MINUTES OF THE 146thMEETING OF MAHARASHTRA COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (MCZMA) HELD ON 04th September, 2020

The 146thmeeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) was held under the Chairmanship of Principal Secretary (Environment). In view of present pandemic situation of COVID-19, it was decided to appraise the proposals by using information technology facilities. Hence, the proposals were appraised through Videoconferencing technology on Cisco WebEx platform on 4th September, 2020. List of members present in the meeting is at **Annexure-I**.

Confirmation of 145th meeting:

The minutes of the 145th meeting of the MCZMA held on 07th July 2020 are confirmed with following minor changes:

- At item no. 14 total gross BUA including fungible shall be read as 12962.26
 Sqm instead of 3360.52 Sqm.
- At item no.16 name 'Karba' shall be read as 'Karna'

Item No.1: Proposed Reconstruction & Extension of Existing Storm Water Drain (SWD) Outfall at Janta colony, Worli Koliwada, G/S ward, Mumbai by MCGM

The MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The MCGM has proposed reconstruction & extension of existing SWD outfall at Janta colony, Worli koliwada, G/S ward, Mumbai to give relief to citizens / residents from flooding and to improve SWD network system in G/S ward. There are total 21 nos. of marine outfalls which needs reconstruction & extension due their current dilapidated conditions. The said outfalls are having length of around 12 to 19 meter. MCGM officials further informed that there are slums around the site and storm water gets flooded in the slums causing hardships to the local residents. Hence, reconstruction & extension of the existing outfalls is necessary to prevent

Member Secretary

Page 1 of 48

5

K G Chairman

the flood situation in the nearby surrounding locality. There are no mangroves in and around the site.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai under CRZ Notification, 2011, the site is located in CRZ-I B area. It is further noted that as per para 3(v) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, Storm water drains and ancillary structures for pumping is a permissible activity form CRZ point of view. It is essential infrastructure facility as flood control measure for the residents of the Worli Koliwada and its surrounding locality.

The Authority further noted that as per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

The Authority decided to recommend the proposal to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

- 1. The proposed reconstruction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- 2. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 3. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

Item No.2: Proposed construction of Saline Embankment under Kharland Scheme near Wadapalye, Tal. Rajapur, Dist. Ratnagiri by Ratnagiri Kharland Development Division

Officials of the Kharland Development Division, Ratnagiri presented the proposal before the Authority. It was presented that Agricultural lands are damaged due to the increased salinity caused by creek water ingress as well as

Member Secretary

Page 2 of 48

growth of mangroves into the fields. Kharland Development schemes are envisaged to restrict tidal waters to enter the agricultural lands along the creek. The flood water is allowed to flow through the cross drainage works towards creek without disturbing the natural course of flow.

The Kharland scheme is proposed along the bank of Waghotan creek in RajapurTaluka in Ratnagiri District. Geo-coordinates of the scheme location area 16.515633 N and 73.423414 E. There are mangroves near the project site. Behind the mangroves agricultural lands are present.

Proposed Kharland Scheme involves construction of bund having total length 405 m, height 4.38m and width is 3.00m at Waghotan creek, Wadapalye, Tal. Rajapur, Dist. Ratnagiri. The present land in this area is barren/uncultivable due to ingression of saline water from Waghotan creek. Earlier, the MoEF, New Delhi in the year 2003, had granted the CRZ clearance for the Kharland scheme for reclamation of 16 Ha.for agricultural purpose. Now, the KharlandDept is seeking clearance for the reclamation of 5 ha land for agricultural purpose. The Rapid EIA/EMP for the project has been submitted.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Ratnagiri District of 2011, proposed Kharland scheme falls in CRZ IA and CRZ IB area.

The Authority noted-that as per para 3 (iv) (d) of CRZ Notification, 2011, following is permissible:

(d) Measures to prevent sand bars, installation of tidal regulators, laying of storm water drains or for structures for prevention of salinity ingress and freshwater recharge based on carried out by any agency to be specified by MoEF.

The Authority noted that Kharland bund scheme proposals could be considered under the structures for prevention of salinity ingress. Expert Members raised concern over the impact of the bund on the mangroves present

Member Secretary

Page 3 of 48

Chairman &

near the project site. Officials of the Kharlanddept inform that there are cross pipes across the bund to ensure the flow of tidal water into mangroves. Hence, mangrove patch would be protected. The Authority instructed the KharlandDept that every possible measure should be implemented to ensure mangrove patch is not hampered due to lack of saline ingression. It was further discussed that since, the objective behind the kharland scheme is to protect the agricultural land for the local people behind the bund and there was earlier CRZ clearance from the MoEF in the year 2003, it was opined that the proposal could be recommended to MoEF, New Delhi under para 3(iv) (d) of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority decided that proposal of Kharland Scheme is recommended to MoEF&CC, New Delhi subject to following conditions:

- The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- KharlandDept that every possible measure such as cross drainage structures for maintenance of mangroves area. saline ingression to the mangrove area should not be obstructed.
- 3. Nalla Opening shall not be closed in any case.
- 4. Prior High Court permission is required since the mangrove would be affected due to proposed activities.
- 5. The land behind the bund under the Kharland scheme shall strictly be used for agriculture purpose only.
- 6. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

Item No.3: Proposed construction of Jetty & Approach Road at Nivati Light House, Tal. Vengurla, Dist. Sindhudurg by Public Works Department (PWD), Harbour Engineer

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Jetty & Approach Road at Nivati Lighthouse Island,

Member Secretary

Page 4 of 48

Tal. Vengurla, Dist. Sindhudurg. Proposed Length & width of the jetty is 5.5 x 13.2 m (72.6 sgm). Proposed Length & width of the road is 80 m \times 2.40 m (192 sqm)

PWD officials informed that the Nivti Island Lighthouse (Vengurla rocks) is located in the sea at distance around 8.05km from the Bhogave beach at Sindhudurg District. The Nivti Lighthouse was established in the year 1890 and commissioned in the year 1931. One can reach the island through boat; the journey takes around an hour. The steps have been cut in the rock for climbing up from landing point. However, this is no safe place for getting down, due to which locals are not able to carry out Ro-Ro service. The area is covered with hard rocks and scrub with an elevation ranging between 3 to 9 meter. Hence, from tourism point of view and for maintenance of lighthouse; jetty and approach road are suggested from locals and tourists. It will provide safety to tourists and may help locals develop economically. The Rapid EIA/ EMP for the project has been submitted.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Sindhudurg under CRZ Notification, 2011, the Nivti Island is located in CRZ-IA i.e. Ecologically sensitive area. It was noted that the site is a Bird Nesting Site. The Rapid EIA report mentions that Bird species namely, Indian Edible-nest Swiftlets, Western-Crowned Leaf Warbler, Indian Roller, Bay-Backed shrike, Rock Pigeon, Greater short- toed larks etc. were few birds observed on island during primary data collection.

The Authority noted that Indian Edible-nest Swiftlet inhabiting the Nivti Island is a rare bird species protected under schedule I of Indian Wildlife Protection Act, 1972. The said bird is known for creation of nest for laying of eggs using its own saliva. The reference of the Zoology Survey of India documents about the existence of Indian Edible-nest Swiftlet on Vengurla Rock islands. It recommends that Lighthouses and Lightships Authority of India should be informed about the nesting swiftlets and there protected status under WL (P) Act, 1974.

Member Secretary

Page 5 of 48

Expert Member, MCZMA informed that the Nivti Islands site which the only site in Coastal stretch of Maharashtra is known for mangrove species namely, "Sundari" which is found at Sundarbans.

The Authority felt that proposed jetty and approach road on the Nivti Island for the tourism purpose would invite more people on the island for tourism and may hamper the nesting activities of the birds which is an endangered species and needs protection.

In the light of above, the Authority decided that issue of environmental sensitivity of the site to be deliberated in detail manner. At present, the Authority decided to defer the matter.

