dredgers to clear the 5.6 km stretch of proposed navigational channel (dimensions 5600 m x 50 m x 3 meter) between Kemburli and Mahad. The estimated quantity to be dredged is 11, 16,470 Cubic meters. MMB states that as per letters received from District Collector, Raigad this clearing of Navigational channel in the above mentioned stretch will act as one of flood mitigation measure to prevent floods in Mahad City. Details of the Gut No. and Geographical location of the proposed dredging is tabulated as below:



Member Secretary



Chairperson

**Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone
Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.**

Sr. No.	Distance from Entrance of Bankot Creek to dredging sub-block (Gut)	Chart name & Gut	Sub-Gut	Gut Size (in meters)	Geographical position of the Gut	
					Latitude	Longitude
1	48.93 km	Bankot creek (Savitri River) Sav to Kemburli Sheet No. 1949/2020 Block - A	A7	500 X 50	18° 04' 05"N	73° 24' 05" E
					18° 04' 03"N	73° 24' 05" E
					18° 04' 16"N	73° 24' 17" E
					18°04' 17"N	73° 24' 16" E
			A8	640 X 50	18°04'17"N	73° 24' 16" E
					18° 04'16" N	73° 24' 17" E
					18°04'31"N	73° 24' 17" E
					18° 04' 33"N	73° 24' 30" E

**Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone
Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.**

2	50.00 km	Bankot_creek (Savitri River) Kemburli to Mahad Sheet No. 2086/2021 Block - B	B1	500 X 50	18° 04' 33"N	73° 24' 30" E
					18° 04' 31"N	73° 24' 30" E
					18° 04' 39"N	73° 24' 45" E
					18° 04' 41"N	73° 24' 44" E
			B2	385 X 50	18° 04' 41"N	73° 24' 44" E
					18° 04' 39"N	73° 24' 45" E
					18° 04' 39"N	73° 24' 57" E
					18° 04' 40"N	73° 24' 58" E
3	52.00 km	Bankot creek (Savitri River) Mahad to Rajewadi 2087/2021 Gut - C	C1	500 X 50	18° 04' 34" N	73° 25' 32" E
					18° 04' 33"N	73° 25' 33" E
					18° 04' 42" N	73° 25' 47" E
					18° 04' 43" N	73° 25' 47" E
			C2	500 X 50	18° 04' 43" N	73° 25' 47" E
					18° 04' 38" N	73° 26' '03" E
					18° 04' 42" N	73° 25' 47" E
					18° 04' 40" N	73° 26' .04" E
C3	500 X 50	18° 04' 40" N	73° 26' .04" E			
		18° 04' 38" N	73° 26' 03" E			
		18° 04' 38" N	73° 26' 20" E			
		18° 04' 40" N	73° 26' 19" E			
C4	500 X 50	18° 04' 40" N	73° 26' 19" E			


Member Secretary

Page 3 of 10


Chairperson

**Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone
Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.**

			18° 04' 38" N	73° 26' 20" E
			18° 04' 49" N	73° 26' 32" E
			18° 04' 50" N	73° 26' 31" E
	C5	390 X 50	18° 05' 02" N	73° 26' 37" E
			18° 05' 02" N	73° 26' 35" E
	Dadali Bridge (East)	600 X 50	18° 04' 30" N	73° 25' 16" E
			18° 04' 28" N	73° 25' 15" E
			18° 04' 33" N	73° 25' 34" E
			18° 04' 34" N	73° 25' 33" E
	Dadali Bridge (West)	600 X 50	18° 04' 37" N	73° 24' 58" E
			18° 04' 38" N	73° 24' 57" E
			18° 04' 28" N	73° 25' 15" E
			18° 04' 30" N	73° 25' 16" E

The Authority noted that the EIA report has been prepared by Accredited Consultant. Anticipated impacts and mitigation measures suggested in the EIA report has been noted. As per EIA report Savitri is one of the important western coast rivers, originating in the Aurthorsit Point at old Mahabaleshwar at an altitude of 1212 meter above MSL. It merges in Arabian Sea at Bankot creek near Devgad villae in Shrivardhan Tehsil. Tidal influence is observed in Savitir River upto 1.5 km upstream form the confluence point of Savitri and Gandhari Rivers. High Tide and Low Tide situation affects the navigation vessels in Savitri River beyond village Dasgoan, which is located downstream of Mahad around 8 km distance. While the tidal influence helped for navigation when port activities where flourishing at Mahad, it is proving hazardous when coinciding with heavy rainfall. Siltation in the watercourse leads to formation of sand bars and barriers, sand ridges and sand islands in the river bed, that make the river shallow. This further leads to decrease in navigable depth of the river bed.



Member Secretary

Page 4 of 10



Chairperson

Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.

