

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

MINUTES OF THE 147th MEETING OF MAHARASHTRA COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY HELD ON 27th and 28th OCTOBER, 2020

The 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) was held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary (Environment). In view of present pandemic situation of COVID-19, it was decided to appraise the proposals by using information technology facilities. Hence, the proposals were appraised through Videoconferencing technology on Cisco WebEx platform on 27th and 28th October, 2020. List of members present in the meeting is at **Annexure-I**.

Confirmation of 146th meeting:

The minutes of the 146th meeting of the MCZMA held on 2nd September, 2020 are confirmed without any changes.

Item No.1: Proposed Storm Water Drainage project for Mira Bhayandar Municipal Corporation area under the Amrut Mission by Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation (MBMC)

Officials of Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation presented the proposal before the Authority. The MBMC has proposed construction of storm water drainage under Amrut Mission. Location of the proposed Nalla are as follows:

- 1) Nalla in front of Saint Thome school towards khadi at Kankiya Road (Nalla No. 12A)
- 2) Nalla from Om Sai Complex back side nalla towards Jay Ambe Nagar No. 1 towards creek, Bhaindar (W) (Nalla no.3)
- 3) Nalla from Uttan Naka Fish Market to Pali, Uttan (Nalla No. FN 2)
- 4) Nalla from Krantinagar toilet towards Bajarangnagar, Bhaindar (W) (Nalla No.3B)
- 5) Nalla from Saint Josef School towards Srushti Bridge, Mira Road (E) (Nalla No. 28)

The Authority noted that the proposal was deliberated in the 121st meeting held on 16-17.9.2017, wherein the Authority directed the PP to revise the plans in such a way that mangrove are not destroyed/ cut for the proposed work. Further, the PP to redesign the plan to ensure that saline water ingress is not stopped in mangrove area. Alignment should be avoided in CRZ I area.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

In light of decision taken in the 121st meeting, MBMC has revised the alignment of nalla and no construction in mangrove area is proposed:

Sr. No.	Nalah No.	CRZ Classification in meter				
		Earlier Proposal		Revised proposal		
		CRZ I	Buffer Zone	CRZ I	Buffer Zone	CRZ II
1	Nalah No. 12A	-	1440	-	1440	-
2	Nalah No. 3	3780	-	-	3780	-
3	Nalah No. FN2	6490	1030	-	7520	-
4	Nalah No. 3b	265	400	-	665	-
5	Nalah No. 28	4600	570	-	3370	830

The Authority noted that in 131st meeting of MCZMA held on 06.03.2019, the Authority deliberated the proposal in detail. It was observed that realignment of nallas proposed by the MBMC may obstruct the tidally flow of water in mangrove patches, leading to its destruction due to stoppage of tidal ingress in them. Further, it was noted that there is a complaint pertaining to alleged CRZ violations in the realignment of Nallas. The Authority further observed that the Mangrove cell may make site visit. Mangrove cell shall confirm that necessity of the project and tidal flow of coastal water body should not be hampered due to proposed activities and also take cognizance of complaints received in the matter.

The Authority noted that the Mangrove Cell conducted site visit on 13.12.2019 for the Proposed Storm Water Drainage Project for the MBMC under the AMRUT Mission. The observations are as given below:

1) Nalah No. 12A:

Nalla in Front Of Saint Thomas School To Wards Khadi. At Kankiya Road- No Mangrove cutting is involved in the proposed site. The permission from Honourable High Court is required as it is passing through the 50-meter buffer area.

2) Nalah No. 3:

Nalla from Om Sai Complex Back Side Nalla Towards lay Ambe Nagar No.1 towards Creek, Bhaindar (W). No Mangrove cutting is involved in the proposed site. The permission from Honourable High Court is required as it is passing through the 50-meter buffer area.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

3) Nalah No. FN2:

Nalla from Uttan Naka Fish Market to Pali, Uttan. It was observed that some mangrove trees of *Avicennia marina* species have grown in the nallah and created obstruction for the smooth flow of sewage water hence the area is frequently getting flooded. It is recommended to construct the Nallah after obtaining the permissions from the Honourable High Court.

4) Nalah No. 3b:

Nalla From Krantinagar Toilet Towards Bajarangnagar, Bhaindar (W) Mangrove cuttings are not involved. However, it is passing through the 50-meter buffer zone. It is recommended to construct the Nallah after obtaining the permissions from the Honourable High Court.

5) Nalah NO.28:

Nalla From Saint Joseph School to Wards Srushti Bridge, Mira Road (E) Mangrove cuttings are not involved. However, it is passing through the 50-meter buffer zone. It is recommended to construct the Nallah after obtaining the permissions from the Honourable High Court.

MBMC officials presented that construction of Nallas are necessary in order to avoid water logging in the surrounding area.

The Authority noted that out of 5 Nalls, only 1 Nalla (FN 2) involves cutting of around 150 mangroves, as per mangrove cell report. Rest 4 nallas are in 50 m mangrove buffer zone. As per High Court order dated 17th Sep, 2018 in PIL 87/2006, no construction is allowed in mangroves and its 50 m buffer zone area. However, projects of public good or public interest can be allowed by the Court.

The Authority further noted that

- As per para 3(v) (b) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, facilities required for storm water drains and ancillary structures for pumping is a permissible activity.
- As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,

For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006,


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal of (4) four Nallas namely, Nallas 12A, 3, 3b and 28 to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. MBMC to ensure that mangroves should not be cut for re-alignment of the Nalla.
2. MBMC to obtain prior High Court permission since the project is affected by 50 m mangrove buffer zone.
3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
4. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

The Authority felt that sub-committee of the expert members of the MCZMA would be constituted to carry out the site visit to nalla FN2. Accordingly, the Authority decided to defer the proposal of re-alignment of Nalla no. FN2

Item No.2: 1) construction of compound wall for bus Depot at Penkarpada, 2) proposed road from Morva to Uttan village road, Dist Thane by MBMC.

Officials of Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation presented the proposal before the Authority. The MBMC has proposed 1) construction of compound wall for bus Depot at Penkarpada, 2) proposed road from Morva to Uttan village road, Dist Thane.

The Authority in its 134th meeting held on 24.05.2019 discussed the proposal and observed that MBMC need to submit the proposals should be submitted with complete information along with superimposition of the activity on approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 2011. It was further discussed that there are presence of mangroves at site of Compound wall and proposed Road from: Morwa to Uttan village Road. MCZMA in its 134th meeting decided that Mangrove Cell shall make site visits to the sites, in order to ascertain presence of mangroves & its 50 m buffer zone on the site.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

The Authority noted that the Mangrove Cell conducted site visit on 13.12.2019 for proposed road from Morva to Uttan village road, Dist Thane. The observation of the mangrove Cell report is as below:

- The Project involves felling of Mangroves species like *Avicennia marina* and *Sonneratia alba*, *Sonneratia apetala* of more than 150 trees.
- The PP need to review the project to minimize cutting of the mangroves and also shall submit the proposal under Forest Conservation Act 1980
- The PP shall obtain the permission from the Honourable High Court, Mumbai before proceeding further.

The Authority noted the report of the Mangrove cell about the Morva to Uttan village road which states that 150 nos. of mangroves will be affected. PP need to review the project to minimize cutting of the mangroves. Further, the Authority noted that there is no report of Mangrove Cell submitted for compound wall project.

The Authority after deliberation decided to constitute sub-committee of the expert members of the MCZMA to carry out the site visit at the site of Morva to Uttan village road and compound wall. The sub-committee shall examine various options/ alternative alignment of the road to minimize the cutting of the mangroves.

Item No.3: 1) Proposed construction of DP Road from S. B. Maidan-Mira Road Station-Dahisar Link Road. 2) Construction of the DP Road from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL complex to Mira Road by MBMC

Officials of Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation presented the proposal before the Authority

The MBMC has proposed: 1) Proposed construction of DP Road from S. B. Maidan-Mira Road Station-Daisar Link Road. 2) Construction of the DP Road from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL complex to Mira Road.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

1) Proposed construction of DP Road of 6015 Mt from S. B. Maidan-Mira Road Station-Dahisar Link Road.

Total Length	6015 Mt.
Total Area	227700 Sqm
CRZ I (i) / buffer zone affected	60450 Sq m / 47250 Sq m
CRZ I (ii)	41250
CRZ III	67500 Sq m
Area	11250 sqm

2) Proposed widening & construction of the DP Road of 1421 Mtr from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL complex to Mira Road falls in CRZ-I(i), CRZ-III areas.

Total Length	1421 Mt
Total Area	25578 Sqm
CRZ I (i) / buffer zone	7218 Sqm / 3780 Sqm
CRZ III	4860 Sqm
Area	9900

The Authority in its 131st meeting held on 06.03.2019, decided that a site visit to be carried out by the Mangrove Cell to ascertain that whether proposed development of the DP roads will affect the mangroves and coastal biodiversity of the area.

Accordingly, the Mangrove Cell has conducted site visit on 13.12.2019 for 1) Proposed construction of DP Road from S. B. Maidan-Mira Road Station-Dahisar Link Road and widening & 2) construction of the DP Road from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL complex to Mira Road. The observations are as given below:

1) Proposed Construction of the DP Road from S.B. Maidan - Mira Road Station Dahisar Link Road.