Item No.4:

Proposed construction of Compound Wall behind Sharai Mashid on plot bearing S. no. 105/1 at Shriwardhan, Dist. Raigad by Shriwardhan Municipal Council

Chief Officer, Shriwardhan Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for reconstruction of compound wall behind Sharai Mashid on plot bearing S. no. 105/1 at Shriwardhan, Dist. Raigad. There is existing wall which is damaged due to high erosion. Total length of proposed protection wall is 65 m. The CO presented that the present compound wall is in a dilapidated condition and during high tidal, creek water enters into the premises of Mashid and other Govt buildings, hence, reconstruction of the compound wall is needed on urgent basis.

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 2011, the site is located in CRZ III area along the HTL and considering the ruinous status of the existing compound wall, reconstruction may be allowed. However, it considering the opinion of the Mangrove Cell, the PP needs to obtain the Mangrove Cell NoC, for confirmation, whether the site is beyond 50 m mangrove buffer zone

Member Secretary

M Q Chairman

area. If the site is situated within the 50 m mangrove buffer zone, then prior High Court permission should be obtained by the PP.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to Planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. The PP shall obtain the Mangrove Cell NoC confirming that the site is beyond 50 m mangrove buffer zone area. If the site is situated within the 50 m mangrove buffer zone, then prior High Court permission should be obtained by the PP.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.5:

Proposed construction of Musical Fountain Pond of Rock Garden on plot bearing S. No. 1255/2, 1255/3, 1255/4 & 1255/5 at Malvan, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg by Malvan Municipal Council

Chief Officer, Malvan Municipal Council presented the proposal before the Authority. Proposal is for construction of musical fountain pond of rock on plot bearing S. No. 1255/2, 1255/3, 1255/4 & 1255/5 at Malvan, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg. Total plot area is 10820.00 sqm. Musical fountain will consist of a shallow tank and sitting steps to watch the dancing fountain. Details of proposed activities for Musical Fountain Pond are as follows:

- Pathway in the form of paving blocks and rough shahabad 561.027sqm
- Steps are in RCC frame structure 676.75sqm
- Pond consists of two small well 1133.24sqm
- Parking facility

Member Secretary

Page 7 of 48

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP of Malvan under CRZ Notification, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ II area. It was noted that CRZ II area is a developable area. The musical fountain is proposed within the periphery of existing rock garden.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to Planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- Malvan Municipal Council to explore the possibility of Rainwater Harvesting at Rock Garden site for Musical fountain pond, as a water conservation measure.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.6:

Proposed development for beach side amenities & garden on plot bearing 5. no. 10 A1, 10B, 10C2 & 415 at Devgad beach, Tal. Devgad, Dist. Sindhudurg by Devgad Jamsande Nagar Panchayat.

Chief Officer, Devgad Jamsande Nagar Panchayat presented the proposal before the Authority. Nagar Panchayat has proposed following activities:

- 1) Beach side amenities development on S. No. 10 A1, 10B, 10C2 such as:
 - walkway (360 x 2.5 meter)
 - Amenity area (20x8.5 meter, 3 nos.) such as Children Sand Play Garden, Sit out and lighting.
 - Walkway will be constructed using stone pitching
 - Total beachside development area is 1950 Sqm.

Member Secretary

Page 8 of 48 Chairma

- 2) Garden development on S. No. 415 near Pavanchakki.
 - Garden (135 x 35 meter),
 - Chira walkway (1400 Sqm)
 - plantation& Lawn area (1400 Sqm)-
 - Total area is 4500 Sqm

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP, 2011, the site of Beach side amenities is in CRZ I (B) area and Garden development near pavanchakki is in CRZ III area.

The Authority noted that the beachside amenities for local people & tourists are proposed on the landward side of the beach. It was suggested that eco-friendly material should be used for walkway as beach side amenities. Nagar Panchayat officials presented that walkway will be laid using native stone called Chira. It was further suggested that no solid construction is allowed on beach area. Public access to beach should not be hampered due to proposed activities.

The Authority noted that as per para 8.III. CRZ III. (iii) (a) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, agriculture, horticulture, gardens, pasture, parks, play field, and forestry is a permissible activity.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. Nagar Panchayat to ensure that eco-friendly material should be used for walkway as beach side amenities.
- 3. No solid construction is allowed on beach area. Public access to beach should not be hampered due to proposed activities.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.

Member Secretary

Page 9 of 48

Chairman

...

5. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.7: CRZ status of Kurla Court building on plot bearing CTS No. 8 (pt), of ParighaKhadi village Kurla, Mumbai by PWD, Mumbai

Officials of the Public Works Department presented the matter before the Authority. PWD has proposed Kurla Court building on plot bearing CTS No. 8 (pt), of ParighaKhadi village Kurla, Mumbai.

The Authority noted that the PP has submitted CRZ map in 1:4000 scale & report prepared as per approved CZMP of Mumbai by IRS, Chennai dated July, 2018. As per IRS report,

- The HTL demarcated by the IRS, Chennai for Tidal influenced water bodies
 does not corresponds to the HTL as per approved CZMP in the vicinity of
 project site subject to the generalization error caused by the variation in
 map scale.
- CRZ shall be applied for the land area from HTL to 100mt/width of creek whichever is less on the landward side along the tidal influence water bodies as per Para (ii) of CRZ Notification, 2011.
- The project site in C. S. no. 8 (pt) wherein the extension of existing Metropolitan Magistrate Court Building is proposed falls outside the 100m buffer from HTL for Mithi River (Mahim Creek) as per GPS survey.

In the light of report of the IRS, Chennai, the Authority decided to confirm that the project site in C. S. no. 8 (pt) wherein the extension of existing Metropolitan Magistrate Court Building is proposed falls beyond applicable CRZ setback from the Mithi creek i.e. in non CRZ as per approved CZMP as per CRZ Notification, 2011.

Member Secretary

Acharman

Item No.8:

Proposed reconstruction of protection wall near Sarai Masjid as per S. No. 105 located at Shrivardhan, Dist. Raigad by Shrivardhan Municipal Council

Chief Officer, Shrivardhan Municipal Council informed that council had submitted 2 files for reconstruction of protection wall near Sarai Masjid at S. No. 105/1 and S. No. 105. The present proposal at S. No. 105 is same as already discussed at Sr. No. 4, hence, the same is withdrawn by the Council.

As informed by the Shrivardhan Municipal Council, the Authority decided to delist the present proposal on S. No. 105 located at Shrivardhan, Dist. Raigad from records of the MCZMA.

<u>Item No.9:</u>
Proposal for providing facilities at Deobagh Grampanchayat,
Deobagh, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg by Deobagh
Grampanchayat

Gramsevak, Deobagh Grampanchayat, Deobagh presented the proposal before the Authority. Proposal is for providing facilities at Deobagh Grampanchayat, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg.

Sr. No.	Proposed activities	Size	
1	Construction of Iron Shed for Length 12 meter existing Hall at Dr. Datta Width 09 meter Samant New English School (S. no. 7/1/2A) Area 108 Sqm		
2	Facilities / beautification of Length 12 me Devbagh Vitthal Temple Width 09 me (Loadbearing base and iron Area 108 Sqn		

Member Secretary

Chairman

: :

Page 11 of 48

	shed)	
28	(S.no. 10)	
3	Facilities / beautification of the existing Christian Cemetery Chira Stone construction (S. No. 4)	Length 42 meter Width 36meter Area 1572 Sqm

The Authority noted that as per the approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 2011 of village Deobagh, three (3) sites under reference are located in CRZ III area and within 200 meter from the High Tide Line (NDZ) and proposed activities are necessary facilities for the local residents of the Deobag village.