This clearing of navigational channel in the above mentioned stretch will help in making the channel navigable by vessels. Dredging activity essentially includes excavation, drilling and piling works. Minor disturbance of the water flow may likely to occur due to piling and drilling works inside the bed. However, there are standard practices for dredging activity.

The EIA report further states that various studies and research indicate that the Savitri River has a good population of Marsh Crocodile which is endemic to the Indian Sub-Continent. Due to suitable water parameters and terrestrial water conditions of the river, Savitri River harbours a good population of Marsh crocodiles. Marsh Crocodile are listed as Vulnerable under the IUCN conservation unit. Various strategies can be implemented for the conservation of the Marsh Crocodile species such as Crocodile Exclusion: This technique can be carried out by installing a metal fencing around proposed area in order to avoid entry of the crocodiles during the river cleaning activity.

The Authority further discussed the probable impacts of the dredging on coastal environment. Dr Anish Andheria, Expert Member raised concern about the dispersion of huge volumes of soil and dredged material while carrying out the project activities by MMB. MMB officials presented that all adequate measures will be taken to mitigate fugitive dust emission during project activities. The storage area and storage of dredged material will be sprinkled with water. Further, Expert Member raised a concern about the impact of the crocodile and their nesting sites during dredging. MMB officials presented that mitigation measures such as technique of Crocodile Exclusion as suggested in the EIA report shall be implemented.

ACS, Urban Development Dept asked views of Irrigation Dept on the proposal. Shri Dhaktode, Ex Engg, Irrigation Dept during the meeting stated that upstream side of the river is being cleaned by the irrigation dept. For effective water flow, downstream creek stretch which is in CRZ needs to be dredged for clearing of waterway.

Dr Chaube, Expert Member raised an apprehension that due to dredging, significant tidal amplitude occur in the creek and inland propagation of tidal wave. Further one of the potential consequences of the dredging may be a change in water transport and circulation pattern in the area.

Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.

Dr Chaubey advised monitoring the tidal influence in the creek need to be carried out to understand the tidal amplification in the creek and its impact on low lying areas. Further it is suggested that controlled dredging may be carried out with regular monitoring of suspended sediment concentration as well as changes in geological and morphological changes in the river.

Dr Kudale, Expert Member asked whether hydrological studies has been carried out to understand hydrodynamics of creek. Irrigation Dept officials stated that that Hydrological studies has been carried out and study suggest the deepening / clearing of the waterways.

Dr Mahesh Shindikar, Expert Member expressed that anticipating the ecological and economic role played by the creek, utmost care should be taken while carrying out dredging activity. It is suggested that mechanism of dredging should be very precise that it has minimum destruction in non-target zone. Dredging could be carried out preferably in post monsoon season

The Authority noted that the project is important for clearing of the waterway and increasing the carrying capacity of the creek. This will also help in mitigating the flooding situation in the surrounding area. However, at the same time, considering its probable adverse impacts, the Authority noted that dredging activity need to be carried out keeping in view minimum disturbance to coastal ecosystem by adhering to all possible mitigation measures. All mitigation measures & Environment Management Plan as suggested in the EIA report should be followed in letter and spirit. MMB to ensure that excess dredged material is not removed from the creek / river bed. Controlled and Precision dredging to be exercised, in order to avoid the reckless and excessive dredging, which causes adverse impact on creek bed & coastal environment. Mangroves if any should not be cut for the project activities. It is responsibility of MMB to strictly ensure that it is not sand mining driven activity and project activities aims for clearing navigational channel by maintenance dredging.

It was further noted that there are certain ongoing matters pertaining to dredging in Savitri River, before Hon'ble High Court (WP No. 2946/2021 Abdul Samad Mandelkar Vs State of Maharashtra, WP No. 3608/ 2021 Shoukat Wahab Vs State of Maharashtra, WP No. 2564/ 2022 Dilip Babaji Ukirde Vs State Of Maharashtra).

Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.

In WP No. 2564/ 2022 Dilip Babaji Ukirde Vs State Of Maharashtra, Hon'ble High Court on 14th March, 2022 has passed an order: "The Collector will personally ensure that all mechanized dredging and sand mining activities between Gat Nos.1 and 4 on the Savitri River covered by our 8th March 2022 order are stopped immediately. The contractor in question is to be joined as Respondent No.6 to this petition. Those details will be made available by Mr Thorat to Ms Singh's Advocate on record by end of the day tomorrow"

The Authority noted the above said matters and order and observed that it is the responsibility of PP and District Collector that orders of the Hon'ble High Court & Hon'ble NGT are strictly complied with.