- The Proposed alignment is across the Dhaisar Creeks and creeklets
- The Proposed alignment of road is designed on the stilt in the CRZ area
- The proposed project passes through the mangrove area and felling of the mangrove trees are required for the construction of stilts.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

- d) Number of mangrove trees cut will be calculated only after keeping the alignment on the ground. The PP has to apply under Forest Conservation Act 1980 and enumeration should be done while submitting the FCA proposal.
- e) The PP has to obtain the permission from the Honourable High-Court before proceeding with the work.
- 2) Widening of the DP Road from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL Complex to Mira Road.
- a) Phase I-A bridge of approximately 75 Meters is proposed here to cross the Nalla between NL Complex road Dhaisar in CRZ -I area. No mangrove species is observed in the proposed project site. It does not fall in 50-meter buffer zone as well. Hence the Proposed project is recommended.
- b) Phase-II- The extension of the proposed road form Penkar Pada till Tare compound of Existing DP road is through the inaccessible area it is observed that mangroves are present in the proposed site though counting was not possible. Hence the PP is advised to submit the proposal under Forest Conservation Act 1980 and also get the permission from the Honourable High Court, Mumbai before proceeding ahead.

Officials of the MBMC submitted that the DP of the MBMC is getting modified for the said roads. Final Notification to that effect is pending. Hence, the MBMC requested to defer the proposal of from S.B. Maidan - Mira Road Station Dahisar Link Road. Accordingly, the Authority after deliberation decided to defer the proposal of DP Road from S. B. Maidan-Mira Road Station-Dahisar Link Road.

The Authority noted that the MBMC has proposed DP Road of length 1421 meter from Dahisar Check Naka Tare compound, NL complex to Mira Road in 2 phases. Phase I of the said DP road of length 853 meter starts at Dahisar Check Naka Penkarpada and ends at NL Complex Dahisar (East). The Authority noted that the said Phase I stretch is not affected by mangroves and 50 m mangrove buffer zone. The Authority during the meeting asked MBMC officials, whether the construction of said phase I stretch of the DP road would be of utility. The MBMC official stated that the said phase I stretch DP road is required to decongest the severe traffic at Dahisar Check Naka. After discussion, the Authority decided that said Phase I stretch of the DP road could be allowed.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal of phase I stretch (from Dahisar Check Naka Penkarpada to NL Complex Dahisar (East) to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
4. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

The Authority further noted that Phase II start of length 568 meter start at Penkarpada to Gujrati Chawl to Bhakti Vendant Hospital, Mira Road (E). The Authority noted that mangrove are present in the proposed site of Phase II stretch of the DP road. It was discussed during the meeting that alignment of the said Phase II stretch could be shifted along the landward boundary of the mangrove in order to avoid minimum damage to mangroves. The Authority after deliberation decided to constitute sub-committee of the expert members of the MCZMA to carry out the site visit for the phase II stretch of the DP road starting from Penkarpada to Gujrati Chawl to Bhakti Vendant Hospital, Mira Road (E). The Sub-Committee shall provide a report on the quantum of mangroves affected due to project and various options/ alternative alignment of the road to minimize the cutting of the mangroves.

Item No.4: 1) Construction of the Compound Wall for Ground at Chowk & 2) Construction for the Multipurpose hall at Sector No. 9 Shanti Nagar Miraroad (E), Dist Thane by Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation (MBMC)

Officials of Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation presented the proposal before the Authority. The MBMC has proposed 1) Construction of the Compound Wall for Ground at Chowk & 2) Construction for the multipurpose hall at Sector No. 9 Shanti Nagar Miraroad (E), Dist Thane.

From the submission of the MBMC, the Authority noted that proposed construction of the Compound Wall for Ground at S. No. 19, Chowk in Bhaynader


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

for area of 7291 sqm. It is proposed at 172 m from HTL and falls in CRZ -II area as per approved CZMP and landward side of existing road.

The Authority further noted that proposed multipurpose hall consist of ground floor at S. No. 40, Penkarpada, Mira Road East. The Plot under reference partly falls in CRZ-I (50 m mangrove buffer zone) & CRZ-II area. The plot is situated seaward side of existing road & structures.

The Authority noted that Compound Wall for Ground at Chowk is situated in CRZ-II & landward side. After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to planning Authority subject to following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
3. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

The Authority noted that construction for the multipurpose hall at Sector No. 9 is situated in mangrove 50 m buffer zone & seaward side. The construction on the seaward side would not be permissible as per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. Hence, the current proposal is rejected from CRZ point of view. The MBMC need to explore other site which is situated in CRZ II and landward side of the existing road for construction of multipurpose Hall.

Item No. 5: Proposal of post facto clearance for construction of School building for Special Children & Welfare center for disable on land bearing plot no. 3 D, Sector no. 30 A, Vashi, Navi Mumbai by Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (NMMC).

The Authority noted that the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (NMMC) vide letter dated 15.06.2018 (received on 29.06.2018) has forwarded the proposal of post facto clearance for construction of School building for Special Children & Welfare center for disable on land bearing plot no. 3 D, Sector no. 30 A, Vashi, Navi Mumbai in light of CRZ Amendment Notification dated 06.03.2018.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

The Authority noted that the above said Notification dated 6th March, 2018 published by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi states that "Such cases where the construction have been commenced before the date of this notification without the required CRZ clearance, shall be considered only by the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, provided that the request for such regularization is received in the said Ministry by 30th June, 2018"

The Authority further noted that window period of the said notification is expired on 30th June, 2018. The Authority is seeking the clarification from the MoEF&C, New Delhi regarding the implementation of the said Notification. ON receipt of necessary clarification from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi, appropriate decision on proposals of the post facto CRZ clearance would be taken. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

Item No.6: Proposal of post facto clearance for construction of Nagaland State Guest House building on land bearing plot no. 2 B , Sector no. 38, Vashi, Navi Mumbai by PWD, Govt of Nagaland

The Authority noted that the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (NMMC) vide letter dated 21.06.2018 (received on 04.07.2018) has forwarded the proposal of post facto clearance for construction of Nagaland State Guest House building on land bearing plot no. 2 B, Sector no. 38, Vashi, Navi Mumbai in light of CRZ Amendment Notification dated 06.03.2018.

The Authority noted that the above said Notification dated 6th March, 2018 published by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi states that "Such cases where the construction have been commenced before the date of this notification without the required CRZ clearance, shall be considered only by the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, provided that the request for such regularization is received in the said Ministry by 30th June, 2018"

The Authority further noted that window period of the said notification is expired on 30th June, 2018.

The Authority is seeking the clarification from the MoEF&C, New Delhi regarding the implementation of the said Notification. On receipt of necessary clarification from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi, appropriate decision on proposals


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

of the post facto CRZ clearance would be taken. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

Item No.7: Proposed redevelopment of Worli Koliwada Municipal Primary School on plot bearing C. S. No. 2/224 of Worli division in G/s Ward, Mumbai by MCGM

Officials of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for redevelopment of Worli Koliwada Municipal Primary School on plot bearing CS.No. 2/224 of Worli division in G/s Ward, Mumbai. Proposed school building comprises of Ground + 1st to 4th upper floors.

The Authority in its 131st meeting held on 2.11.2018 deliberated the proposal and decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to MoEFCC, New Delhi subject to compliance of certain conditions.

The MCGM vide letter dated 28.09.2020 sent a presentation to MCZMA requesting to grant the CRZ recommendation at Planning Authority level. MCGM has cited the example of the proposal of Versova Municipal School. The said proposal was discussed in 146th meeting of the MCZMA held on 4.9.2020 and MCZMA recommended the proposal to concern planning Authority.

The Authority noted that the proposal has already been recommended to MoEF&CC, New Delhi and it is with the MoEF&CC, New Delhi. MCGM need to follow up with MoEF&CC, New Delhi for the proposal. Accordingly, the Authority after discussion decided to decline the request of the MCGM

Item No.8: Proposed construction of Coastal Police Station (Phase II) on land bearing CTS No. 1213(pt), village Juhu Koliwada, Tal. Andheri, K/W ward, Mumbai by MSPHWCL

Officials of the Maharashtra State Police Housing Welfare Corporation Limited (MSPHWCL) presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Coastal Police Station building (Phase II) on land bearing CTS No. 1213 (pt), village Juhu Koliwada, Tal. Andheri, K/W ward, Mumbai. As per


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

the application submitted, the site is situated in CRZ II area. Plot area is 575.00 Sqm and built up area is 152.96 Sqm, FSI is 0.5.

The Authority in its 144th meeting held on 11.06.2020 deliberated the proposal and sought certain information.

The Authority noted that the Mangrove Cell conducted site visit on 25.07.2020 at the site of proposed coastal police station on land bearing CTS No. 1213 (pt), village Juhu Koliwada, Tal. Andheri, K/W ward, Mumbai. The observations are as given below:

- 1) GPS reading of proposed site:-
 - a) N-19°5'0.82" E-72°49'34.07"
 - b) N-19°5'0.82" E-72°49'34.36"
 - c) N-19°5'1.77" E-72°49'34.43"
 - d) N-19°5'1.80" E-72°49'33.74"
 - e) N-19°5'1.19" E-72°49'33.74"
- 2) No true Mangrove species were found in proposed site.
- 3) The proposed site is not located within the 50 Meter buffer area of Mangrove forest.
- 4) Mangrove associate i.e. Thespesia found in surrounding of proposed sites but not present in proposed site.

