## MINUTES OF THE 149th MEETING OF MAHARASHTRA COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY HELD ON 04th DECEMBER, 2020

The 149<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) was held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary (Environment). In view of present pandemic situation of COVID-19, it was decided to appraise the proposals by using information technology facilities. Hence, the proposals were appraised through Videoconferencing technology on Cisco WebEx platform on 04<sup>th</sup> December, 2020. List of members present in the meeting is at **Annexure-I**.

### Confirmation of 148th meeting:

The minutes of the 148<sup>th</sup>meeting of the MCZMA held on 24<sup>th</sup> November, 2020 are confirmed without any changes.

<u>Item No.1:</u>
Proposed residential building on plot bearing CTS No. 814 of mouje Murud, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad by Shri. Khuram Salim Damad.

The Chief Officer (CO), Murud Janjira Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of residential building comprises of Stilt parking + 1<sup>st</sup> to 3<sup>rd</sup> floor on the plot bearing S. No. 110/5/A, CTS No. 814, at Darbar Road, Murud, Dist. Raigad. The area of the plot is 1440 Sqm, Area under Residential zone is 1025 Sqm, FSI permissible is 1.00 and proposed BUA is 649.44 Sqm (FSI proposed is 0.64). The CO, MJMC stated that no construction is done on the site.

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP, the plot falls in CRZ II area and situated on landward side of existing road. The proposal was earlier considered in  $122^{nd}$  &  $133^{rd}$  meetings of MCZMA held on 30.10.2017 & 30.04.2019. The PP was absent for the meeting hence matter was deferred. PP vide letter dated 18.02.2020 requested to consider the proposal in MCZMA meeting for CRZ clearance.

The Authority noted that considering the site as in CRZ II area, construction of building could be permissible on landward side of existing road/ authorized structure subject to FSI of the town country planning regulations existed as on

1

Member Secretary

M\_kai Chairman

19.2.1991. Murud Janjira Municipal Council should strictly ensure that the proposed construction is within the limit of permissible FSI of 1991 norms.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed construction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project.
- 2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained

<u>Item No.2:</u>
Proposed reconstruction at CTS No. 897, 898, 899 of Malvan, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg by Malvan Sahakari Kharedi Vikri Sangh Ltd.

The project Proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Proposal is for reconstruction at CTS No. 897, 898, 899 of Malvan, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg. Proposed building comprises of Ground +  $1^{st}$  Floor. The Plot area is 270.00 sqm. Proposed BUA is 334.92 sqm. As per DP, the plot under reference is falls in Residential & Commercial Zone.

The proposal was earlier considered in  $133^{rd}$  meetings of MCZMA held on 30.04.2019, wherein the Authority sought certain details from the PP and deferred the proposal. Accordingly, the PP vide letter dated 11.01.2020 submitted reply stating that present use of the existing structure on plot under reference is for storage of fertilizers. Proposed construction of lodging & boarding on plot under reference by demolishing existing structure. The site falls in CRZ II area as per approved CZMP.

The PP presented that there is old structure as Khat(fertilizer) Godown. Now, the Malvan Sahakari Kharedi Vikri Sangh has proposed the lodging & boarding on the site under reference.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Sindhudurg District the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II area (within 100 m from Malvan Bay) and landward

Member Secretary

M\_Rau Chairman

side of existing road. It was further noted that reconstruction of building could be permissible subject to FSI of the town country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991. Malvan Municipal Council should strictly ensure that the proposed construction is within the limit of permissible FSI of 1991 norms.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed construction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project.
- 2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained

Item No.3:Construction of residential and commercial project at Plot No.7A, Sector 13, Sanpada, Navi Mumbai by Shri. Ram Vora, M/s.Nivasti Developers LLP.

The Authority noted that the proposal pertains to Construction of residential and commercial project at Plot No. 7A, Sector 13, Sanpada, Navi Mumbai. As per the remarks of the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (NNMC), development permission was granted on 7.6.2018 for the proposal by the NMMC. The site is situated outside CRZ as per the CZMP approved under CRZ Notification, 1991. The PP has submitted the CRZ map (1:4000 scale) of the IRS, Chennai, as per which site falls outside CRZ area as per approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 1991. However, now, as per approved CZMP of Navi Mumbai under 2011, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II and landward side of existing road. The PP has started construction on the site.

The Authority noted that the MCZMA vide letter dated 18<sup>th</sup> November, 2020 has sought a guidance from the MoEF regarding the said ongoing projects which were not in CRZ as per old approved CZMP under CRZ Notification 1991 and falling CRZ area as per CZMP approved under CRZ Notification, 2011. Reply from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi is awaited in the matter. The Authority informed the same to PP during the meeting.