The Authority noted that as per para 8.I. CRZ-III of CRZ Notification, 2011, following activities may be permitted in NDZ:

(j) construction of dispensaries, schools, public rain shelter, community toilets, bridges, roads, provision of facilities for water supply, drainage, sewerage, crematoria, cemeteries and electric sub-station which are required for the local inhabitants may be permitted on a case to case basis by CZMA;

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. No construction is allowed in the beach area.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.10:

Proposed reconstruction of Judicial Building on plot bearing CS No. 678A & 678B at village Dahanu, Tal. Dahanu, Dist. Palghar by PWD, Dahanu

Member Secretary

Page 12 of 48

Officials of the Public Works Department presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for reconstruction of judicial building comprises ground floor on plot bearing C. S. No. 678A & 678B at village Dahanu, Tal. Dahanu, Dist. Palghar by demolishing existing waiting hall. Total plot area is 7936.40sqm, Permissible FSI is 1.00 and Proposed BUA is 145.21sqm

As per approved CZMP of Dahanu under CRZ Notification, 2011, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II area & is situated on landward side of existing road prior 1991.

The Authority noted that considering the site as in CRZ II area, reconstruction of authorized building could be permissible subject to FSI of the town country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991. Dahanu Municipal Council should strictly ensure that the proposed construction is within the limit of permissible FSI of 1991 norms.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed reconstruction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.11:

Proposal for retention/regularization of the compound wall on plot bearing S. No. 275, CTS no. 657(pt) at village Kanjur, Tal. Kurla, Mumbai by Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM)

Member Secretary

Page 13 of 48

The Additional Municipal Commissioner (AMC), MCGM presented the matter before the Authority. MCGM has submitted an application for retention / regularization of the compound wall admeasuring about 4.9 km at Kanjur MSW site, Kanjurmarg. The Authority noted the background of the matter which is as follows:

- The project site at Kanjur on plot bearing S. No. 275, CTS no. 657(pt) has been allotted by the Government of Maharashtra to the MCGM for the purpose of setting up of MSW facility.
- The MCGM initially applied for Environment Clearance (EC) for the entire area of 141.77 Ha. The MCZMA recommended the proposal to the MoEF on 10.12.2007. The MoEF vide letter dated 17.3.2009 granted EC for 65.96 Ha area for the construction of MSW processing facilities and sanitary landfill including landfill gas collection system, leachate collection and treatment but only allowed allied facilities such as roads and conveying systems etc. in the CRZ area.
- Subsequently, the boundary wall of 5.2 km in length (4.9 km in CRZ and 0.3 km in Non CRZ) & 12 feet in height was constructed by the MCGM around the entire land comprising the CRZ as well as the non CRZ areas.
- MoEF, new Delhi visited the site on 24.6.2013 and issued directions on 4.11.2013 mentioning that the compound walls is constructed without approval. MoEF issued directions, as per which the part of the boundary wall which was constructed in the CRZ was required to be removed. The MCGM requested the MoEF to reconsider their directives.
- Meanwhile, an NGO by the name of Vanashakti filed an appeal before Hon'ble NGT, Pune considering directives issued by the MoEF. Hon'ble NGT, Pune on 12.2.2014 directed the demolition of the boundary wall in the said Appeal.
- MCGM therefore challenged the said order of the NGT by way of filling WP (L) no. 689/2014 in the Mumbai High Court. Hon'ble High Court passed an order dated 10.6.2016 for demolition of the said compound wall.
- MCGM challenged the High Court order in Hon'ble Supreme Court. Hon'ble
 SC asks Hon'ble High Court to review the order.

Member Secretary

- MCGM filed review petition before Hon'ble High Court which is still pending before the Hon'ble High Court.
- Meanwhile, the MCGM has received the Environment and CRZ clearance on 2.2.2017 and 29.10.2018 respectively for expansion of the MSW facility in CRZ area admeasuring 52.45 Ha.

The Authority noted the order of the MoEF, New Delhi and earlier decisions of the MCZMA. It was noted that the matter is pending before the High Court as decision of review petition filed by the MCGM in the matter is yet to be decided. The MCGM presented that compound wall around the MSW facility is a mandatory required under MSW rules, 2016 and Hon'ble High Court during the hearings in review petition have observed the matter positively. MCGM officials requested MCZMA to recommend the matter to MoEF, New Delhi in light of observations of the orders of the Hon'ble High Court in review petition filed by the MCGM.

The Authority discussed that that Kanjur MSW facility is a vital project for the city of Mumbai for management of the Municipal Solid Waste. Growing Municipal Solid waste and its effective management is an environmental concern before the Authorities. However, considering the background of the matter pertaining to compound wall, the Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation decided to refer the matter to MoEF&CC, New Delhi for further appropriate decision in the matter.

<u>Item No.12:</u>
Proposed construction of New Versova Municipal School on plot bearing CTS no. 1103/252 at village Versova, Andheri (W), Mumbai by Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai (MCGM)

The MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. MCGM has proposed construction of New Versova Municipal School comprising of Ground + 3rd floors on plot bearing CTS no. 1103/252 at village Versova, Andheri (W), Mumbai. Municipal School is proposed with Zonal FSI of 1.0 as per DCR prevailing

Member Secretary

Page 15 of 48

as on 19.2.1991 with total height of 15.60 m. Area of the plot is 2512.5 sqm, Permissible FSI is 1.00 and Proposed BUA is 2126.45 sqm.

As per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ-II and landward side of existing road.

MCGM officials during the meeting clarified that the proposal is for reconstruction of Municipal School. At present, the existing school building has been demolished due to its dilapidated condition.

The Authority noted that considering the site as in CRZ II area, reconstruction of authorized building could be permissible subject to FSI of the town country planning regulations existed as on 19.2.1991. MCGM should strictly ensure that the proposed construction is within the limit of permissible FSI of 1991 norms.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed reconstruction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

<u>Item No.13:</u> CRZ status of Indian Navy land at village Turbhe near INS Tanaji, Mumbai by Indian Navy

Officials of the INS Tanaji, Sion Trombay presented the matter before the Authority. INS Tanaji, Sion Trombay has proposed married accommodation project for sailors of Indian Navy on Indian navy land at village Turbhe near Mankhurd,

Member Secretary

Page 16 of 48

L.Co Chairman

Mumbai. Applicant has submitted the approved CZMP (1:25000 scale) of Greater Mumbai of 2011 and google image indicating the plot bearing 5. No. 109 &118 of Turbhe, Mumbai. As per the submitted approved CZMP and google image, the site under reference is outside CRZ area. As per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011, the plot bearing 5. No. 109 &118 of Turbhe, Mumbai falls beyond 100 m from Creek i.e. in non CRZ area.

In the light of above, the Authority decided to confirm that the project site of plot bearing S. No. 109 & 118 (Indian Navy land) at village Turbhe near INS Tanaji falls in non CRZ as per approved CZMP as per CRZ Notification, 2011. However, the PP shall obtain the Mangrove Cell NoC confirming whether the site is beyond 50 m mangrove buffer zone area. If Mangrove cell confirms that the site under reference is beyond 50 m mangrove buffer, the matter need not be referred to MCZMA again.

Item No.14: Proposed construction of two Offshore Container Berths and development of Container Terminal on BOT basis in Mumbai Harbour by Mumbai Port Trust (MbPT)

The Mumbai Port Trust (MbPT) officials presented the proposal before the Authority. Details of the project is as follows:

- The project is an expansion of existing Mumbai Port Trust for improvement of Traffic at Mumbai Port.
- 2. Earlier, the MCZMA in its 27th meeting held on 4.5.2005 deliberated the proposal for two offshore berths and construction of container stack yard for new terminal and recommended to MoEF&CC, New Delhi on 09.05.2005. The MoEF, New Delhi had granted Environment Clearance on 15.06.2006 & amended on 09.11.2006. Validity of the clearance was also granted for 5 years upto 7.1.2014.
- 3. For grant of further extension, the MoEF&CC, New Delhi directed MbPT to apply afresh for TOR on 21.04.2016. Accordingly, the MbPT has applied for ToR on 04.04.2017 & proposal was considered by EAC (Infra

Member Secretary

Page 17 of 48

- II), New Delhi on 01.05.2017 & 27.05.2017. On the condition of the EAC, New Delhi minutes is to obtain the recommendation from the MCZMA.
- 4. Now, MbPT submitted proposal to MCZMA for remaining works of construction of two offshore container berth's and development of container terminal on BOT basis in Mumbai Harbour. EIA report has been submitted by MbPT.