The Authority noted that the PP has submitted approved CZMP of 2011, as per which the site under reference falls in CRZ-II area. As per para 3.xiv) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, facilities required for patrolling and vigilance activities of marine/coastal police stations is permissible.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to concern planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
3. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

Item No.9: Proposed Coastal Police Station on part of plot bearing CTS No. 1 (pt) of village Erangal, Malad (W), P/N ward, Mumbai by MSPHWCL


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Officials of the Maharashtra State Police Housing Welfare Corporation Limited (MSPHWCL) presented the proposal before the Authority.

The proposal is for construction of coastal police station on part of plot bearing CTS No. 1 (pt) of village Erangal, Malad (W), P/N ward, Mumbai. As per the application submitted, the site is situated in CRZ II area. Plot area is 1994.46 Sqm and built up area is 537.53 Sqm, FSI is 0.5.

The Authority in its 144th meeting held on 11.06.2020 deliberated the proposal and sought certain information.

PP has submitted approved CZMP of 2011, as per which the site under reference falls in CRZ-II area.

The Authority noted that the Mangrove Cell conducted site visit on 25.07.2020 for construction of coastal police station on part of plot bearing CTS No. 1 (pt) of village Erangal, Malad (W), P/N ward, Mumbai. The observations are as given below:

1) GPS reading of proposed site:-

a) N-19°10'2.52" E-72°47'16.63"

b) N-19°10'2.71" E-72°47'16.39"

c) N-19°10'2.09" E-72°47'16.97"

d) N-19°10'2.61" E-72°47'16.66"

2) No true Mangrove species were found in proposed site, but mangrove associates were found in proposed sites.

3) The proposed site is located within the 50 Meter buffer area of Mangrove forest.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to concern planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. PP to obtain prior High Court permission since the project is affected by 50 m mangrove buffer zone.
3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

4. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

Item No.10: Proposed construction of Coastal Police Station (Phase II) of land bearing CTS No. 1268(pt), village Madh, Tal. Andheri, Dist. Mumbai by MSPHWCL

Officials of the Maharashtra State Police Housing Welfare Corporation Limited (MSPHWCL) presented the proposal before the Authority.

The proposal is for construction of Coastal Police Chowki / Station (Phase II) of land bearing CTS No. 1268 (pt), village Madh, Tal. Andheri, Dist. Mumbai. As per the application submitted, the site is situated in CRZ II area. Plot area is 1000.00 Sqm and built up area is 204.51 Sqm, FSI is 0.5. PP has submitted approved CZMP of 2011, as per which the site under reference falls in CRZ-II area.

The Authority in its 144th meeting held on 11.06.2020 deliberated the proposal and sought certain information.

The Authority noted that the Mangrove Cell conducted site visit on 25.07.2020 for construction of coastal police chowky building (Phase II) of land bearing CTS No. 1268(pt), village Madh, Tal. Andheri, Dist. Mumbai.

- 1) GPS reading of proposed site:-
 - a) N-19⁰8'15.11" E-72⁰47'42.00"
 - b) N-19⁰8'14.90" E-72⁰47'43.09"
 - c) N-19⁰8'13.87" E-72⁰47'42.96"
 - d) N-19⁰8'14.06" E-72⁰47'41.92"
- 2) No true Mangrove species were found in proposed site but Mangrove associate i.e. Thespesia & Phoenix were in proposed site.
- 3) The proposed site is not located within the 50 Meter buffer area of Mangrove forest.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to concern planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
3. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

Item No.12: Proposed construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Guhaghar, Dist. Ratnagiri by Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB)

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. Proposal is for construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Guhaghar, Dist. Ratnagiri

- 1) R C C Pile Jetty. Area- (201.20 mt X 5.50 mt) = 1106.60 Sqmt
- 2) Ticket counter : (18.54 mt X 9.740 mt)= 180.58Sqmt
- 3) Approach To Pile Jetty Area: 300 sq. mt

As per approved CZMP of 2011, the proposed project location falls in CRZ-III and CRZ-I (B) area. EIA report submitted.

The Authority noted that the site of Guhaghar is environmentally sensitive, since there is turtle breeding near the site. Hon'ble NGT has recently passed an order demolishing the jetty at Guhaghar. Taking into account the environmental sensitivity of the site, the Authority after deliberation decided that MMB need to explore other site for the jetty. The current proposal is rejected from CRZ point of view.

Item No.13: Proposed construction of Passenger jetty & allied facilities at Kharvadeshri, Dist. Palghar by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. Earlier MCZMA in its 117th meeting of MCZMA held on 06.04.2017 has recommended the proposal of Jetty at Kharvadeshwari to SEIAA. The CRZ Clearance issued by the SEIAA on 27.07.2017. Current proposal is for construction of allied facilities i.e. Terminal Building, Parking area & approach road at Kharvadeshri, Dist. Palghar.

The Authority noted the approved CZMP, 2011 and google location of the site and observed that there are mangrove on the site. There is small creeeklet near the site.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

The Authority felt that the sub-committee of expert members of the MCZMA shall visit the site to examine the option/measures to minimize the impact of allied facilities on surrounding environment and mangroves. Accordingly, the proposal was deferred.

Item No.14: Proposed construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Chiwale, Dist. Sindhudurg by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. The Proposal is for construction of passenger jetty of 110 m × 5 m & allied facilities at Chiwale, Dist. Sindhudurg. As per approved CZMP of 2011, the proposed project location falls in CRZ-I (B) & CRZ-II area. The Authority noted the EIA report submitted by the MMB.

The Authority noted the CRZ Permissibly as per CRZ Notification, 2011:

- As per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities.
- As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,
For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.15: Proposed construction of water tank at Ganesh Murti Nagar, cuff parade Colaba, Mumbai by MHADA

Officials of the MHADA presented the matter before the Authority. Proposal is for construction of water tank of 3 m X 2 m X 2.5 m at Ganesh Murti Nagar, cuff parade Colaba, Mumbai. The MCZMA vide letter dated 02.04.2019 & 10.09.2020 requested MHADA to submit the complete application. However, reply from the MHADA is still awaited.

The Authority noted that the application submitted by the PP is incomplete. Hence, the matter was delisted from the records of the MCZMA. MHADA may resubmit the complete application before the MCZMA.

Item No.16: Proposed construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Kharekuran, Dist. Palghar by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. Proposal is for construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Kharekuran, Dist. Palghar. The existing jetty is used to run passenger ferry between Kharekuran & Murbe. Existing jetty is in deteriorated condition so it needs to be strengthened. As the length of existing jetty is insufficient during low tide, passengers have to walk through salty clay and is very difficult to catch the boat.

- Existing Jetty - 38.00 x 1.80 meter
- Proposed Strengthening & widening -15.00 x 5.00 m.
- Approach road - 250.00 X 5.00 m.
- Cross Drainage - 1200 mm Dia. RCC Hume Pipe

As per approved CZMP of 2011, the proposed project location falls in CRZ-I (A) i.e. 50 m mangrove buffer zone area. The Authority noted the EIA report submitted by the MMB.

The Authority noted the CRZ Permissibly as per CRZ Notification, 2011:


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

- As per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities.
- As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,
For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. MMB to ensure that free of tidal water in the creek should not be hampered. There should be sufficient span between the piles of the jetty to ensure the same.
3. PP to obtain prior High Court permission since the project is affected by 50 m mangrove buffer zone.
4. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
5. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
6. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.17: Proposed construction passenger jetty & allied facilities at Dahisar, Mumbai by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Passenger jetty & allied facilities at Dahisar, Mumbai. The Authority noted that rapid EIA report is recently submitted by the MMB and the Authority did not get the time to


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

peruse the EIA report. After deliberation, the Authority decided to defer the proposal.

Item No.18: Proposed construction of Passenger jetty & allied facilities at Devichapada, Dist. Thane by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. The MMB has proposed the followings at Devichapada, Dist. Thane -

- 1) Piled Jetty - 70 m X 6.4 m
- 2) Reclamation Bund - 200 m
- 3) Retaining Wall - 140 m X 0.8 m
- 4) Toilet Block

The Authority noted that MMB need to submit the project report and feasibility report for the project. Accordingly, the Authority after deliberation decided to defer the proposal for submission of the reports.

Item No.19: Proposed construction of passenger jetty & allied facilities at Durgadi, Dist. Thane by MMB

Officials of the Maharashtra Maritime Board (MMB) presented the proposal before the Authority. The MMB has proposed the followings at Durgadi, Dist. Thane -

- 1) L Type Pile jetty:- 76.80 m x 25.00m
- 2) Ticket counter
- 3) Toilet Block

The Authority noted that MMB need to submit the project report and feasibility report for the project. Accordingly, the Authority after deliberation decided to defer the proposal for submission of the reports.