Member Secretary

M\_Ray Chairman

The Authority after deliberation decided that once the necessary guidance from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi is received in the matter, the matter would be decided appropriately. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

<u>Item No.4:</u>
Construction of residential building on plot bearing S. No. 126/6, C. S. No. 616 & 617 of Mouje Murud, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad by Shri. Vasant Gajanan Kaulkar.

The Chief Officer, Murud Janjira Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. The matter pertains to construction of residential building comprises of ground + first floor on plot bearing S. No. 126/6, C.S.No. 616 & 617 of Mouje Murud, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad. As per the Development plan of Murud -Janjira, the plot under reference is falls in residential zone. Total plot area is 648.00 sqm, total proposed built up area is 51.11sqm and permissible FSI is 1.00. The CO, Murud further stated that construction is done on the site by the PP.

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP of 2011, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II area & is situated on landward side of existing road.

The proposal was earlier considered in  $142^{nd}$  meeting of MCZMA held on 31.12.2019. The project proponent was absent for the meeting. PP vide letter dated 02.03.2020 requested not to delist the proposal from MCZMA record and consider in MCZMA meeting for CRZ clearance.

The Authority noted that as per para 6.(d) of the CRZ Notification, 2011:

"The dwelling units of the traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk, tribals as were permissible under the provisions of the CRZ notification, 1991, but which have not obtained formal approval from concerned authorities under the aforesaid notification shall be considered by the respective Union territory CZMAs and the dwelling units shall be regularized subject to the following condition, namely-

- (i) these are not used for any commercial activity
- (ii) these are not sold or transferred to non-traditional coastal community"

The Authority discussed since, the construction has been carried out on the site, it needs to be verified whether the proposal fits into the criteria laid down in the above said para 6(d) of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

Member Secretary

M Rau Chairman

The Authority after deliberation decided that the report from the District Collector Raigad would be required on following points:

- a) Whether the PP belongs to traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk, tribals.
- b) Whether the construction is started prior to 6.1.2011.
- c) Whether the construction on the site is for residential use and not for any commercial purpose.
- d) Whether residential dwelling unit is not sold or transferred to non-traditional coastal community

Accordingly, the matter was deferred for submission of the compliance as stated above.

<u>Item No.5:</u>

Proposed construction of first floor of residential building on plot bearing S. No. 96, H. No. 4, C. S. No. 1744 of Mouje Murud, Tal. Murud, Dist. Raigad by Shri. Ramesh Dashrath Gurav.

The Chief Officer (CO), Murud Janjira Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. There was old dilapidated structure of the year 1979, which was demolished for construction of the ground floor structure. Now, first floor construction is proposed on the site. Total plot area is 58.20 sqm, existing ground floor BUA is 24.93 sqm and proposed first floor BUA is 24.93 sqm. The CO further informed that the ground floor structure was built in the year 2013.

As per the approved CZMP of 2011, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II area & is situated on landward side of existing road.

The Authority noted that as per para 6.(d) of the CRZ Notification, 2011:

"The dwelling units of the traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk, tribals as were permissible under the provisions of the CRZ notification, 1991, but which have not obtained formal approval from concerned authorities under the aforesaid notification shall be considered by the respective Union territory CZMAs and the dwelling units shall be regularized subject to the following condition, namely-

- (i) these are not used for any commercial activity
- (ii) these are not sold or transferred to non-traditional coastal community"

Member Secretary

Chairman Rou

The Authority after deliberation decided that the report from the District Collector Raigad would be required on following points:

- a) Whether the PP belongs to traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk, tribals
- b) Whether the construction on the site is for residential use and not for any commercial purpose.
- c) Whether residential dwelling unit is not sold or transferred to non-traditional coastal community

Accordingly, the matter was deferred for submission of the compliance as stated above. The Authority further noted that once CRZ Notification, 2019 comes in effect, appropriate decision on the matter would be taken in light of report from the District Collector.

<u>Item No.6:</u> Proposed construction on land bearing plot no. 93-B, Sector no. 14, GES Koperkhairne, Navi Mumbai by M/s B. K. Enterprises

The Authority noted that the proposal is for construction on land bearing plot no. 93-B, Sector no. 14, GES Koperkhairne, Navi Mumbai. The NMMC mentions that, as per sanctioned Development Plan the plot under reference is situated in Residential Zone. Area of Plot is 100 Sqm, Permissible FSI is 1.50 and proposed BUA is 147.112 sqm. NMMC mentions that, the plot under reference is situated in CRZ-II and situated on landward side of existing road.