Sr. No.	Description	As approved by MoEF&CC	Now Proposed	
1	Cargo Profile	Only container	Mainly General cargo namely steel, coils, RoRo and some container	
2	Capacity	12 MTPA	4.17 MTPA	
3	Area of Stackyard	45 ha	20.83 ha	
4	Cargo	New cargo	Existing cargo handled at MbPT will be shifted to OCT	
5	Berth and Trestle	700X58 m 1.2 Trestle	Same. The Work has been completed.	
6	Capital Dredging	12 million cum soil 3 lakh cum rock	Only 6.3 Million cum soil 30,000 cum rock remaining	
7	Equipment	6 quay gantry cranes 18 RTGS 2 RMCGS	 2 Nos. of 100 Ton Mobile Harbor Crane for Ship Shore Handling 27 Nos. of 20 Ton Tractor Trailor for Shore at 	

Member Secretary

	Stack yard
	 7 Nos. of 30 Ton
	Mobile Cranes at
	Stack Yard for
	Steel Cargo
,	 2 Nos. of Reach
	Stacker at Stack
	Yard for
	Container/

Completed works:

- 2 berths and approach trestle
- · Capital dredging for berth pocket
- Filling of P & V Dock
- Rail Container Depot
- Approach channel and Turning circle dredging
- Berth Packet

Pending works:

- · Procurement of Cargo handling equipment
- Container yard (Reclamation work completed. Work of development of yard mainly metalling WBM and wearing coat balance)
- Capital dredging in the approach channel and turning circle to the required depth

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ-II & IV areas.

The Authority noted that as the Minutes of EAC, New Delhi, the Public hearing is exempted since it was already conducted in the year 2005. However, Queries/Comments raised during earlier public hearing need to be documented in the form

Member Secretary

Page 19 of 48

of Management Plan. It was noted that the Rapid EIA report submitted by the PP needs to add the chapter on the above said TOR point of the EAC, New Delhi.

Accordingly, the matter was deferred for want of the Revised EIA report for the project which would have the chapter on Queries/ Comments raised during earlier public hearing need to be documented in the form of Management Plan. MbPT should also submit the CRZ map in 1:4000 scale superimposing the completed and remaining works.

Item No.15:

Proposed construction of Faecal sewage treatment plant (FSTP) under swachh Maharashtra Abhiyan on plot bearing S. no. 7/1, C. S. No. 1303(pt), Alibag, Tal. Alibag, Dist. Raigad by Alibag Municipal Council

Alibag Municipal Council officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Faecal sewage treatment plant (FSTP) under swachh Maharashtra Abhiyan on plot bearing S. no. 7/1, C. S. No. 1303(pt), Alibag, Tal. Alibag, Dist. Raigad. The UDD, GoM issued GR dated 8.11.2019 for construction of Faecal sewage treatment plant (FSTP) under swachh Maharashtra Abhiyan The present site of Alibaug is part of the said GR.

As per Alibaug Municipal Council remarks, the site is situated in CRZ II area and landward side of existing construction. The Authority noted that the FSTP is important project under swachh Maharashtra Abhiyan for improvement of hygienic conditions and overall environment of the local residents.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. Alibag Municipal Council to ensure that construction is proposed beyond 50 meter mangrove buffer zone.

Member Secretary

Page 20 of 48 Chairman

- 3. All the necessary measure should be taken for the maintenance of the FSTP and no liquid discharge is allowed in CRZ area.
- 4. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 5. Sewage and effluent should not be discharged into the coastal water body.
- 6. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.16:

Proposed Beautification Works at Mahim Beach at Mahim Reti Bunder, Gen. Arun Kumar Vaidya Marg, Mahim (W), Mumbai by MCGM

The Assistant Municipal Commissioner, MCGM presented the proposal before the Authority. MCGM has proposed the beautification works of Mahim beach at Mahim Reti Bunder, Gen. Arun Kumar Vaidya Marg, Mahim (W), Mumbai to enhance tourism value of locality and to safeguard the area from encroachment and illegal activities. Beautification at Mahim beach involves followings:

- Retaining with stone pitching
- Bamboo fencing
- · Promenade along with the pitching with railing
- sea sand filling
- seating
- strengthening of light tower
- plantation
- Wall along the police quarter
- · cleaning of debris and boulders
- Toilet Block provision.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ-II area. MCGM need to use eco-friendly material for beautification of Mahim Beach.

Member Secretary

Page 21 of 48

Lee

The Authority further noted that as per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. MCGM to ensure that beautification works is done by the eco-friendly material.
- 3. No construction is allowed on the beach area.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 5. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.17:

CRZ status for construction of Cyber Crime office and 9 staff quarters for CP Mumbai at plot bearing CTS No. 1275, Opp site Luckey Hotel, S. V. Road, Bandra (W), Mumbai by MSPHWCL

Officials of the Maharashtra State Police Housing & Welfare Corporation Ltd presented the matter before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Cyber Crime office and staff quarters for CP Mumbai at plot bearing CTS No. 1275, Opp site Luckey Hotel, S. V. Road, Bandra (W), Mumbai. Applicant has submitted the approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011 indicating the project site under reference.

The PP has submitted the approved CZMP of Greater Mumbai of 2011 showing the the plot bearing CTS No. 1275, opp site Luckey Hotel, S. V. Road, Bandra (W),

Member Secretary

Page 22 of 48

Mumbai as per which, the site falls beyond 100 m from Mahim Bay i.e. in non CRZ area.

In the light of above, the Authority decided to confirm that the project site plot bearing CTS No. 1275, Opp site Luckey Hotel, S. V. Road, Bandra (W), Mumbaifalls in non CRZ as per approved CZMP as per CRZ Notification, 2011.

Item No.18:

Proposed infrastructural Post Harvesting facilities to fishermen at Fish Landing Centre, Dhakti Dahanu, Nandgaon, Rajpuri, Dighi and Veldur in Maharashtra by Commissioner of Fisheries

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. Office of Commissioner of Fisheries intends to upgrade / develop infrastructural post harvesting facilities includes construction of jetty, boat yards with ramp, cleaning of navigational channel, fish drying platforms, approach road etc. to local fisherman at Fish landing centers at Dhakti Dahanu, Nadgaon, Rajpuri, Dighi and Veldur.