Item No.20: Proposed construction of road from Shiroda Kerwad to Velagar Beach, Tal. Vengurla, Dist. Sindhudurg by MRRDA

Officials of the Maharashtra Rural Roads Development Association (MRRDA) were absent for the meeting. The Authority noted that the application


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

submitted by the PP is incomplete. The MCZMA vide letter dated 03.06.2019 & 10.09.2020 requested MRRDA to submit the complete information. However, information is still awaited.

Hence, the matter was delisted from the records of the MCZMA. PP may resubmit the complete application before the MCZMA.

Item No.21: Proposed construction of MHADA scheme on plot bearing S. No. 263 of Malwani village, Malad, Mumbai by MHADA

The Authority noted that the application submitted by the MHADA is incomplete. The MCZMA vide letter dated 03.06.2019 & 10.09.2020 requested MHAF+DA to submit the complete information. However, information is still awaited.

Hence, the matter was delisted from the records of the MCZMA. PP may resubmit the complete application before the MCZMA.

Item No.22: Proposed reconstruction of Dispensary and TB Clinic at Nawab Tank, D'lima Street, plot bearing C. S. no. 9 situated at Mazgaon, E ward, Mumbai by Health Department

Officials of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM) presented the proposal before the Authority.

The proposal is for reconstruction of Dispensary and TB clinic comprising of Ground floor + 3 upper floors with height of 19.2mt at Nawab Tank, D'lima street, plot bearing C. S. no. 9 situated at Mazgaon, E ward, Mumbai. Plot area under consideration is 352.15sqm, proposed built up area is 523.10 sqm. As per the remarks of the MCGM, the plot falls in CRZ II area and situated on landward side of the existing road.

As per remarks of the MCGM, the plot under reference falls in Residential Zone and reserved for Municipal Dispensary/health post. The MCGM officials presented that the old dilapidated structure on the site has been demolished.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

The Authority noted that considering the site as in CRZ II area, reconstruction of authorized building could be permissible subject to FSI of the town country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991. MCGM should strictly ensure that the proposed construction is within the limit of permissible FSI of 1991 norms.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed reconstruction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project.
2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.23: Proposed improvement / beautification of existing promenade (Phase - II) at Dadar beach, Mumbai by Harbour Engineering Division, Mumbai

Officials of the Harbour engineering Division presented the proposal before the Authority. The Harbour engineering division has proposed beautification at Dadar beach involves followings:

1. Additional Visarjan Ramp at Keluskar Road beach node
2. Stepped ghats in precast interlocking blocks designed in unison with the Visarjan Ramp at Keluskar Road beach node
3. 3 nos. precast staircases connecting the promenade level to the sand beach level at strategic points for access and evacuation safety.
4. Provision of play area (2 nos. of Volleyball Court Sand Pits, Area for Yoga) and cabin for management behind park Club
5. Approach staircase and mobility ramp at Dnyaneshwar Udyan side for accessibility from sand beach stretch

The Authority instructed PP to submit superimpose the layout of 5 proposed activities on approved CZMP, 2011 in 1:4000 scale in order to ascertain the CRZ status of proposed activities. After deliberation the Authority decided to defer the proposal for want of above said information by the PP.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Item No. 24: Proposed construction of piled jetties and extension of existing slipway for installation of Goliath Crane spanning across slipway and assembly workshop at North yard, MDL, Mumbai by Mazgaon Dock Shipbuilders Limited

Officials of the Mazgaon Dock Shipbuilders Limited (MDL) presented the matter before the Authority. MDL under its modernization/ upgradation plan has intended to create Modular Ship Construction facility in North Yard in existing North Yard to meet the requirements of Naval Shipbuilding by using Modular Construction technique. Accordingly, a Feasibility Study for installation of 400 Ton capacity Goliath Crane spanning across existing North Yard Assembly Shop & North Yard Slipway was carried out in consultation with various specialized agencies having expertise in similar works i.e. marine construction and Goliath Crane fabrication and erection & Commissioning. As per initial assessment, it is confirmed that a Goliath Crane of 400 T capacity can be installed on new piled jetty on both side. This will facilitate MDL to accommodate large size naval vessel of next generation for construction & outfitting.

The MDL has proposed construction of piled jetties and extension of existing slipway for installation of Goliath Crane spanning across slipway and assembly workshop at North yard, MDL, Mumbai. In order to facilitates modular Warship construction, MDL has intended to install 400T capacity Goliath Crane spanning across existing slipway and assembly workshop at North yard, Mumbai. This work includes construction of piled jetties for installation of Goliath Crane and also extension of existing slipway by 20 meters towards sea and converting existing gullet portion into floor with a gate.

MCZMA and MoEF&CC, New Delhi has granted CRZ & EC to the extension of Navigational channel in the area between Mazgaon dock & Mumbai port on 05.03.2019 & 17.10.2019 respectively.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Details of the activity existing and proposed are tabulated as below:

SI No.	Parameter	Existing	Proposed
A	Marine Civil Work		
1	Piled Jetty	No jetty at present.	North Jetty- 202mx10m South Jetty - 202mx10m
2	Jetty deck top level	No jetty at present.	6.50 m CD
B	Slipway		
3	Slipway slope	1:22	1:22
4	Slipway length	190 mtr	248mtr
5	Side Walls	No side walls. Slipway encased by piled jetty on either sides.	RCC wall on sides of slipway to prevent water entry
6	Gate type	No gate at present.	MS Gate
7	Gate Operating System	No	Lifting & shifting by LL crane
8	Dewatering Pumps	Not available	500 Cum/Hr x2 nos.
9	Piped Services	Compressed Air, DA, Fire Water, Salt Water in trench	Compressed Air, DA, Fire Water, Salt Water below deck
B	400 T Goliath Crane		
1	Span	-	102 mtr
1.1	Hook Height		65mtr
1.2	Total Height		85mtr
	Total hoisting capacity	-	2x200T=400T
	Travelling speed	-	0-40 m/min
	Crane rail	-	CR 100


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Construction of these jetties will be carried out independently without disturbing the existing quay walls. Existing slipway will be extended by approx. 48 meter towards sea side. This entire portion of extended slipway will be enclosed by RCC walls on its North & South sides to prevent the entry of water. The Goliath crane component s i.e. legs, Girder, trollies etc. will be fabricated in small segments at other location either inside MDL or outside and will be brought to the site for assembling after completion of marine civil work. The assembling of these crane components will be done under expert supervision.

The Authority noted that, as per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai, the site under reference falls in CRZ-IB & CRZ-IV. The Authority noted the EIA report for the project submitted by the MDL. Being, Category 'A' project, the proposal has received TOR dated 18.9.2019 from the MoEF&CC, New Delhi for grant of the EC. One of the condition of the EC is to obtain the CRZ recommendation from the MCZMA.

The Authority after decided to recommend the proposal to MoEF, New Delhi subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Dry Dock should not be extended in the sea and should not obstruct the flow conditions of the sea.
3. PP to ensure that free of tidal water in the creek should not be hampered. There should be sufficient span between the piles of the jetty to ensure the same.
4. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
5. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
6. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.25: Proposal for installation of Bio-Mining on Boripakhadi dumping ground on plot bearing S. No. 180 A/1A at Uran, Dist. Raigad by Uran Municipal Council

Chief Officer, Uran Municipal Council submitted that a detail proposal would be submitted to MCZMA at the earliest. Accordingly, the Authority decided to


Member-Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

delist the present application from the records of the MCZMA. Uran Municipal Council may resubmit the complete application before the MCZMA.

Item No.26: Proposal for pipeline carrying secondary treated sewage from Ghatkoper pumping station to main plant at Deonar for development of 600 TPD waste to energy project to generate about 4 MW of power at Deonar, Mumbai by MCGM

The Authority deferred the proposal for want of information in the matter.

Item No.27: Proposed development of garden and shed on the bank of Waldhuni River, Tal. Kalyan, Dist. Thane by Kalyan Municipal Corporation

The Authority noted that the Municipal Commissioner the Kalyan Dombiwali Municipal Corporation was required for discussion of the project. The Authority noted that that the application submitted is incomplete. Hence, the proposal is delisted from the records of the MCZMA. The KDMC may resubmit the complete proposal with duly filled form I and other required documents.

Item No.28: Proposed work of Installation of Heavy Duty Back Rake Type Mechanical Screen for Love Groove Nalla at Love Groove Storm Water Pumping Station in G/S ward, Mumbai by MCGM

Officials of the Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai presented the proposal before the Authority. The MCGM has proposed the work of Installation of Heavy Duty Back Rake Type Mechanical Screen for Love Groove Nalla at Love Groove Storm Water Pumping Station in G/S ward, Mumbai. It is primary treatment of nalla water which improves quality of coastal environment.

The work of Installation of Heavy Duty Back Rake Type Mechanical Screen for Love Groove Nalla is proposed so as to remove floating material / trash from Nalla. The proposed installation of Mechanical Screen will ensure removal of floating material / trash from Nalla and will result in lesser pollution of Arabian Sea and on beaches. The proposed work includes pile foundation and


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

construction of columns in RCC within nalla and installation of screen over these columns.

Total height of the Mechanical Screen is 28.80 m and total width is 31.00 m.

As per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ II area.