The Authority noted the proposal was earlier discussed in 139<sup>th</sup> and 144<sup>th</sup> meeting held on 05.011.2019 and 11.6.2020 respectively. The NMMC vide letter dated 21.12.2019 mentioned that the plot fall in CRZ II as per approved CZMP of 2011 and not affected by mangroves & its 50 m buffer zone.

The MCZMA in its 144<sup>th</sup> meeting on 11.06.2020 recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of certain conditions. One of the conditions is: "PP to obtain the Mangrove Cell NoC certifying that the proposed construction is outside 50 meter mangrove buffer zone area."

The Authority further noted that the Mangrove Cell vide letter dated 17.09.2020 mentions that site visit held on 19.02.2020 & submitted its report to MCZMA, as per which,

1) GPS Readings of proposed site:

N - 19540.43, E-7303.17

Member Secretary

M Rou Chairman

- N 19540.44, E- 7303.37
- N 19539.98, E-7303.48
- N 19539.94, E- 7303.27
- 2) The proposed site is about 30 m from the Notified Reserve Forest.
- 3) No mangroves species was found in the proposed site.
- 4) The proposed site does not fall within the 50 m buffer zone of any mangrove tree.

The Authority discussed that MCZMA in its 144<sup>th</sup> meeting on 11.06.2020 has already recommended the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority with a condition of Mangrove Cell NoC. Now, the limited issue before the Authority is observations of the report of the Mangroves Cell, which states that proposed site is about 30 m from the notified reserve forest. However, the report further states that no mangroves species was found in the proposed site. The proposed site does not fall within the 50 m buffer zone of any mangrove tree.

The Authority discussed the report of the mangrove Cell. During the meeting, the Member from the mangrove Cell clarified that as per High Court order dated 18.9.2018 in PIL 87/2006: "Regardless of ownership of the land having mangroves and the area of the land, all constructions taking place within 50 metres on all sides of all mangroves areas shall be forthwith stopped. The area of 50 meters shall be kept free of construction except construction of a compound wall/fencing for its protection".

The Mangrove Cell Member further stated that presently, the proposed construction is not affected by mangrove or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone area, hence there would not be violation of above said High Court order. Hence, the project could be allowed. The Authority took note of the above stated submissions of the Mangrove Cell and decided that recommendation letter could be issued to PP, as decided in the 144<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Item No.7: Proposed electric substation and laying electric cable at Plot No. B1, Survey No. 21, Hissa No. 1, CTS No. 1071, Opp. Hotel Seagate, Gorai beach road, village Gorai, Borivali West, Mumbai by Mr. Anil Parshuram Kadtarkar

The Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for electric substation and laying electric cable at Plot No. B1, Survey No. 21, Hissa No. 1, CTS No. 1071, Opp. Hotel Seagate, Gorai beach road, village

Member Secretary

M. Rou Chairman

Gorai, Borivali West, Mumbai. It was presented that due to increase in demand of Electricity in the Vicinity, commissioning of new substation is required. The PP presented that there are no mangrove on the site.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP the plot under reference is situated in CRZ-III (within 200 m from HTL i.e. NDZ)

The Authority noted that as per para 8.III. CRZ-III of CRZ Notification, 2011, following is permissible in CRZ III (NDZ):

(j) construction of dispensaries, schools, public rain shelter, community toilets, bridges, roads, provision of facilities for water supply, drainage, sewerage, crematoria, cemeteries and electric sub-station which are required for the local inhabitants may be permitted on a case to case basis by CZMA;

The Authority noted that the project is an Essential public utility required for local inhabitants of the Gorai and permission could be granted from CRZ point of view.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. No construction is allowed in mangroves or its 50 m buffer zone area.
- 2. Excavated material should not be dumped in the CRZ area.
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.8: Proposed construction of solid waste management project on plot bearing S. No. 7/1, C. S. No. 1303(pt) at Alibag, Dist. Raigad by Alibag Municipal Council.

The Chief Officer, Alibaug Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. The CO presented that the Solid Waste Management (SWM) Project under Swachha Bharat Mission is proposed by the Municipal Council. The project is proposed on plot bearing S. No. 7/1, C. S. No. 1303(pt) at Alibag, Dist. Raigad. As per Development Plan, the site under reference has Reservation No. 53 i.e. Solid Waste Management. Area of the land is admeasuring 1120 Sqm. The Alibaug Municipal Council has submitted the detailed project report for the project.

Member Secretary

M. Rau Chairman

The Authority noted that the proposal was considered in the 142<sup>nd</sup> meeting of MCZMA held on 31.12.2019, wherein it was observed that since the site was situated within 50 m mangrove buffer zone, the Alibaug Municipal Council need to explore other site for the project.