Sr. No.	Location	Proposed activities	CRZ Status as per approved CZMP, 2011
1	DhaktiDahanu, Tal. Dahanu Dist. Palghar	1) Construction of jetty connected to boat yard I (35m X 05m) 2) Construction of boat yard I (150m X 20m) 3) Construction of boat yard II (75 m X 20m) 4) Ramp connected to boat yard II (70 m X 07m)	CRZ-IB (Intertidal area) & CRZIVB (Dahanu Creek)

Member Secretary

Chairman e

		5) Construction of	
		approach road	
		(90m X 05m)	
2	Nandgaon, Tal.	1) Construction of	CRZ-IB (Intertidal
	Murud, Dist. Raigad	Gryones North &	area), CRZ IVA
		South (600 m X 600m)	(Arabian Sea) & CRZ
		2) Construction of Wharf	IVB (Creek)
		(125 m X 30 m)	
		Construction of ramp	
		attached to wharf (60	
		m X 5 m)	
		4) Clearing of	
		navigational channel	
		(750 m X 40 m)	
		5) Solar Street Light (50	
		Nos)	
3	Rajpuri, Tal. Murud,	1) Construction of boat	CRZ-IB (Intertidal
	Dist. Raigad	yard I with rubble	area), CRZ III (Rural
		protection (160m X	area) & CRZ IVB
		15m)	(Vashishti Estuary)
		2) Construction of ramp	
	2	connected to boat	
		yard I	
	8	(120 m X 7m)	
		3) Construction of box	
		culvert underneath	
		boat yard I	
		(45m X 03m)	16
		4) Construction of boat	
		yard II with rubble	
		protection (100m X	
		15m)	

Member Secretary

		5) Construction of ramp connected to boat yard II (30m X 10m)
4	Dighi, Tal. Shrivardhan, Dist. Raigad	1) Construction of boat yard (230 m X 20 m) 2) Ramp attached to boat yard (40 m X 10m) 3) Construction of jetty (50 m X 5 m) 4) Jetty head "T" (30 m X 10 m) 5) Surfacing of approach road (400 m X 5 m)
5	Veldur, Tal. Guhagar, Dist. Ratnagiri	1) Construction of Pile Jetty (100 m X 05 m) 2) Construction of fish drying platform with rubble protection (50 m X 30 m) 3) Surfacing / hard paving area (50 m X 30m) 4) Clearing of berthing area (200 m X 50 m X 3m)

The Authority noted that project aims to provide basic infrastructures of post-harvesting facilities to meet demands of fishing community from different fish landing centers. By this project, local fishermen will boost their fish Catch/landing/transporting, eventually helping to enhance state's fish production. The Authority noted the Rapid EIA/ EMP for the project. Report of the Central

Member Secretary

Page 25 of 48



Water Power Research Station (CWPRS), Pune has been submitted for the Nadgoan, Tal: Murud site with respect to tidal hydrodynamics studies.

The Authority noted the followings:

- As per para 4(i)(f) of CRZ, 2011, following is permissible:
 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities
- As per Para 3 (iv)(b) of CRZ Notification 2011, following is permissible:
 (b) Measures for control of erosion, based on scientific including Environmental Impact Assessment (hereinafter referred to as the EIA) studies
- As per para 8.III. CRZ III of CRZ Notification, 2011, following is permissible in CRZ III area:
 - (I)facilities required for local fishing communities such as fish drying yards, auction halls, net mending yards, traditional boat building yards, ice plant, ice crushing units, fish curing facilities and the like;
- As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,

For the projects specified under 4(i) (except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA. Therefore, proposal requires permission from SEIAA based on MCZMA recommendation.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal of Nandgoan, Tal: Murud, District Raigad from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

Member Secretary

Page 26 of 48

- 1. The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and quidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- Proposed construction should be as per the recommendations of the CWPRS report.
- Debris generated during the construction activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be ensured that debris is processed in a scientific manner at a designated site.
- 4. PP to ensure that mangroves if any, should be cut/ destroyed for the project. If the project is proposed in 50 m mangrove buffer zone, prior High Court permission should be obtained.
- 5. Natural course of creek/river water should not be hampered due to proposed activities.
- 6. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 7. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

With respect to other four (4) sites, the Expert Member, MCZMA suggested that the recommendation / report of the Central water Power Research Station (CWPRS) needs to be sought on impact of the solid jetty and other structures on the hydrodynamics of the coastal water body. Accordingly, the said proposals at four (4) sites are deferred for want for report/ recommendation from the CWPRS.

<u>Item No.19:</u> Proposed development of 7 projects near Kunkeshwar Temple, Kunkeshwar, Tal. Deogad, Dist. Sindhudurg by PWD, Kudal

The Project proponent presented proposal before the Authority. The PWD has proposed renovation / repair activities at Kunkeshwar Temple, Kunkeshwar, Tal.

Member Secretary

Page 27 of 48

Chairman &

Deogad, Dist. Sindhudurg. Details of the proposed activities and CRZ categories is as follows:

Sr. no.	Proposed Activities	CRZ Status	Size (in Sqm)
1.	Renovation of compound wall around Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	127.55
2.	Renovation of existing gate at Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	62.37
3.	Reconstruction of steps near Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-IB	175.00
4.	Reconstruction of viewing gallery near Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	135.00
5.	Laying of paver blocks nearKunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	1169.32
6.	Reconstruction of new Praveshdwar near Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	52.00
7.	Renewal of existing road around Kunkeshwar Temple	CRZ-III	1324.50

The purpose of the project is to increase aesthetic value of the place and to offer better facilities to the Tourist / Devotees coming at Kunkeshwar Temple.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Sindhudurg under CRZ Notification, 2011, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-IB& III area.

The Authority noted that this is miscellaneous proposal and involved renovation activities of the existing Kunkeshwar temple at Deogad, Dist. Sindhudurg. As per para 8.I. CRZ-III of CRZ Notification, 2011, following activities may be permitted in NDZ:

Member Secretary

Page 28 of 48

(j) construction of dispensaries, schools, public rain shelter, community toilets, bridges, roads, provision of facilities for water supply, drainage, sewerage, crematoria, cemeteries and electric sub-station which are required for the local inhabitants may be permitted on a case to case basis by CZMA;

The Authority discussed that Kunkeshwar temple is located on the bank of Arabian Sea and it has unique & fragile environmental settings and being an ancient temple, the Authority suggested that proper adequate measures need to be taken by the PWD while renovation /repairing works. Necessary precautions is recommended for transportation of material to the site and solid waste should not be disposed in the temple premises which is in CRZ area.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to planning Authority with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- Considering the fragile environment conditions of the area, proper care shall be taken by the PP to avoid any impact on environment attributes. Transportation of raw material shall be covered to avoid nuisance in the said area.
- 3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.20:

Proposed construction of Primary Health Centre & reconstruction of houses of Katkari Jamat Samaj situated on GovtLand on plot bearing S. No. 6A1 at mauje Kondasurde, Tal. Sangameshwar, Dist. Ratnagiri by District Collector, Ratnagiri

Officials of the District Collector, Ratnagiri presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of Primary Health Centre &

Member Secretary

Page 29 of 48

Chairman Chairman

reconstruction of houses of Katkari Jamat Samaj situated on Govt. Land on plot bearing S. No. 6A1 at mauje Kondasurde, Tal. Sangameshwar, Dist. Ratnagiri.

It was presented that there are 8 Nos. of structures constructed by Katkari Jamat Samaj which would be demolished and reconstructed on Plot No. 1 to 8 and Primary Health Centre is proposed on Plot No. 9. Total Area is 1629.00 sqm, Area for Plot No. 1 to 8 is 400 sqm, Area for PHC is 318 sqm and Area for Future Development is 205 sqm.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP of Ratnagiri District on 2011, the plot under reference partly falls within 100 m from Creek i.e. partly in CRZ-III (NDZ) and partly beyond 100 m from Creek i.e. partly in Non CRZ area.

The Authority noted that the primary Health Centre is a permissible activity in CRZ III (NDZ) as per provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. However, with respect to 8 structures of the Katkari Samaj inhabitants, clarifications / remarks is necessary from the office of District Collector in the light of following provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011:

1. As per para 8.III. CRZ-III of the CRZ Notification, 2011

- A. Area upto 200mts from HTL on the landward side in case of seafront and 100mts along tidal influenced water bodies or width of the creek whichever is less is to be earmarked as "No Development Zone (NDZ)",-
- (ii) No construction shall be permitted within NDZ except for repairs or reconstruction of existing authorized structure not exceeding existing Floor Space Index, existing plinth area and existing density and for permissible activities under the notification including facilities essential for activities; Construction/reconstruction of dwelling units of traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk may be permitted between 100 and 200 metres from the HTL along the seafront in accordance with a comprehensive plan prepared by the State Government or the Union territory in

Member Secretary

consultation with the traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk and incorporating the necessary disaster management provision, sanitation and recommended by the concerned State or the Union territory CZMA to NCZMA for approval by MoEF

2. As per para 6(d) of the CRZ Notification, 2011

The dwelling units of the traditional coastal communities including fisherfolk, tribals as were permissible under the provisions of the CRZ notification, 1991, but which have not obtained formal approval from concerned authorities under the aforesaid notification shall be considered by the respective Union territory CZMAs and the dwelling units shall be regularized subject to the following condition, namely-

- (i) these are not used for any commercial activity
- (ii) these are not sold or transferred to non-traditional coastal community.