As per para 3(v) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, facilities required for *Storm water drains ancillary structure for pumping is a permissible activity.*

As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:

1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.30: Kharland Scheme at village Upale, Tal. Rajapur and at village Jambhulwadi, Tal. Chiplun, Dist. Ratnagiri by Kharland Development Division, Ratnagiri

The project proponent could not present the proposal before the Authority due to technical / network reasons. Hence, the proposal was deferred.

Item No.31: Proposal for refurbishing of existing sewage treatment plant at Sector 18, Airoli, Navi Mumbai by NMMC

Officials of the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (NMMC) presented the proposal before the Authority. The NMMC has proposed up-gradation of Airoli


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Sewerage Treatment Plant to Tertiary treatment facility. The Proposed Project is located at Survey No 46 of the Village chichnavali, The Total area is 2323 Sqm. At present, the STP is unable to use treated water for the domestic and industrial use. The existing Airoli STP was constructed in 2006 with installed Capacity of 80 MLD with conventional MBR technology for secondary treatment of the sewage. Currently post treatment sewage is discharge in thane creek. Now NMMC has taken up-gradation of the STP for the carrying the Tertiary treatment of 20 MLD with installation of the ultra-filter Technology + ultra violet Technology.

NMMC officials further presented that proposed Project consist of the Ultra-Filtration Plant for Tertiary Treatment, Reverse Osmosis, Ultrafiltration, RCC Sump for storage of Secondary Treatment from STP, RCC Sump for RO treated water, UF Treated water Pumping Main from sump to ESR, Elevated Storage Reservoirs (ESR) for the gravity main distribution network. The treated main will laid through the RCC Duct, which will carry HDPE Treated transmission & Distribution mains. Further via Property connection for the recycle consumers, MIDC area for garden and industrial consumption with laying of the distribution network for the consumer.

The NMMC has requested Mangroves cell for the verification of the same and the site was conducted on 31.08.2020 by the Divisional Forest office of Mangroves Cell. The observation of the Mangroves cell as below

- The site demarked showed by the NMMC official is within the compound of the Existing STP plant of Airoli STP. The proposed location is not notified as forest land.
- No mangroves trees are present in the proposed site. There are terrestrial tree in demarcation which NMMC will proposed for felling which NMMC need to take permission from NMMC tree authority.
- The Proposed location is within the CRZ notified Area and NMMC have applied to MCZMA for CRZ clearances.
- The Proposed location is within the 50 Meter Mangroves Buffer zone as per the Judgment of PIL 87 of 2006. NMMC required to obtain permission from Hon High Court.

As per approved CZMP, the site is partly in 50 m mangroves buffer zone and partly in CRZ II area. Proposal involves no Mangroves cutting in project.



Member Secretary



Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

As per para 3(v) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, Facilities required for,- (c) Treatment of waste and effluents arising from hotels, beach resorts and human settlements located in CRZ areas other than CRZ-I and disposal of treated wastes and effluents is a permissible activity.

As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:


1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
2. PP to obtain prior High Court permission since the project is affected by 50 m mangrove buffer zone.
3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
4. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Discussion Item No.1: Reclassification of CRZ-III to CRZ-II area of Guhagar Nagar Panchayat, District - Ratnagiri by Guhagar Nagar Panchayat

The Authority noted that the District Coastal Zone Monitoring Committee (DCZMC), Ratnagiri has forwarded the representation of the Guhabhar Nagar Panchayat requesting to reclassification of CRZ-III to CRZ-II area of Guhagar Nagar Panchayat, District - Ratnagiri in approved CZMP of 2011.

The Authority noted that the MoEF&CC, New Delhi vide letter dated 16th August, 2018 approved the CZMPs of Ratnagiri district under CRZ Notification, 2011, as per which, area under Guhabhar Nagar Panchayat, District - Ratnagiri is classified as CRZ III area.

The DCZMC further submitted that the Urban development Department Govt of Maharashtra vide Notification dated 06.10.2012 has constituted Guhagar



Member Secretary



Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Nagar Panchayat as Guhagar which is headquarter an area in transition from a rural to an urban area.

The Authority noted that As per the para 7.(ii) CRZ II of the CRZ Notification, 2011, the areas that have been developed upto or close to shoreline shall be classified as CRZ II area. Explanation: "developed area" is referred to as that area within the existing municipal limits or in other existing legally designated urban areas which are substantially built-up and has been provided with drainage and approach roads and other infrastructural facilities, such as water supply and sewerage mains.

Guhagar Nagar Panchayat area, being developed urban area, the Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the matter to NCSCM, Chennai and NCZMA, New Delhi for reclassification of the area under Guhagar Nagar Panchayat, taluka Guhagar, District Ratnagiri from CRZ III to CRZ II area, in approved CZMP, 2011.

Discussion Item No. 2: Original Application No. 37 of 2018 & 202 of 2020 in Balvant Murlidhar Parchure V/s. Sub Divisional Officer, Mumbai - Goa & Ors

The Authority noted that the matter of Original Application No. 37 of 2018 & 202 of 2020 in Balvant Murlidhar Parchure V/s. Sub Divisional Officer, Mumbai - Goa & Ors. Hon. NGT passed an Order dated 14.09.2020 in the subject matter. Pursuant to said Hon'ble NGT order, Shri. Balvant Parchure (Applicant) vide email dated 29.09.2020 has submitted the list of the constructions permitted by Guhagar Nagar panchayat from year 1991 up to 2012 and mentioned that,

- i. *There are violations by converting gotha (place to keep cattles) into house particularly in 100 to 200 mts.*
- ii. *There are examples of allowing construction of more than 9 meters on existing structure in 200 to 500 and 100 to 200 meters example is on s.no.162/28 to 32,58/1(guhagar) under name parchure complex though it was in crz area permission was granted by collector himself without properly checking distance and three building of ground +3 were constructed (1998).*

Similarly in the year 2002 there was commercial construction made at s.no.12b,12/1/2 etc by Shri Mahendra Arekar and Ors in 100 to 200 mts area, Collector Ratnagiri took action against the same and regularized the


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

same ground +1 constructed structure which was only ground structure. Gram Panchayat Guhagar gave permission of additional floor in 2012."

The Authority noted that matter and above said order of Hon;ble NGT. After deliberation, the Authority decided that the list submitted by the applicant to be sent to DCZMC to examination and report, in the light of original application filed by the Mr. Parchure.

Table Item: CRZ status of plot bearing S. No. 109/A/1 CTS No. 3, 3A to 3A/15 of village Ambiwali, Andheri, Mumbai

The Authority noted that office of District Collector, Mumbai Suburban has sent a communication dated 16.10.2020 with regard to plot bearing S. No. 109/A/1 CTS No. 3, 3A to 3A/15 of village Ambiwali, Andheri, Mumbai. Office of District Collector has informed that the said land has been asked on lease for school purpose by Oshivara Labour Memorial Charitable Trust, Jogeshwari. Remarks of the MCZMA is requested in the matter from CRZ point of view.

The Authority noted that the CZMP of the Greater Mumbai was approved under CRZ Notification, 2011 in the year 2018 by MoEF&CC, New Delhi. The said CZMP is also available on the website of the MZMA i.e. <http://mczma.gov.in>.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to confirm that the plot bearing S. No. 109/A/1 CTS No. 3, 3A to 3A/15 of village Ambiwali, Andheri, Mumbai situated outside CRZ area as per approved CZMP, 2011 of the Greater Mumbai. It was decided that above said CRZ status of the plot under reference to be communicated to office of District Collector, Mumbai Suburban.

-----*Meeting ended with vote of thanks*-----


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Annexure I

List of members/officials present in the online meeting:

1. Mrs. Neenu Somraj, DCF, Mangrove Cell, Member MCZMA
2. Mr. Padmakar Nandushekar, Environment Advisor, MIDC, representative of Industries Department, Member MCZMA
3. Shri. Chakradhar Kandalkar, Dy Ch.E. MCGM, Member MCZMA
4. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, College of Engineering, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
5. Dr. A. K. Chaubey, NIO, Expert Member, MCZMA
6. Mr. Maruti Kudale, Ex Director, CWPRS, Expert Member, MCZMA
7. Dr. M. S. Khot, Principal, Chhatrapati Sambhaji Raje Sainik School, Ratnagiri, Expert Member, MCZMA
8. Mr. Narendra Toke, Director, Environment


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Item No. 43: Amendment in CRZ clearance for Mumbai Coastal Road project (South) from Princess Street Flyover to the Worli End of Bandra Worli Sea Link in Mumbai by Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM)

The Authority noted that earlier, MCZMA vide letter no. CRZ 2016/CR 1/TC 4, dated 4th January 2017 granted CRZ recommendation to the project of Mumbai Coastal Road (South) from Princess Street Flyover to the Worli End of Bandra Worli Sea Link. The project has got the CRZ clearance vide file no. 19-74/2016-IA.III dated 11th May 2017 from MoEF&CC, New Delhi. For the said project, reclamation of 90 Ha. is permitted, out of which, 70 Ha. is for development of green spaces.

The said CRZ clearance was challenged before the Hon'ble High Court in WP (L) 560/2019 PIL (L) 39/2019, PIL (L) 44/2019, PIL (L) 40/2019, PIL (L) 36/2019 and PIL (L) 25/2019. Hon'ble High Court vide order dated 16.7.2019 squash the above said CRZ clearance. The MCGM challenged the order of Hon'ble High Court dated 16.7.2019 before Hon'ble Supreme Court. Subsequently, Hon'ble SC, New Delhi on 7.12.2019 had stayed the said Hon'ble High Court order and allowed the reclamation.