However, the Alibaug Municipal Council vide letter dated 16.10.2020 submitted its reply stating that proposed site is situated beyond 50 m mangrove buffer zone as per approved CZMP of Alibaug of 2011. Following activities are proposed in the project-

- 1) Barbed Wire Fencing & Green area
- 2) Road
- 3) Sheds for sorting / processing
- 4) Drainage Works
- 5) Weight Bridge Room
- 6) Fire Extinguisher
- 7) Weight Bridge
- 8) Back Hoe Loader for processing & disposal
- 9) Development of simple landfill
- 10)Leachate evaporation tank
- 11) Bio mining of Old dumped waste.

The CO, Alibaug Municipal Council during the meeting submitted that the site is situated beyond 50 m mangrove buffer zone and situated in CRZ II area. He further stated that the project does not involve dumping of the waste on the site, instead treatment of the MSW is proposed. Considering the necessity of the project to resolve the issue of unscientific dumping of the solid waste, He requested the MCZMA to grant the CRZ approval for the project,

The Authority noted that the project is under Swach Bharat Mission and aims to scientifically process the Municipal solid waste of the Alibaug city. It is a public interest project and will help in resolving the issue of the management of the Municipal Solid waste, thereby creating healthy environmental conditions for the residents of the Alibaug town. The Authority suggested that no activities should be proposed within mangroves or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone area, as committed by the Alibaug Municipal Council during the meeting.

The Authority noted that as per para 3(v) of CRZ, 2011, following is permissible:

Member Secretary

M-Raw Chairman

facilities required for,-(c) treatment of waste and effluents arising from hotels, beach resorts and human settlements located in CRZ areas other than CRZ-I and disposal of treated wastes and effluents.

In the light of above, The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the project from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure that MSW facility should carry out scientific processing, treatment and disposal of the Municipal Solid waste. In no case, dumping or littering of waste is allowed at the site. In the event of non-compliance, the Municipal Council would be liable for action and responsible for environmental compensation.
- 2. The proposed activities should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 as amended from time to time.
- 3. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure zero spillage of the garbage during transportation and compliance of MSW (M& H) Rules, 2000.
- 4. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure that no activities should be proposed within mangroves or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone area.
- 5. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure the measures for preventing leachate into coastal water or ecosystem surrounding the area. Leachate from the facility shall be collected and treated in leachate treatment plant to meet the prescribed standards.
- 6. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure that no garbage is burned on the dumping ground.
- 7. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure all the measures/efforts are taken to control odour nuisance. Prevention and minimization of odor generation through better housekeeping should be ensured. Biological control of odour nuisance need to be explored by the Council.
- 8. There shall be not be drawl of ground water in the project. Appropriate measures should be implemented to avoid the percolation of the leachate in ground water. The Municipal Council to periodically monitor the ground water quality and report should be submitted to MPCB.
- 9. Alibaug Municipal Council to ensure the regular sprinkling of water for control of fugitive dust.
- 10. Alibaug Municipal Council to carry out air quality monitoring in and around the site. Green belt to be developed around the MSW facility so as to mitigate the air pollution and mitigation of odour nuisance.
- 11. All the other statutory clearances/ approvals shall be obtained from competent Authority before commencement of project activities.

Member Secretary

M—Row Chairman

Item No.9:

Proposed Captive Jetty, conveyor corridor & approach road for Raigad cement blending plant in Amra River near village Shahbaj, Tal. Alibaug, Dist. Raigad by M/s. Adani cementation Ltd.

The Project Proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. Adami Cementation Limited (ACL) has proposed to construct Captive Jetty, Conveyor Corridor with Storage & Backup Facilities of 5 Million Tonnes Per Annum (MTPA) capacity and Approach Road for a Cement Bulk Terminal (CBT) at Village Shahbaj and Shahpur of Alibaug Taluk in Raigad District.

The proposed jetty will consist of a berth head, breasting dolphins, mooring dolphins, approach trestle. About 2 Ha water front area will be used for jetty and 1.5 Ha river bank will be used for conveyor corridor and approach road. Proposed berthing facilities will handle dry cargo like fly ash, slag and cement.

The port facilities shall be developed in a phased manner (phase I & phase II) commensurate with traffic growth. The cargo to be handled at the jetty includes Ordinary Portland Cement (OPC) and Fly Ash. These materials will brought from Gujrat by Ships (Barges) to the Jetty and thereafter by pipe conveyor upto the blending unit site.