The Authority after deliberation decided that once the clarification / remarks from the office of District Collector as stated above is received in the matter, the proposal could be taken up in MCZMA meeting for further appropriate decision in the matter as per provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority noted that the matter needs to be referred back to District Collector, Ratnagiri to obtain remarks in the light of above provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

<u>Item No.21:</u> Proposed construction of Kharland Bund of Pavanai at Pavnai, Ta. Devgad, Dist. Sindhudurg by Kharland Development Division, Sindhudurg.

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. The Authority noted that the proposal is for proposed the Kharland scheme at village Pavnai, Taluka Devgad, District Sindhudurg. The present kharland scheme intends to reclaim the

Member Secretary

Page 31 of 48

Nec Chairman

land of around 122.14 Ha by constructing the bund along the Devgad creek. This work will encourage the farmers to cultivate different types of crops like rice, horse gram and pigeon peas etc. There are no mangrove at the site as per the remarks of the Kharland dept.

In the absence of the PP, the Authority after discussion decided to defer the project and decided that PP should submit the Rapid EIA/ EMP for the project and mangrove cell report.

Item No.22:

Proposed development of Fish Landing Centre at Sakhri Agar, Tal. Guhagar, Dist. Ratnagiri by Hourbour Engineer (PWD), Ratnagiri.

PWD officials presented the proposal before the Authority. PWD Harbour Division has proposed the fish landing centre at Sakhari, Guhaghar to enhance the fishing, to develop new market for villagers. Proposed activities are as follows:

Sr. No.	Item	Size
1	RCC Jetty	32.55 m × 5 m
2	Auction place	18.23 m × 13.23 m
3	Net mending shed	15.23 m × 6.0 m
4	Dredging	60 × 20 m

The Rapid Environment Impact Assessment Report has been submitted.

As per approved CZMP, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ I (B) and IV area.

The Authority noted that the proposal was earlier discussed in 99th meeting held on 16th May, 2015. During the meeting the Authority noted that certain activity of the project is completed and decided that there is violation in the matter.

Member Secretary

Page 32 of 48

N le

Now, the PWD while forwarding the proposal has provided remarks that construction of sea wall admeasuring total length of 90 meter has been constructed without obtaining CRZ clearance. For which, show cause notice was issued on 19.5.2016 by the Dept. PWD replied on 28.9.2017. Now, this application PWD is not dealing with violation part and dealing with separate project which is non violation project.

During the meeting, the PWD officials presented that only construction of protection wall has been completed and rest of the necessary infrastructure facilities for local fishermen is yet to be constructed for which CRZ clearance is required. The PWD has submitted a report re-confirming that only protection wall of 90 meter has been constructed.

The Authority noted that as per the submission of the PWD, the activity of constructed protection sea wall has been de-linked from rest of the proposed activities such as RCC jetty, Auction place, Net mending shed and dredging which are yet to be constructed. The Authority noted that the violation matter of constructed protection wall will be dealt separately as per the provisions of the E(P) Act, 1986 read with CRZ Notification, 2011. However, rest of the proposed activities such as RCC jetty, Auction place, Net mending shed and dredging which are yet to be started are necessary infrastructure facilities and it could be allowed considering the interest of the local fishermen and their livelihood.

The Authority noted that as per para 4(i) (f) of CRZ Notification, 2011 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissibleactivities.

As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is

Member Secretary

Page 33 of 48

required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal of RCC jetty, Auction place, Net mending shed and dredging from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. This CRZ recommendation is only for proposed activities which are yet to be constructed. PWD to ensure that there shall not be violation of provision of CRZ Notification, 2011.
- 3. PP to ensure that mangroves if any, should be cut/ destroyed for the project. If the project is proposed in 50 m mangrove buffer zone, prior High Court permission should be obtained.
- 4. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 6. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.23: Proposal for laying of HDPE pipeline of treated effluent carrying pipeline from MIDC Tarapur to Deep Sea at Navapur by-MIDC

Officials of MIDC presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority after deliberation decided to defer the matter for want of more additional information from the MIDC.

<u>Item No.24:</u>
Proposed Storm Water Pumping Station on plot bearing CTS no.
739(pt) of village Oshiwara, Andheri (W), K/W ward, Mumbai by
MCGM

Member Secretary

Page 34 of 48

MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The MCGM has proposed the construction of storm water pumping station and allied facilities at MograNalla, on plot bearing CTS No. 739(pt) of village Oshiwara, Andheri (W), Mumbai. Proposed activities include construction of Mitre Gates/ tidal gates, Coarse screen, Retaining wall, Admin Building & allied civil work.Plot area is 13,870.00 Sqm and total built up area proposed is 10,505.00 Sqm

As per approved CZMP, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ IA (50 m mangrove buffer) and CRZ IB area.

The MCGM officials presented that the pumping station is proposed on the creeklet to minimize the footprint over the mangrove land. Retaining wall is necessary along the creeklet to maintain the laminar flow of the storm water as engineering requirement of the project. Due to the proposed retaining wall, around 3000 mangrove trees covering area of 2600 Sqm would be affected due to the project.

The Authority noted that storm water pumping is essential infrastructure facility to control the flood in the catchment areas of the city. However, the authority also observed that there are dense mangroves in the vicinity of the project site and in fact the existence of the mangroves would dissipate the tidal wave energy and arrest the backflow in the creeklet. Retaining wall not only would result in cutting of mangroves during construction phase, it may also obstruct the flow of tidal water into other areas of dense mangroves, causing them to perish in the long term and disturb the coastal ecology of the area.

In the light of above, the Authority after detail discussion and deliberation decided to make a joint inspection of the site. MCGM officials in the meantime would explore other possibilities to minimize the damage of mangroves. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

Member Secretary

Page 35 of 48

Item No.25: Proposed Storm Water Pumping Station on plot bearing CTS no. 144(pt) of village Wadala, F/N ward, Wadala, Mumbai by MCGM

MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The MCGM has proposed the construction of storm water pumping station and allied facilities at MahulNalla on plot bearing CS No. 144(pt), Wadala (E). Mitre gates/tidal gates, Coarse screen, retaining wall and Admin building and allied civil works is proposed.

MCGM officials informed that the site has saltpans and process of transfer of land from Salt Pan Department to MCGM is under progress. MCGM has submitted a letter dated 2nd November, 2019 of the Revenue Dept addressed to Salt Commissioner about transfer of the land. It states that the said land is owned by the Salt Commissioner. MCGM requires 24995 Sqm area of land situated at CTS No. 144(pt) at Wadala Pan Division. A proposal for transfer of this land to the MCGM is under consideration from salt dept office. As this storm water pumping station project is in the larger public interest of the MCGM. the State Govt strongly recommends the transfer of the said land.

MCGM officials further presented that the pumping station is necessary to control the flood situation in various flood prone areas such as Kings circle, Gandhi market, Wadala (E), Chembur, Kurla, Nehru Nagar etc during heavy rains and high tides. around 1500 mangrove trees would be affected due to the project.

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ IA, CRZ IB and CRZ II area. It was noted that even though the project is vital infrastructure project for flood management in the flood prone areas of Wadala & Chembur areas, the MCGM needs to explore the mitigation measures to minimize the damage of mangroves.

In the light of above, the Authority after detail discussion and deliberation decided to make a joint inspection of the site. Accordingly, the matter was deferred.