Now, the Hon'ble Supreme Court on 7.10.2020 has passed an order, as per which, while deciding the application made by the MCGM for excess land reclamation, representative of the Original Write Petitioners shall be allowed to remain present and be heard in the matter.

The MCGM has submitted the application seeking amendment in CRZ clearance with following documents:

- Dully filled Form I
- Layout alignment of the road.
- CRZ map (1:4000 scale) showing the alignment of coastal road prepared by MoEF authorized agency.
- Supplemental EIA report & investigation on impact of phase I project.
- Disaster Management Plan report
- Risk Assessment Report
- Socio-Economic Report & CMFRI studies.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

- Reports like traffic studies, storm water drainage, report on extreme waves, extreme water level, storm surge, tsunami height & coastal geomorphology.

The MCGM officials presented that MCGM is seeking the amendment in the CRZ clearance dated 11th May 2017 granted by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi. Earlier, total reclamation area considered was 90 Ha. Now, the MCGM has proposed total reclamation area of 111 Ha, out of which, 96.51 Ha is a reclamation and remaining 14.49 Ha is meant for sea wall protection. Thus, the resultant increase in area of reclamation is only 6.51 Ha. The area of 14.49 Ha was mentioned but not detailed in previous submissions.

As per submission of the MCGM, the details of the proposed amendment are as follows:

Sr. No	Particulars	As per CRZ Clearance received	Proposed Details
1	Total Length of the proposed project (Km)	9.98	10.58 Km
2	Total area of intertidal zone (Ha)	20,38,098 Sq.mt or 203.81 Ha area comes under CRZ	
3	Total cost (Crores)	5303	8429.44
4	Reclamation area (Ha)	90	111.00

The Authority noted the supplementary the EIA report & other reports submitted by the MCGM and observations were made pertaining to environmental impacts and mitigation measures.

Anticipated impacts of the projects noted from the EIA report are as follows;

- The development of coastal road will result in certain temporary as well as permanent changes in the land use. Preparatory activities like use of existing access roads with/without improvements, construction of new haul roads, construction of temporary staff quarters, camp, storage go-downs, stockyards etc. will be spread over the entire project area resulting in change of land use pattern of the project


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

influence area for a temporary period.

- During land reclamation there are chances of soil /coastal erosion due to rain-wash especially during the monsoon period. Due to land reclamation, there will be impact on HTL but according to National Oceanographic Organization (NIO) reclamation upto 100 m width would not cause any adverse impact on the tidal movement.
- Water quality and biodiversity are likely to be impacted because of discharges of liquid and solid waste, petroleum, oil and lubricant (POL) storage areas, work force camps and all other operational areas, if disposed of directly without treatment.
- Increased noise levels and vibrations within the project corridor would decrease the number of visiting faunal species like butterflies, birds etc.
- The socio-economic impacts covered in the EIA were based on certain assumptions. Additional studies carried out by CMFRI have been incorporated in the socio-economic studies now and the impact identification is adequately covered.
- Total benthic habitat loss in intertidal and sub tidal area is estimated to be 872889 m² and 164449 m² respectively. The meio-faunal biomass estimated to be lost from proposed project area is about 2312.39 kg in intertidal and 17.83 kg in sub-tidal area. Macro-faunal biomass to be lost from proposed project area is estimated to be 46319 kg from intertidal and 988 kg from sub-tidal area.
- Benthic fauna such as *Scleractinian* corals have been observed in the vicinity of the project. This coral species may be affected due to sedimentation during reclamation.
- Dolphins have been sighted in sub tidal areas which were located within 10 km radius of the proposed project activity. The increase turbidity, noise and vibration levels may drive away these highly sensitive species.
- Destruction of seaweed habitat may hamper birds to the intertidal region. Birds are most sensitive to any sort of disturbance such as noise during project activities (e.g., operations of cranes, dodgers etc.), use of mechanized vessels, change in turbidity, productivity or change in water quality. The disturbance by noises may affect the foraging behavior of birds, mainly aquatic birds.
- Oil leaks or spillages and waste disposal from barges into the sea may affect marine flora and fauna.
- The project involves removal of about 140 nos. of trees at various locations along the project length for the purpose of construction.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Removal of vegetation from existing location would ultimately result in shift in birds nesting preference to the nearest suitable vegetation.

- Impact due to coastal erosion is likely to minimize during operation phase as due consideration has been given for the seawall/ slope protection during embankment design. Sufficient number of cross drainage structure like culverts and bridges have been provided in the design so that construction of road and construction of embankments will not impede the normal flow of the water channels in the operation stage.

In view of this, the mitigation measures committed by the MCGM in the EIA report were also noted as:

- Translocation of coral (schedule I species under WPA, 1972) will be carried out before reclamation. To create additional ecotone corresponding to loss of habitat is being considered with the help of Israel based company named E-concrete using specialized concrete blocks that will enhance surface areas available for sessile organisms including corals, rock oysters and barnacles.
- Out of 600 trees getting affected, 460 trees are suitable for transplantation and will be transplanted at appropriate locations. 140 trees will be cut, and 420 trees will be planted as a compensatory plantation.
- All piling would be carried out in encasements to avoid turbidity.
- Geotextile barriers of 1000gsm is being placed as a layer during reclamation, to contain the suspension of sediment in limited area so that aquatic life is least impacted.
- Waste water from construction site is being collected in sedimentation tanks (two chambered) for recycling and reuse of water.
- Bio-toilets have been provided at the work sites which are regularly serviced.
- Regular machinery and equipment maintenance to be carried out to regulate noise and vibrations generated during its operation.
- Site runoff should be avoided from draining into sea water. Settling tank has been provided to contain runoff.
- Piling, reclamation and associated activities to be taken care (minimized or avoided) during the notified fish breeding season (June-July) which is considered as egg laying and larval recruitment season.
- Creation of partial intertidal habitat parallel to reclaimed area and sea wall by placing natural rocks or eco-friendly material may support as habitat for biological communities.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

- The fishermen population is normally engaged in fishing during both the tides, while a large quantity of mollusks, crustacean and fish species are collected from the intertidal region. Care should be taken that the project activities do not obstruct the activities of these communities
- Fish, crabs and prawns are also generally trawled on mechanized vessel during high tide. The interference with their vessel movement should be avoided during the project operation phase.
- Coral species were found to be present and recorded from total area of 0.361 m² from intertidal region near Worli and Haji Ali area. Translocation of these species is proposed to be carried out with the help of NIO.
- Partial intertidal habitat parallel to sea wall and reclaimed area should be created by placing natural rocks wherever possible and can be supported as habitat for biological communities. These structural designs should be developed or modified in consultation with expert to minimize disturbance and recovery of benthic communities. Recovery of benthic communities can be confirmed by regular monitoring of the intertidal habitat.
- Periodic maintenance of barges to be carried out. No waste should be disposed from barges into sea.
- Tree NOC to be obtained from tree authority before removal of trees. Transplantation should be carried out to the maximum extent.
- Tree transplantation should be carried out by following all the required procedures to achieve survival rate of more than 90%.
- Compensatory tree plantation should be carried out in 1:3 ratio.
- Trees having active nests should not be cut/ transplanted till the hatchlings are not full grown and nest is ensured to be inactive.

Socio-Economic Impact of the project (Impact on Fisheries):

1. It was observed by CMFRI that there are 292 registered fishing vessels in Worli village and 29 boats in the Haji Ali (Lotus Worli) village. However, 45 boats operate from Haji Ali (Lotus Worli) as their base.
2. Fishers operating from and around proposed project are likely to be affected as they will be losing access to a portion of nearshore fishing area in the sea. This is a permanent impact and irreversible. However, access to other parts of sea is not restricted by any regulations and reduces livelihood impacts.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

3. At some pockets along the intertidal region of proposed coastal stretches, occasional shell collection is conducted by local shell collectors/traders. Due to the proposed and ongoing reclamation this activity will be affected. More than 90 % collectors are for household purpose and vendors are not from project affected coastal regions.
4. Possible reduction in fish abundance and productivity of the area due to sound disturbance and increased turbidity during construction phase.
5. There may be a decline in revenue of the hand pickers and the gill-netters due to destruction of oyster/clam patches, however a new space will be created in terms of sea wall (7.47 meters) and additional habitat for this project.
6. Limited hindrance to the navigation of fishing boat. There will be slight increase in the fishing operational cost.

As per the EIA report, from the study conducted by CMFRI it was concluded that the fishers in the Lotus Jetty and Worli village are marginal fishers and mostly operate single day nearshore fishing using gill netter/SBN/hook and line. The fishers in the Worli village operate mechanized and motorized dol-netters and gillnetters. Total fishermen population residing in the identified fishing villages (Worli and Lotus jetty) is around 3,282 in 841 families and nearly 50 fishing vessels operate from Lotus Jetty, coming from different nearby locations. There were two fishing base along the proposed coastal road route, from which fishing is conducted from near shore waters between Worli, Mahim Bay and Priyadarshini Park. The propose reclamation and other development plan also cover few regions with rocky and sandy patch having oyster and clam beds. A new space will be created in terms of sea wall (7.47 meters) which will act as habitat for the growth of oysters and clam. It was informed by the MCGM that for fishing operation of the fishers, adequate facilities will be given to the lotus jetty fishermen to operate their boats without any navigational difficulties. The navigational route of Worli village was also taken into consideration by providing adequate distance of 60 meters from center to center between the pillars of the bridge which is sufficient for the passage of fishing vessels.