- 1) Phase I One number of barge berth having total length of 160m & 25m wide having mechanized handling system of 1000 TPH for cement import and 400 TPH for fly ash/slag import.
  - i. Approx. 400m of approach trestle connecting landside facilities to jetty
  - ii. Development of cement blending unit in non CRZ area.
  - iii. Captive jetty, plant approach road and the right of way of conveyor between jetty and blending unit in CRZ area.
  - iv. Approx. 500m of conveyor connecting from jetty to cement blending plant area
  - v. Dredging in berth pocket area
  - vi. unloading mechanism at jetty: self-discharging vessel/mechanized unloading
  - vii. support back up infrastructure for operations and maintenance of the proposed facilities

Member Secretary

M Law Chairman

2) Phase II - Three numbers of additional barge berths having total length of 460m and 25m wide 500m of pneumatic discharge pipe/conveyor connecting from jetty to cement blending plant area backup area development incremental supporting infrastructure

The proposed jetty for development of Bulk handling terminal is "L" Shaped with required approach length. The cargo complexion under dry bulk includes Cement, Clinker, Slag, Coal, AFR and Fly ash for the captive terminal. As the transfer of dry bulk between berths and stockyard is through conveyors, berth will not require contiguity with land. The access to the shore for operations and maintenance is provided through trestle connecting the berths to the onshore area.

Overall both phases comprises of four berths (620 m) to meet the traffic demand. Berths will have depth of 6 m in-front of the berths approx. 435 m of approach trestle connecting from onshore to jetty is also planned. The minimum width of the berth, keeping in view the rail span of the ship loaders, service ducts and the end clearances should be about 35 m. Considering the equipment selection, width of berth may be optimized during detailing stage.

The approach trestle will connect the land side of facilities to jetty area. The length of approach trestle is about 435 m. Construction of 435 m long approach will be with RCC deck supported Bored Cast-in situ pile foundation.

An approach road of around 150 m distance between CBT and Zilla Parishad Road shall be constructed with a Pipe culvert to connect Conveyor and Backup Facility of Captive Jetty area.

Minimal dredging will be required in front of proposed berthing area. The indicative level capital dredging estimates work out to 60,000 m3 for entire berthing area. The dredge material will be utilized for area development. It is proposed to raise and develop the approach road and CBT area to raise the ground level (GL). Dredged material from construction dredging will be utilized for raising the GL.

The PP has submitted the Marine Environmental Impact Assessment Study report, Risk Assessment & Disaster Management Plan. The ToR has been granted by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi and application for Forest Clearance also submitted. The alternatives of the project alignment have been studied.

Member Secretary

M\_Rou Chairman

The Authority noted that, as per the CRZ map in 1:4000 scale prepared by IRS, Chennai, the site under reference is falls in CRZ IA, CRZ III, CRZ-IVB area& Non CRZ area.

Activity	Category				
Jetty	CRZ - IVB (Creek Area)				
Conveyor Corridor & Approach Road	CRZ - IA (Mangroves & 50 m buffer zone) & CRZ-III (Rural area)				
Cement Blending Plant	Non CRZ area				

The Authority noted that the proposal was earlier deliberated in the  $132^{nd}\&145^{th}$  meeting of MCZMA held on 24.4.2019&07.07.2020. In  $132^{nd}$  meeting, site visit report was sought.

Accordingly, the site visit of Mangrove Cell was held on 23.10.2019 & following observations were made during the site visit:

- 1) The Geo-coordinates received from the PP was verified.
  - a) Conveyor corridor  $-18^{\circ}42'40.10"N$ ,  $73^{\circ}01'03.83"E$ ,  $18^{\circ}42'40.15"N'$   $73^{\circ}01'03.28"E$ ,  $18^{\circ}42'52.10"N'$   $73^{\circ}01'03.80"E$ ,  $18^{\circ}42'52.68"N'$   $73^{\circ}01'03.26"E$
  - b) Approach Road- 18°42'24.95"N, 73°01'11.91"E, 18°42'24.56"N' 73°01'11.57"E, 18°42'25.46"N '73°01'10.96"E, 18°42'25.77"N' 73°01'11.37"E
- 2) The proposed construction is located in the survey No. 346 in village shahbaj and survey No.600, 602 in village Shahpur Taluka Alibaug which is having the status of Mangrove reserve forest as per the MRSAC map.
- 3) Proposed construction is passing through the Reserve forest and Mangrove area and hence cutting of the mangrove trees (minimum 150 trees/shrubs approximately) are involved.
- 4) A dense mangrove dominated by *Avicennia marina* was observed. The PP has to obtain the required permission from Forest Department for the diversion of forest land.
- 5) As the proposed site is also passing through the 50-meter buffer area of the mangrove forest, the PP has to obtain required permission from the honorable High Court, Mumbai.