Member Secretary

Page 36 of 48 Chairman

Item No.26: Proposed service / maintenance platform for protection of existing storm water drain near Chaityabhumi, Dadar, Mumbai by MCGM

Assistant Municipal Commissioner, MCGM presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for strengthening of storm water outfall and construction of Service platform on SWD outfall at Chaityabhoomi, Dadar in G/North ward, Mumbai. The SWD outfall is currently not well maintained and is in dilapidated condition. Existing SWD outfall was earlier discharging rain water from mill area. Mills are non-functional, hence, it remains unused. Strengthening of the outfalls along with service platform is proposed. The proposed platform will camouflage with the beach ambience giving clean and well maintained access for maintenance of the outfall. Proposed platform along with lighting facility will ensure the safety & maintenance of canal. The structure is proposed in RCC, pile foundation and platform is proposed in precast over RCC platform. Platform slab is proposed with paver tile as finishing material, with anti-skid property. Railing is proposed in stainless steel along with similar style of lamp post for ambience, Size of the project is 10120 Sqm (51.5 meter x 26.5 meter)

The Authority noted that as per approved CZMP, 2011, the site under reference falls in CRZ I (B) area. As per para 3(v) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, facilities required for Storm water drains ancillary structure for pumping is a permissible activity.

As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF, For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

Member Secretary

Chairman C

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. MCGM to ensure that viewing deck is constructed using eco-friendly material.
- 3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

<u>Item No.27:</u> Proposed development of VEER TIPU SULTAN PLAYGROUND/PARK on plot bearing S. no. 263, CTS no. 2841, Lagoon Raod, Malwani, Malad (W), Mumbai by MHADA

MHADA officials presented the proposal before the Authority. MHADA has proposed development of "Veer Tipu Sultan Playground/ park" at 5 No. 263, CTS No. 2841, Lagoon road, Malwani, Malad (W), Mumbai. Details of the project is as follows:

- 1. The land bearing S. No. 263, CTS No. 2841 is Government land situated at East side of 90 ft wide DP road (namely lagoon road). This Govt land was partially encroached by the illegal garages and other activities where they used to dump garbage and debris. On demand of local residents of Malad, Hon'ble MLA has proposed the development of Playground and park on the said ground and encroachments from plot were removed by the office of Collector with help of ward office and Police dept.
- 2. In respect to develop playground and park on the said ground, Assistant Commissioner, MCGM has issued NoC on 21.4.2020. District Collector also issued NoC on 16.10.2010 over the area about 60,705 Sqm. However, before the development of the playgound and park on the said ground can be commenced, the demand of space for Metro yard on same ground is proposed

Member Secretary

by the MMRDA and major area of the said ground was allotted for Metro Yard,

- 3. Now, on the balance part of admeasuring 18415.12 Sqm, it is proposed to develop the Playground and park as per provisions of DP 2034. As per DP remarks, the reservation affecting the land ROS 1.5 (Garden/ Park).
- 4. Total area of the project site for development of playground/ garden is is 18415.12 Sqm.
- 5. The site is near the Malad creek. As per approved CZMP, 2011, the site under reference falls partly in CRZ IA (mangrove buffer zone), partly in CRZ III (Garden/ park in CRZ II) and partly outside CRZ area. (MH 78)

Sr no.	CRZ category	Area
1	CRZ IA (mangrove buffer zone)	8022.84 Sqm
2	CRZ III (Garden/ park in CRZ II)	4313.54 Sqm
3	Outside CRZ area	6078.7 1Sqm

6. Proposed activities with CRZ categories is as follows:

Sr No.	proposed activities	Size (Sqm)	CRZ category
1	Entry		
2	Portable Security cabin (4 x 4 sqm)	16	out of CRZ
3	changing room and bio toilet (10x4) 2 nos.	80	Out of CRZ
4	Grass paver pathway and pawing	2553.29	CRZ IA - 2046.62 Sqm CRZ III- 832,82 Sqm
5	Elevated planter with seat	324.82	CRZ II- 130.02 Sqm Outside CRZ - 194.80 Sqm

Member Secretary

Page 39 of 48

6	Open Gym (4 x 60)	240	CRZ III- 67.79 Sqm
	700		Out of CRZ- 169.69 Sqm
7	Children's park (23x	1035	CRZ IA- 283.72 Sqm
	45)		CRZ III- 743.56 Sqm
8	Practice Cricket pitch	583.2	CRZ III- 351,07 Sqm
	(3.6 x 27) 6 nos.	0	Out of CRZ - 230.23
			Sqm
9	grass pavers paving	614.5	CRZ IA
10	Butterfly garden	1058.40	CRZ IA
11	Multipurpose play area	2060.72	CRZ III- 492.16 Sqm
			Outside CRZ- 1051 Sqm
12	Play ground	7604	CRZ IA- 3411.41 Sqm
			CRZ III- 3407.42 Sqm
			Outside CRZ - 203.60
			Sqm
13	Chain link fencing to	300 R meter	
	protect mangroves	100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100	*
	(MS pole and MS		
	chain)	8 800	367.00
	Total plot area	18415.12 Sqm	

The Authority discussed the proposal and noted that development of the playground/garden on the said site would prevent illegal encroachments on the said land and playground/ park will act as buffer for the protection of mangroves. The Authority suggested that within 50 m mangrove buffer zone, tree plantation of native species like Ashoka tree etc could be done with chained fencing.

The Authority further noted that there are

1. As per para 8.V.1. (e) &(f)of CRZ Notification, 2011, following is permitted: (e)In order to protect and preserve the 'green lung' of the Greater Mumbai area, all open spaces, parks, gardens, playgrounds indicated in development

Member Secretary

Page 40 of 48

plans within CRZ-II shall be categorized as CRZ-III, that is, 'no development zone'.

- (f) the Floor Space Index upto 15% shall be allowed only for construction of civic amenities, stadium and gymnasium meant for recreational or sports related activities and
- 2. As per High Court order dated 17th Sep, 2018 in PIL 87/2006, the area of 50 meters shall be kept free of construction except construction of a compound wall/fencing for its protection.
- 3. As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,

For the projects specified under 4(i)(except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA.

After deliberations, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA with subject to following conditions:

- 1. PP should ensure that proposed activities in CRZ areas are as per provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended time to time).
- 2. MHADA shall do tree plantation of native species like Ashoka tree etc with chained fencing within 50 m mangrove buffer zone area.
- 3. Debris generated during the project activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be processed scientifically at a designated place.
- 4. All other required permissions should be obtained before the commencement of the project.

Item No.28:

Proposed construction of Smashan Shed on plot bearing 78 at maujeKolamb, Tal. Malvan, Dist. Sindhudurg by Collector Office, Sindhudurg

Member Secretary

Page 41 of 48

Chairman

÷ _

Sarpanch, Kolamb presented the matter before the Authority. The proposal is construction of Cemetery at S. No. 78, village Kolamb, Tal: Malvan, Sindhudurg. Sarpanch informed that there is existing old iron as a cemetery. Construction of cemetery is very much needed at the site for the Kolamb and its surrounding villages.

The Authority noted that as per the collector office remarks, the site is situated in CRZ I(B). There is existing iron stand as cemetery on the site under reference. Sea water ingression is not present on the site, since there is bund along the site.

The Authority observed the google image of the site as well as approved CZMP, 2011 and noted that the site of iron shed is on the landward side of the beach and seems at the boundary of the HTL and may be in CRZ III area. However, exact superimposition of the site on approved CZMP, 2011 is required. In CRZ III area, construction of cemetery for the local people is a permissible activity, as per CRZ Notification, 2011. However, in CRZ I(B), only repair/renovation works of existing ion shed may be allowed.