Mitigation measures for socio-economic impact:

1. As the wall is being constructed with natural rocks, the growth of sedentary organisms may not be affected as expected. During the period of CMFRI study it was observed that the growth of marine life was already started at reclaimed areas of Priyadarshini Park and Haji Ali area.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

2. Installation of artificial reefs with suitable shapes will enhance the fisheries resources and habitat which will act as substratum for marine fauna, supplementing the damaged seascapes and bringing back normality.
3. Adequate Infrastructure should be developed for better marketing, improved income and good fish for all.
4. Adequate depth should be given to the boats for the navigation when there is siltation during the construction or post construction phase.
5. Support in improved navigation aid and up gradation of fishing vessels.
6. Sea water quality in the near shore waters should be monitored regularly and pollution should not cause adverse impacts on fishing and environment.
7. Recommendation for regular monitoring program during construction phase and audit after /post operational phase by MCGM.

Taking into consideration above said order of the Hon'ble SC, the MCZMA extended the hearing to the representative of Original Writ petitioner as well petitioners in PILs. Representative of petitioners were heard extensively one by one to present their say in the matter.

Mr. Nitesh Patil, representative of WP (L) 560/2019, submitted that there is destruction of fishing spaces due to reclamation. Fishing in the intertidal area is damaged. But, it is not reported in the proposal submitted by the MCGM. There shall be span of 200 meter between columns to facilitate the boat movement of the fishermen.

Advocate Meena Kakalia of WP (L) 560/2019, submitted that the proposal of additional 21 Hector reclamation should not be examined comprehensively along with earlier proposal, instead of looking at it in isolation. There is no provision for granting the amended CRZ clearance as per the provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. She further added that the site is CRZ I (A). Coastal road project is not allowed in CRZ I (A) area.

Mr. Stalin D, representative of PIL (L) 39/2019, submitted that there is no study of the impact of the pushing of the sea water due to reclamation on coastline and surrounding coastal environment. When, Earlier CRZ clearance for 9 Hector is in dispute before the Hon'ble Supreme Court. Can MCZMA consider the proposal of additional reclamation? He further suggested that the earlier CRZ clearance should be revisited. MCZMA need to examine the entire proposal of 111 Hector comprehensively


Member Secretary


Chairman

**Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management
Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020**

Advocate Zaman Ali for PIL (L) 39/2019, submitted that detail study of marine habitat to be conducted, including species schedule under II, III and IV of the wildlife act, 1972 which will be destroyed due to reclamation. He further added that coastal road project is proposed in High Risk Zone, cyclone prone area.

Shweta Wagh, representative of PIL 44/2019, submitted that fresh clearance should be obtained by the MCGM for additional reclamation. Corals should be shown in CZMP. MCGM has already started the work of additional reclamation without obtaining the CRZ clearance. Studies carried out by the MCGM regarding impact on fisheries are post facto. Fishermen are experiencing Change of wave patterns of the sea due to reclamation done by the MCGM. Reclamation in the project would permanently disrupt the fishing spaces and fishermen

Advocate Rishita Tanish for PIL 40/2019, submitted that additional reclamation proposed by the MCGM is around 23% of the total reclamation, which is huge reclamation. Additional Reclamation for the coastal project road has been started by the MCGM. There is shift in arm of the interchange. Whether any traffic study has been carried out for this change. MCGM need to take into consideration flood control system. She also raised the issue of applicability of the Environment Clearance under EIA Notification, 2006 to the project.

Mr. Debi Goanka, representative of PIL 40/2019, submitted that earlier CRZ clearance was granted subject to securing all other clearances. However, MCGM has started the project without obtaining the NBWL clearance. He further submitted that site visit is necessary in the project.

Mr. Prakash Chanderkar, petitioner of PIL 25/2019, submitted that coastal road will disrupt the Worli Koliwada. There is option of coastal road on stilt which will have less impact. However, reclamation is proposed. He further alleged that Hon'ble SC has passed order without hearing all litigants

Adv. Ankit Kulkarni, representative of PIL 36/2019 was absent for the said meeting.

After the hearings, petitioners requested for submission of written submissions. The Authority agreed for the same and requested petitioners to submit their written say within 5 days. Accordingly, certain petitioners submitted their written submissions to the office of MCZMA. Subsequently, discussion meetings of MCZMA expert committee members were conducted to


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

have a detailed and point-wise understanding of all objections raised during this meeting in the meeting on 3rd November, 2020 and 10th November, 2020. Accordingly, the Authority has enlisted following common issues raised by the representative of petitioners significantly on coastal environment:

1. Whether the MCZMA can consider the present proposal of additional reclamation of 21 Ha. in isolation OR MCZMA should examine the entire proposal of coastal road involving reclamation of 111 Hectar comprehensively.
2. Whether MCGM has exceeded the reclamation earlier approved in CRZ clearance granted by MoEF&CC, New Delhi
3. What is the Impact on the additional reclamation on the marine habitat and wave pattern near the coast?
4. MCGM to submit the compliance of earlier CRZ clearance granted by MoEF, New Delhi. Studies pertaining to Fisheries.
5. How the additional reclamation is exceptional in nature and there is no other alternative available other than additional reclamation?
6. MCGM to provide a navigation span of 200 meter between columns to facilitate free movement of fishing boats.
7. Corals should be shown as CRZ I (A) in CZMP. Currently the area is shown as intertidal CRZ I (B).

Based on the submissions by the PP and objections raised by the representatives of petitioners, the Authority has concluded with the following observations:

1. The MCGM vide letter dated 16.10.2020 has submitted an application for amendment in CRZ clearance dated 11th May 2017 granted to the Mumbai Coastal Road (South) Project. The application is with respect to excess land reclamation of around 21 Hectare for the coastal road project. The Authority noted that the earlier CRZ clearance dated 11th May 2017 is still valid. Now, MCGM is seeking the amendment in the said CRZ clearance, since the land area of reclamation has increased. Hence, the Authority decided to restrict the purview to the matter of excess land reclamation and possible environmental impacts with special reference to understanding the necessity and essential preventive and mitigation measures adopted by the project proponent in the CRZ area.
2. Regarding the status of the reclamation, the MCGM reply states that the reclamation carried out till 15.10.2020 is 63.28 Ha. which is within 90 Ha


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

permitted vide earlier CRZ clearance and as per order of Hon'ble Supreme Court of India. This 63.28 Ha includes area occupied by sloping portion of seawall which is about 6 Ha at the bottom.

3. The MCGM has carried out EIA studies to understand the impact of the additional reclamation on the marine habitat and wave pattern near the coast. EIA report also stipulates the mitigation measures to mitigate the impacts. EIA report suggests the partial intertidal habitat parallel to seawall and putting armoured stones for protection of seawall instead of tertrapods can be supported as habitat for biological communities. These structural designs should be developed or modified in consultation with the experts to minimize disturbance and recovery of benthic communities. Recovery of benthic communities can be confirmed by regular monitoring of the intertidal habitat.
4. The MCGM vide letter dated 6.11.2020 has submitted the compliance of earlier CRZ clearance granted to the project. MCGM has engaged the National Institute of Oceanography (NIO), Goa to assess the actual impact (in comparison with the projected impacts as stated in EIA) on shore morphology of adjacent areas during and after construction of Coastal Road. Compliance report further states that the Central Marine Fisheries Research Institute (CMFRI) is engaged for studying the impact on livelihood pattern of fishermen communities and they have submitted the report in October, 2020 after long survey during (May 2019- May 2020). The Authority suggested that all recommendations of the CMFRI studies concerning the fisheries/ fishermen shall be complied with. Regarding deposition of the 2% of total cost with Mangrove foundation of Maharashtra, it is reported by MCGM that the MCGM has deposited Rs. 175.33 Crores which is 2 % of total cost of Rs. 8766.6176 Crores. MCGM further submits that total cost of project becomes Rs. 12721 including water charges, sewerage charges, supervision charges.
5. As per the submission of the MCGM, out of total 21 Ha area, 6.51 ha of reclamation is necessary component of the coastal road and it is design requirement while 14.49 Hectare land reclamation is for constructing the sea wall and rubble mound structure as protection measure to safeguard the coastal road from the erosion and anticipated extreme sea waves, storm surge etc. The design of the structure is finalized for the seawall, all structural details (including availability of natural rocks, estimated area of their usage etc.), details of wave's impact and back splash


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

estimations based on modeling with NIO Study is carried out. The rubble mound seawall with rock in the armor layer will offer an absorbing surface, which will reduce the wave impact.