Member Secretary

M Rou Chairman

In the 145<sup>th</sup> meeting, the Authority decided that PP need to explore other site for the project activities along with matrix of alternatives, considering the existence of mangroves at the site. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

Pursuant to above said decision of the MCZMA, the PP submitted that 6 nos. of alternative prospective sites were identified and assessed with a view to minimize cutting of mangrove tree / shrubs falling in the conveyor corridor connective captive jetty & cement plant and approach road.

Sr		Evaluation of sites, Tangible parameters						
No	Descriptio n	Site -1	Site -2	Site -3	Site -4	Site -5	Site -6	
1	Proximity to water front for sourcing raw material	Adjacent to North bank of Amba River	Adjace nt to South bank of Amba River	Adjacen t to South bank of Amba River	Adjace nt to South bank of Amba River	Adjace nt to South bank of Amba River	Adjacent to North bank of Amba River	
2	Proximity to highway to dispatch of finished goods (km)	~ 10 km from NH 166A, approach passing through 3 habitation Units	~ 1.5 km from NH 166 <i>A</i>	~ 0.5 km from NH 166 <i>A</i>	~ 2 km from NH 166 <i>A</i>	~ 3 km from NH 166A & approac h passing throug h 2 rivulets	~ 9 km from NH 166A & approach passing through 3 habitation units	
3	Proximity to nearest settlement s (km)	~ 5 km from MasadBudr uk village	~ 2 km from Shahba j village	1.5 km from Shahbaj village	~ 2 km from Shahba j village	~ 2.5 km from Shahba j village	~ 4 km from MasadBudr uk village	
4	Safety to Barge Navigation	> 5.0 m of draft available	> 5.0 m of draft availabl e	Infringi ng railway / road bridges	> 5.0 m of draft availabl e	> 5.0 m of draft availabl e	> 5.0 m of draft available	

Member Secretary

M. Low Chairman

				on Amba River			
5	Mangroves RF falling in Conveyor corridor / approach road	Present (Length 500 m approx.)	Present (Length 410 m approx.	Present (Length 580 m approx.)	Present (Length 650 m approx.	Present (Length 580 m approx.	Present (Length 540 m approx.)
6	Proximity from NP/WLS/ AM is any	Outside 15 km radius	Outsid e 15 km radius	Outside 15 km radius	Outsid e 15 km radius	Outsid e 15 km radius	Outside 15 km radius
	Rank	III	I	II	IV	V	VI

Among all prospective sites, Site No. 2 requires minimum cutting of mangroves to gain access to water front in Amba River.

The PP has submitted Action Plan to minimize cutting of mangrove during construction stage, Action Pan to mitigate adverse impact on mangroves during operation stage, Compensation Plan of 10 times of mangroves.

The Authority noted the anticipated impacts of the proposed activities on the coastal environment. Mitigation measures prescribed in the comprehensive EIA report, which are as follows:

- The clean, efficient and aesthetic construction techniques have to be adopted at offshore for the construction of piles. The technique adopted should not stir up the bed material in the water body while driving the piles.
- The construction and operation of jetty will not show the variation of temperature in water bodies. Only barge movement will be occurred in the channel. There will be no discharge of waste in to water bodies during construction and operation phases. So, there will be no major impact on Intertidal species and their communities.
- Any kind of damming by rubbles or sheet piles either across the surf zone or at nearshore have to be avoided which otherwise would affect the flow of water and movement of sediment.
- The scrap and waste construction materials should not be thrown into the seawater.

Member Secretary

M Rou Chairman

- The bentonite clay or any other construction materials including chemical compounds should not be released into the sea.
- One of the most practical solutions to control the effects of pile driving operations is the use of 'air bubble curtain (ABC)'. Using an ABC will inhibit sound transmission through water due to the reflection and absorption of the sound waves by the small bubbles. The rising curtain of tightly spaced bubbles acts as a damper and can absorb the shock waves. The bubble curtain deployed for the duration of piling activity showed that its use resulted in noise reductions of 50% 70%. There are other methods such as strobe light fish deterrent systems, rubber or foam bladders wrapped around the pile and large-coverage bubble mats installed on the seafloor which also proved useful to lower the acoustic waves. However, bubble curtain emerged as the most effective one in both performance and cost effectiveness.
- In order to minimize destruction on sub-tidal benthic community while dredging, the dredging may be carried out in controlled manner confined to only jetty area.
- The turbidity induced during the dredging can be minimized using controlled dredging techniques using appropriate cuter suction dredgers.
- The net enclosures with booms may be placed around the dredging area in order to control the spread of the turbid plume.
- monitoring of the turbidity and sediment concentration may be carried out
- The dredge material can be used for reclamation to increase the level of cement bulk terminal and after the suitable level obtained the dredge waste has to be disposed at designated offshore location.
- When dredged materials are disposed at offshore locations, the dumping should be carried out in sequence over the designated areas at different grids after allowing sufficient time between two dumps. This will help the sediments from the first dump to settle before the second dump commences. This way, the suspended load can be maintained at low level and the chance of sediments reaching far-fields is minimized.
- It is a good practice to promote the beneficial use (shore protection /nourishment) if sand and silt fractions are present in the dredged material.
- Further to minimize the impacts of dredging and disposal, proper timings have to be selected i.e. (i) selection of most favourable points in the tidal cycle to limit the extent of effects. (ii) avoiding sensitive periods /breeding season for fishes and marine animals.
- Although dense distribution of mangroves are noticed in 10 km radius within 1 km distance from proposed jetty only along the banks of Amba river.