The Authority noted that the proposal is an essential need for the villagers. However, exact superimposition of the site on approved CZMP, 2011 is required from planning Authority i.e. District Collector office to ascertain CRZ status of the site. Accordingly, the matter is referred back to District Collector office, Ratnagiri. The matter is deferred for want of above said information.

<u>Discussion Item.1:</u> Modification of reservations on Plot No. 119A, 105, Garden Plot in the sanctioned DP of BBRS under Section

of 37 of MRTP Act, 1966 by MMRDA

Town Planner, MMRDA presented the matter before the Authority. MMRDA vide letter no. TCP (P-1)/BBRS/misc./6.336/A-23/2020 dated 28.02.2020 has requested MCZMA to offer remarks regarding modification of the reservations of

Member Secretary

Page 42 of 48

plot no. 105, 119A & Garden Plot in the sanction DP of BBR Scheme, Block III to VI, under section 37 of MRTP Act, 1966.

MMRDA has mentioned that, Urban development Department, Government of Maharashtra vide notification dated 03.06.200 & 17.3.201 has sanctioned the development plans of Back Bay Reclamation Scheme (BBRS). Now, MMRDA has published the Notice under section 37 (1) of MRTP Act, 1966 for inviting suggestion / objection from public on 04.07.2019 regarding modification of reservations on Plot No. 119A, 105, Garden Plot in the sanctioned DP of BBRS. As per the CZMP of 2011 and draft CZMP of 2019, the plot under reference falls in CRZ. The existing land use& proposed modifications are as follows-

Sr. No.	Plot No.	MCGM A Ward DP (1990)	MMRDA sanctioned DP (2000 & 2001)	Proposed Modification
1	105	Police Parade Ground	Parking	School
2	119 A	Municipal School	School	Parking
3	Bay View Marina Garden	No Development Zone	Garden & Play ground	Play Ground of 2500 sqm size carved out from the Bay View Marina Garden for proposed School on plot no. 105.

The MMRDA is requested to give remarks for the said proposed modification.

The Authority noted that the reservation interchange of plot no. 105 & 119A is proposed on CRZ II (partly) land. The matter falls under the purview of planning Authority and there is no need of MCZMA remarks in the said matter. However, prior CRZ recommendation from the MCZMA is mandatory for the construction on the above said sites, as per provisions of the CRZ Notification, 2011. The

Member Secretary

Page 43 of 48

K_@ Chairman

Authority after discussion decided to communicate the same to MMRDA in the said matter.

Additional

Item No.1:

Proposed infrastructural Post Harvesting facilities to fishermen at Fish Landing Centre, Uttan Bhatodi, Uttan Patan and Navabag in Maharashtra by Commissioner of Fisheries

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. Office of Commissioner of Fisheries intends to upgrade / develop infrastructural post harvesting facilities includes construction of breakwater, construction of jetty, boat yards with ramp, cleaning of navigational channel, approach road etc to local fisherman at Fish landing centers at Uttan Bhatodi, Uttan Patan and Navabag.

Sr. No.	Location	Proposed activities	CRZ Status as per approved CZMP,
1	Uttan Bhatodi,Dist. Thane	 Construction of breakwater (245 m) Construction of Boat yard (60 m x 25m) Construction of ramp attached to boat yard (7m x 120m) Solar Street Light (70 nos) Creation of Boat Basin (500 m x 50m) Creation of approach channel (200 m x 40m) 	CRZ-IB (Intertidal area)
2	Uttan Patan, Dist. Thane	1) Construction of Breakwater (245 m)	CRZ-IB (Intertidal area)

Member Secretary

9		 2) Construction of Boat yard (60m x 25 m) 3) Construction of ramp connected to boat yard (7 m x 120 m) 4) Solar street light (70 nos) 	
3	Navabag, Dist. Sindhudurg	 Extension of pile jetty (42.5 x 5.5 m) Construction of boat yard with ramp (50m x 30m) Construction of breakwater (500m) Surfacing of approach road (120m) Clearing of navigational channel (350 x 35 x 2.5 m) 	CRZ-IB (Intertidal area) CRZ III CRZ IVA & CRZ IVB (Navabag Creek)

The PP has submitted the EIA/ EMP for the project.

The Authority noted that project aims for up gradation in existing facilities/create permanent safe basic infrastructures of post -harvesting facilities to meet demands of fishing community from different fish landing centers. Thus, upgrading the basic requirement of local fishermen will boost their fish Catch/landing/transporting, eventually helping to enhance state's fish production. The Authority noted the Rapid EIA/ EMP for the project. Report of the Central Water Power Research Station (CWPRS), Pune has been submitted for two (2) sites at Uttan Bhatodi and Uttan Patan, District Thane.

Member Secretary

Page 45 of 48 Chairman

The Authority noted the followings:

- As per para 4(i)(f) of CRZ, 2011, following is permissible:
 Construction and operation for ports and harbours, jetties, wharves, quays, slipways, ship construction yards, breakwaters, groynes, erosion control measures are permissible activities
- As per Para 3 (iv)(b) of CRZ Notification 2011, following is permissible:
 (b) Measures for control of erosion, based on scientific including Environmental Impact Assessment (hereinafter referred to as the EIA) studies
- As per para 8.III. CRZ III of CRZ Notification, 2011, following is permissible in CRZ III area:
 - (I)facilities required for local fishing communities such as fish drying yards, auction halls, net mending yards, traditional boat building yards, ice plant, ice crushing units, fish curing facilities and the like;
- As per amended CRZ Notification dated 28th November, 2014 published by MoEF,

For the projects specified under 4(i) (except with respect to item (d) thereof relating to building projects with less than 20,000 sqm of built up area) and for the projects not attracting EIA Notification, 2006, clearance from SEIAA is required based on the recommendation from MCZMA. Therefore, proposal requires permission from SEIAA based on MCZMA recommendation.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal of two (2) sites at Uttan Bhatodi and Uttan Patan, District Thane from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to following conditions:

Member Secretary

Chairman

Page 46 of 48

- The proposed construction should be carried out strictly as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (as amended from time to time) and guidelines/ clarifications given by MoEF from time to time.
- Proposed construction should be as per the recommendations of the CWPRS report.
- 3. Debris generated during the construction activity should not be dumped in CRZ area. It should be ensured that debris is processed in a scientific manner at a designated site.
- 4. PP to ensure that mangroves if any, should be cut/ destroyed for the project. If the project is proposed in 50 m mangrove buffer zone, prior High Court permission should be obtained.
- 5. Natural course of creek/river water should not be hampered due to proposed activities.
- 6. Environment Management Plan should be implemented effectively during construction and operation phase of the project.
- 7. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

With respect to site of Navabag, Dist. Sindhudurg, the Expert Member, MCZMA suggested that the recommendation / report of the Central water Power Research Station (CWPRS) needs to be sought on impact of the solid jetty and other structures on the hydrodynamics of the coastal water body. Accordingly, the said proposal is deferred for want for report/recommendation from the CWPRS.

Meeting	g ended wit	h vote of	fthanks
---------	-------------	-----------	---------

Member Secretary

Page 47 of 48

hairman

E ...

Annexure I

List of members/officials present in the online meeting:

- 1. Mrs. Neenu Somraj, DCF, Mangrove Cell, Member MCZMA
- 2. Mr. Padmakar Nandushekhar, Environment Advisor, MIDC, representative of Industries Department, Member MCZMA
- 3. Shri. Chakradhar Kandalkar, Dy Ch.E. MCGM, Member MCZMA
- 4. Dr. Mahesh Shindikar, College of Engineering, Pune, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 5. Dr. A. K. Chaubey, NIO, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 6. Mr. Maruti Kudale, Ex Director, CWPRS, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 7. Dr. M. S. Khot, Principal, Chhatrapati Sambhaji Raje Sainik School, Ratnagiri, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 8. Mr. Narendra Toke, Director, Environment, Member Secretary, MCZMA

Member Secretary

Page 48 of 48