6. The expert member opined that the fishing boats will require the navigation span of 32 m for two way movement of fishing boats. However, MCGM has already proposed a navigation span of 60 m which may cater four lane traffic of fishing boats.
7. As per approved Coastal Zone Management Plan of 2011, the entire area of reclamation falls in CRZ-IB & CRZ-IVA. During the investigation & survey by MCGM, sporadic occurrence of corals were noticed by MCGM. Since, sporadic corals were noticed in intertidal area CRZ-IB, project proponent i.e., MCGM has obtained permission under Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972 for translocation of corals at Haji Ali and Worli area to avoid their loss due to construction of Mumbai Coastal Road Project (South), from the Principal Chief Conservator of Forest (HOFF) Maharashtra State vide letter dated 29.10.2020. The validity for translocation is from 29.10.2020 to 31.12.2020. As per opinion of the Expert Member, Forest Dept. the permission of National Board of Wildlife is not required as the proposed coastal road project is not passing through any protected area or its Eco sensitive zone.

The Authority further noted the para 4(i)(g) and 3(iv) (a) of the CRZ Notification, 2011 amended on 30th December, 2015, as per which, following is permissible:

- a) *"construction of road by way of reclamation in CRZ area shall be only in exceptional cases, to be recommended by the concerned Coastal Zone Management Authority and approved by the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change; and in case the construction of such road is passing through mangroves or likely to damage the mangroves, three times the number of mangroves destroyed or cut during the construction process shall be replanted"*
- b) *"required for setting up, construction or modernization or expansion of foreshore facilities like ports, harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, bridges, sealink, road on stilts, road on reclaimed surface, and such as meant for defence and security purpose and for other facilities that are essential for activities permissible under the notification:*


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

Provided that such roads shall not be taken as authorised for permitting development on landward side of such roads till existing High Tide Line.

Provided further that the use of reclaimed land may be permitted for roads, mass rapid or multimodal transit system, construction and installation, on landward side of such roads, of all necessary associated public utilities and infrastructure to operate such transit or transport system including those for electrical or electronic signal system, transit stopover of permitted designs; except for any industrial operation, repair and maintenance"

The Authority discussed that earlier, CRZ clearance was granted for the coastal road involving 90 Ha reclamation, out of which 70 Ha was for creation of green spaces and 20 Ha for the construction of coastal road. Now, the MCGM is seeking CRZ clearance for additional reclamation of area 21 Ha. Out of said additional reclamation, 6.51 Ha area of reclamation is functional and integral part of the coastal road, which is a result of detailed micro design at the implementation level. It was further noted that 14.49 Ha area is meant for the protection measures provided in the form of rubble mound seawall. MCGM officials during the meeting mentioned that the sea wall with armored rock will be an absorbing surface, which will reduce the wave impact. In addition, it was presented that natural armour rock structure may help in growth of marine organisms. Protection and safety of the coastal road and seawall is the prime objective behind the said requisite 14.96 Ha area of reclamation. At present, the work of reclamation has not exceeded 90 Ha, as per the submission of the MCGM. The Authority suggested MCGM that additional reclamation in the form of sea wall protection should be explored for growth of marine life and creating habitat for intertidal Marine organisms. MCGM should seek the consultation of marine experts for implementation of the same.

The Authority further referred the representation dated 22nd Feb, 2020, 17th November, 2020 & Dec, 2020 received from Sr. Adv. B.A. Desai regarding reclamation at water body at Priyardarshani Park (PDP). Further, the hearing was extended to him in the matter before the Expert Members of the MCZMA on 04.12.2020. He stated that the reclamation at lagoon like water body is not part of the project of additional reclamation proposed by the MCGM. He further stated that reclamation is only allowed on landward side. He suggested the protection of the said water body.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

The Authority noted that on the representation submitted by Sr. Adv. B.A. Desai, the reply was sought from the MCGM in the matter. As per submission of the MCGM, the proposed promenade on Mumbai Coastal Road project (South) is continuous stretch from PDP up to Lotus Jetty Hazi Ali and then Hazi Ali to Worli. Therefore, it would not be appropriate to discontinue the promenade without joining it to existing PDP which will break the Pedestrian / Walkers / Joggers mobility. Leaving small area of water body in between may lead to formation of stinky swampy lagoons of seawater entrapped between coastal road and existing sea coast line at PDP Garden, contributing for unpleasant littered wetlands and sites of mosquito breeding, posing health hazard and will also endanger the stability of reclamation abutting to it. It was further submitted that existing shore of PDP will get protected in lagoon part to be reclaimed and will also safeguard any flood like situation in future.

Taking cognizance of above, the Authority noted that reclamation at the mentioned water body at PDP is a part of the proposal submitted by the MCGM before the Authority seeking CRZ amendment for additional reclamation. There is a proposed tunnel passing through the said water body and adjacent to the tunnel, the walkway promenade is proposed which is joining south end of the PDP. The Authority deliberated the issue and after hearing the submissions of the B.A. Desai, it is felt that there is a merit in the request of the Sr. Adv. B. A Desai regarding protection of the said water body near PDP.

The Authority noted that the coastal road is passing through tunnel at PDP and walkway promenade adjacent to tunnel needs to be connected to the land. However, in order to restrict the additional reclamation, the MCGM should finalize such alignment for the walkway promenade which will require minimal land reclamation. The Authority observed that alignment of walkway promenade will require shifting by culminating the same towards the plot of MSRDC adjacent to PDP. This will minimize the footprint of the additional reclamation in the concave shaped area of the sea.

The Authority further noted that coastline along the PDP is facing erosion, particularly along the land protrusion area in the sea known as 'Priya Tekdi point'. The Authority discussed that the MCGM need to carry out the anti-sea erosion measures along the PDP, taking into account the aesthetics of the Park.

In the light of above, after detailed discussion and deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal of amendment in CRZ clearance to MoEF&CC, New Delhi subject to strict compliance of following conditions:


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

1. The proposed coastal road should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 as amended from time to time and with a commitment of protection and conservation of coastal environment.
2. MCGM to strictly comply with the all specific and general conditions stipulated in earlier CRZ clearance granted by the MoEF&CC, New Delhi
3. Project proponent should implement Environment Management plan for the project effectively and efficiently during construction and operational phase of the project to ensure that coastal environment is protected. It is also suggested to have a third-party monitoring/Audit of all such management initiatives by Govt agency during and after completion of project from time to time.
4. PP should ensure that livelihood activities of the fishermen communities should not be hampered due to project activities. The local fishermen will be allowed free and non-discontinuity access to operate their fishing boats. All recommendations of the CMFRI studies concerning the fisheries/ fishermen shall be complied with.
5. All recommendation of the socioeconomic, disaster Management studies, traffic studies should be complied with by the MCGM.
6. MCGM shall set up a full-fledged inhouse Environment Management Cell for effective implementation of the Environment Management Plan including monitoring, Marine Biodiversity conservation plan and recommendations of the Socio-economic study as well as Disaster Management Plan. The said Environment Cell shall also monitor the real time change in shoreline, erosion/ accretion of the coastline by engaging the competent agencies like NIO, IIT-B, CWPRS etc. Accordingly, implement the necessary mitigation measures. The real time data shall be collected for at least 15 years down the line. Specific Budget shall be allocated for the said set up of the Environment Management Cell.
7. Reclaimed surfaces shall be explored for growth the marine life/ intertidal habitats. Artificial Coral reef shall also be explored to promote the marine biodiversity. Marine Experts shall be engaged for the said work.
8. MCGM should finalize alignment for the walkway promenade near Priyadarshini Park (PDP) which will require minimal land reclamation. Alignment of walkway promenade should be shifted by culminating the same towards the plot of MSRDC adjacent to PDP. This will minimize the footprint of the additional reclamation in the concave shaped area of the sea.


Member Secretary


Chairman

Minutes of the 147th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 27th & 28th October, 2020

9. MCGM to carry out the anti-sea erosion measures along the Priyadarshini Park (PDP), taking into account the aesthetics of the Park and in line with the local geo-morphology.
10. MCGM to ensure public access to seafront at convenient locations.
11. MCGM to ensure noise barriers are erected at appropriate locations.
12. No labour camp are allowed in CRZ area & it should also be ensured that the waste water from these entities should not be released into sea. Mobile toilets with mobile STPs to be provided in work front area.
13. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
14. PP to ensure that best industrial practices should be followed for fire safety measures and for conservation of coastal environment
15. All other required permissions from the concerned statutory authorities should be obtained prior to commencement of the work.
16. The MCGM to take into account and comply with all the recommendations of the various studies such as traffic, storm water drainage etc. carried out in respect of coastal road project.

Annexure I

List of members/officials present in the online meeting:

1. Mrs. Neenu Somraj, DCF, Mangrove Cell, Member MCZMA
2. Mr. Padmakar Nandushekar, Environment Advisor, MIDC, representative of Industries Department, Member MCZMA
3. Shri. Chakradhar Kandalkar, Dy Ch.E. MCGM, Member MCZMA
4. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, College of Engineering, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
5. Dr. A. K. Chaubey, NIO, Expert Member, MCZMA
6. Mr. Maruti Kudale, Ex Director, CWPRS, Expert Member, MCZMA
7. Dr. M. S. Khot, Principal, Chhatrapati Sambhaji Raje Sainik School, Ratnagiri, Expert Member, MCZMA
8. Mr. Narendra Toke, Director, Environment


Member Secretary


Chairman