The Authority noted that the site is located in CRZ IV B area as per approved CZMP, 2011. As per para 3(iv)(c) of CRZ, 2011: following is permitted, "maintenance or clearing of waterways, channels and ports, based on EIA studies"

As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

In the light of above, The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

1. The proposed activity should be undertaken strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
2. This CRZ recommendation is for clearing of waterways by maintenance dredging as per 3(iv) (c) of CRZ, 2011. It is to be noted that mining of sand, rocks and other sub-strata is prohibited as per para 3(x) of CRZ, 2011.
3. MMB shall carry out strict monitoring of dredging activity to ensure that it is not sand mining driven activity and aims for clearing navigational channel by maintenance dredging.

*Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone
Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.*

4. MMB to ensure that dredging should be carried out in precision and controlled manner in order to avoid excessive dredging and adverse impact on coastal environment. Dredging could be carried out preferably in post monsoon season
5. MMB should carry out monitoring of the tidal influence/ amplification to understand its impact on low lying areas around the creek.
6. Adequate measures should be implemented in order to mitigation fugitive dust emission during dredging activity. Periodic monitoring of air quality will be carried out and prompt remedial action should be undertaken in case deviations from NAAQS are recorded.
7. MMB in consultation with competent organization working in wildlife conservation shall draw a plan to protect the crocodile in the creek during dredging. NOC from wildlife point of view shall be obtained by the MMB.
8. During the maintenance dredging work all possible efforts/ measures should be taken to maintain the coastal ecology and biodiversity.
9. Mangrove if any should not be cut for the project activities. Dredging activity is not allowed in fish breeding sites.
10. Non sand/ coarse material should not be disposed in CRZ area. MMB should monitor the disposal of mud and sludge
11. MMB should ensure that emergency oil spill response plan is ready with appropriate cleanup supplies
12. The Environment Management Plan & Environment Monitoring Plan should be implemented in letter and spirit and it should be inconsonance with the surrounding ecosystem. Specific budget should be allocated for the implementation of EMP.
13. MMB to ensure that observations made in order dated 14 march, 2022 in WP No. 2564/ 2022 and other orders in WP No. WP No. 2946/2021, WP No. 3608/ 2021 and orders of Hon'ble NGT pertaining to dredging shall be strictly complied with
14. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.



Member Secretary

Page 8 of 10



Chairperson

Minutes of the 158th meeting (Day 3) meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority held on 4th May, 2022.

Item No.2: Proposed Savitri River cleaning via de-siltation process from Rajewadi to Kemburli near Mahad, District Raigad by Irrigation Dept, GoM

The Authority discussed the proposal with Irrigation Dept and MMB. After deliberation, it was decided that proposal need to be revised in accordance with provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. After receipt of the revised proposal, the same would be taken up in MCZMA meeting for further appropriate decision. Accordingly, the current matter is deferred.

Item No.3: Complaint regarding CRZ violation.

The Authority noted that that complaints were received regarding violation of CRZ notification and rules in respect of construction of bungalow names "Aadish Bungalow" CTS No. 997 & 997A of village Juhu, Mumbai.

The Authority noted that the then MOEF, New Delhi had granted CRZ clearance dated 11th June 2007 for construction of the said bungalow subject to the conditions contained therein. One of the condition imposed by the then MOEF was that the said construction should be undertaken with Floor Space Index (FSI) 1.0 as existed on 19.2.1991.

For the purpose of verifying the complaint, MCZMA had called for reports from the MCGM and is in receipt of reports dated 15th March 2022, 21st March 2022 and 29th April 2022 from the MCGM.

The Authority noted the report dated 29th April 2022 of MCGM which stated that the total unauthorised built up area currently is 1461.61 square meters which exceeds FSI 1 and thus if the unauthorized construction is taken into account the entire FSI utilization will be 2.125 (amounting to additional FSI of 1.125)

After detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided that the above reports and correspondence along with the copy of the clearance dated 11.6.2007 to be forwarded to District Coastal Zone Monitoring Committee for further action by following due process of law.

Annexure I

List of members/officials present in the online meeting:

1. Mr. Bhushan Gagrani, ACS, UDD, Member MCZMA
2. Mr. Reddy, DCF, Mangrove Cell, Member MCZMA
3. Mr. P. K. Mirashe, Representative from the Industry Dept, Member MCZMA
4. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, College of Engineering, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
5. Dr. A. K. Chaubey, Ex Regional Director NIO, Expert Member, MCZMA
6. Mr. Maruti Kudale, Ex Director, CWPRS, Expert Member, MCZMA
7. Dr. Anish Andheria, Expert Member, MCZMA
8. Mr. Sunil Bhat, Dy Chief Engineer, MCGM, representative of MCGM, member, MCZMA
9. Mr. Abhay Pimparkar, Addl Charge, Director, Environment &CC and Member Secretary, MCZMA.

-----*Meeting ended with vote of thanks to chair*-----



Member Secretary



Chairperson