Member Secretary

M. kou Chairman

Beyond HTL it is barren land with wild vegetation. Conveyor corridor and Approach Road (covering 0.6497 Ha. Mangrove Forest out of total 1.3 Ha. required area) will be constructed in such a way that there will be some minimal disturbance to the mangroves.

- The engineering structure of diameter and spacing between piles are to be designed in such a way that it will not cause any damage to existing mangroves.
- Afforestation of mangrove forest is necessary by the user agency for the loss of mangroves. It is suggested to take up an afforestation measures along with the forest department of Maharashtra on the suitable location near to the proposed Jetty in the intertidal region.
- Marking of boundaries along the creek to avoid disturbance to mangroves due to movement of workers and construction activities.
- Brief the workers and contractors on the importance of mangroves to restrict the unwanted Damage and no debris should be allowed to disposed in and around mangrove
- Oil spill contingency plan should be evaluated to handle accidental spill. Oil spill contingency equipment like boom, skimmer, and dispersant chemicals should be stored. Oil Contingency Team headed by a trained expert should be established at port and all arrangements should form as an integral part of the specialized team. They should establish coordination with National Oil spill Committee headed by the Indian Navy. As Dharamtar port is nearby they may have to develop a joint action plan for any emergency and the resources can be shared, if possible.

As per the EIA report, findings of the study indicate that the fishing resources were low to moderate in the project region. Direct impacts to fisheries resources and fishing operations from habitat loss due to construction of Jetty are regarded as low. The fishing activity is seen only from the Amba river confluence with Arabian Sea. Therefore, there will not be any impact for fishermen or the fishing boats moving in this region.

The Authority noted that as per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities.

The project / activity is covered in Category -A of Item 7 (e) i.e. 'Ports,' Harbours, Breakwater, Dredging' of the schedule of the EIA Notification, 2006.

Member Secretary

M\_kar Chairman

The Authority further noted the order dated 18th Sep, 2018 in PIL 87/2006 passed by the Hon'ble High Court of Mumbai. The Authority noted that as per submission of the PP, project would be commenced after securing all the other necessary clearances from various Government authorities including prior clearance from the High Court. It was further submitted that the proposed project would bring employment opportunity in the surrounding area thereby benefiting the local public. As committed, the PP shall plant the 10 times the number of mangroves affected due to project, with the help of Forest Department.

The Authority noted that as per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011, construction and operation for jetties is a permissible activity. Further, from the presentation of the PP, the Authority observed that transportation of the cement via sea/ creek route is comparatively more fuel efficient & greener option than mode of road/ railway transport, particularly with respect to curb of carbon emission and decongestion of the road traffic. It was further noted that the project involves fully mechanized handing of material using fully enclosed belt conveyor. Fully enclosed conveyor will ensure spill proof/leak proof transport of the material, thereby restricting the fugitive emissions to minimum level, during Operation & Maintenance of the plant. The Expert Member, during the discussion suggested that the PP should carry out simultaneous monitoring of the impact of the project activities on the surrounding area and accordingly, implement the mitigation plan & environment management plan for the protection of the coastal environment. In addition to this, the PP need to obtain all other required permissions like Forest Clearance, Mangrove Cell NoC, High Court approval, MPCB, MoEF&CC, new Delhi for the project

In the light of above, after detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF&CC, New Delhi subject to strict compliance of following conditions:

- 1. The proposed activities should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 as amended from time to time.
- 2. Project proponent should implement Mitigation measures and Environment Management plan as stipulated in the EIA report, effectively and efficiently during construction and operational phase of the project to ensure that coastal environment is protected.
- 3. PP should carry out simultaneous monitoring of the impact of the project activities on the surrounding area and accordingly, implement the mitigation

Member Secretary

M Rau Chairman

plan & environment management plan for the protection of the coastal environment.

- 4. PP to ensure that mangroves cutting should be restricted to minimum. Spacing between piles of conveyor corridor should be designed in such a way that it will have minimum footprint in the mangroves area. Adequate Culverts/ channels should be provided at appropriate locations while constructing approach road so as to ensure the free movement of the tidal water in the mangrove vegetation.
- 5. PP to ensure that no reclamation shall be carried out at the two creeklets present near the project location. Free flow of the creeklets should not be blocked, during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 6. PP to ensure that the dredging should be carried out in controlled manner confined to only jetty area.
- 7. Cement plant should be located outside CRZ area, as proposed by the PP. Proper care and effective measures should be taken to avoid spillages or fugitive emission of the material from the backup storage facilities. Conveyor belt should be fully enclosed to ensure zero spillage of the transport material.
- 8. Green Belt should be developed around the backup storage facilities so as to mitigate the air pollution due to fugitive emission. Trucks/Vehicles should be properly covered during the transportation to avoid spillage of the material.
- 9. PP to obtain the NoC from the mangrove cell. Compensatory afforestation of the mangroves 10 times should be carried out with the help of the forest Dept, as committed by the PP.
- 10. PP to obtain the Forest clearance under Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980 for diversion of the forest land.
- 11. PP to obtain the prior High Court permission since, the project involve cutting of the mangroves.
- 12. PP to ensure Oil spill contingency plan should be formulated and implemented to handle accidental oil spill.
- 13. Vessel Ships/ barges will not be permitted to discharge wastes, treated or untreated effluents in the creek, PP to have monitoring plan to check creek water quality and accordingly implement appropriate mitigation measures.
- 14.PP to install the Sewage Treatment plant (STP) for the treatment of the domestic waste water treatment at backup infrastructure facility.
- 15. The construction debris and dredged material should not be disposed off in the mangrove area & creek water to avoid any adverse impact on mangroves and marine water quality.

Member Secretary

Mhau Chairman

- 16. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 17.PP to ensure that best industrial practices should be followed for fire safety measures and for conservation of coastal environment
- 18.PP to ensure that movement of the fishermen boats should not be obstructed due to project activities.
- 19. All other required permissions from different statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of work.

Item No.10: Proposed protection of existing retaining wall from Lotus jetty to Chota Hazi Ali by relocating available tetrapod by MCGM/PWD

The DMC, MCGM presented the matter before the Authority. It was presented that the matter involves transportation and relocation of the tetrapods from the Hazi Ali to at seawall near Lotus jetty (stretch from lotus jetty to Chota Haji Ali near Samudra Mahal apartment) and seawall Mahim Coast (Mahim Darga to Shioposvadi, Mahim). The DMC, MCGM further clarified that the said activity is not related to coastal road project.

Harbour engineer, PWD stated that the two locations for relocation of the tetrapod at Hazi Ali were identified by the PWD. Placement of the tetrapod should be accordingly to cross section of the CWPRS. PWD has granted the approval for the same.

The Authority asked the MCGM & PWD whether the strengthening of the sea wall at lotus jetty and Mahim coast is also proposed. DMC, MCGM informed that separate proposal would be submitted for strengthening of the seawall. The current matter before the Authority is only for transportation and relocation of the tetrapods as stated above.

The Authority after deliberation decided that transportation and relocation of tretrapods from the Hazi Ali as per recommendations of the CWPRS to two locations i.e. near lotus jetty and Mahim coast could be allowed only. MCGM to apply separately for strengthening of the seawall which will be considered separately by the MCZMA.

Member Secretary

M-heu Chairman

#### Discussion item:

The Authority noted that, the financial powers for issuing cheques up to 1 Lakh was with the Member Secretary, MCZMA with approval of Chairperson MCZMA. Considering Ease of Doing Business & smooth functioning, the Authority decided that henceforth, cheques upto Rs. 10 Lakh towards expenses of the MCZMA would be issued with the signature of the Member Secretary, MCZMA, on approval of the Chairman, MCZMA.

------Meeting ended with vote of thanks------

#### Annexure I

List of members/officials present in the online meeting:

- 1. Mrs. Neenu Somraj, DCF, Mangrove Cell, Member MCZMA
- 2. Mr. Padmakar Nandushekhar, Environment Advisor, MIDC, representative of Industries Department, Member MCZMA
- 3. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, College of Engineering, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 4. Dr. A. K. Chaubey, NIO, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 5. Mr. Maruti Kudale, Ex Director, CWPRS, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 6. Dr. M. S. Khot, Principal, Chhatrapati Sambhaji Raje Sainik School, Ratnagiri, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 7. Mr. Narendra Toke, Director, Environment, Member Secretary, MCZMA

Member Secretary

Khau 'Chairman