Minutes of the 120th meeting of the Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held under the Chairmanship of Additional Chief Secretary, Environment on 28th July, 2017 in Conference Hall, 4th Floor, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Kalpataru Point, Opp. Cinemax, Sion (E), Mumbai. List of the member present in the meeting is enclosed as Annexure-I.

Confirmation of 119th minutes:

The minutes of the 119^{th} meeting of the MCZMA held on 28^{th} to 30^{th} June, 2017 were confirmed with following changes:

<u>Item no. 46:</u>

- At page 51, Lines no. 18 to 20 from top should be replaced as follows:
 The Authority, decided to recommend the proposal to concerned planning Authority from CRZ point of view subject strict compliance of following conditions:
- At Page 51, condition no. 3 should be replaced as follows:
 The PP to submit the copy of public hearing report to MCGM and MCZMA. The MCGM to ensure that concern expressed in public hearing should be addressed before giving Commencement Certificate to the project.

Item No. 62:

- At page 61, Lines no. 7 to 9 from top should be replaced as follows:
 The Authority, decided to recommend the proposal to concerned planning Authority from CRZ point of view subject strict compliance of following conditions:
- At Page 61, condition no. 4 should be added as follows:
 The PP to submit the copy of public hearing report to MCGM and MCZMA.
 The MCGM to ensure that concern expressed in public hearing should be addressed before giving Commencement Certificate to the project.

Member Secretary

Page 1 of 25

<u>Item No. 1:</u> Preparation of CZMP of Greater Mumbai, Raigad, Ratnagiri, Sindhudurg, Thane and Palghar districts.

The Authority noted that the draft Coastal Zone Management Plans (CZMPs) of the Mumbai, Raigad and Ratnagiri districts, under CRZ Notification, 2011 have been published by the State Environment Department/ MCZMA vide its notice dated 29th March, 2016 for inviting suggestions and objections from the public domain within 45 days. The Authority in its last meeting i.e. 119th meeting on 28th and 29th June, 2017 requested District Collector and MPCB office to conduct the public hearing on draft CZMPs. The Authority decided that all the suggestions / objections received on draft CZMPs should be sent to IRS, Chennai for technical scrutiny and ascertain scientific basis for incorporation of suggestions / objections in the draft CZMP. The Authority noted that suggestions / objections received are mostly on 1) Limit the HTL as per the 5 ppt salinity concentration criteria as stipulated in CRZ Notification, 2011 and as per the survey done by the MoEF Authorized agency 2) examine the coastal water body (Bay, creek, river with 5 ppt salinity etc) 3) Change in status of ecologically sensitive areas compared with approved CZMP 4) Newly covered areas in proposed draft CZMP Versus approved CZMP. MoEF authorized agency to examine on scientific and technical criteria all above suggestions /objections as categorised above and submit report to State Environment Dept / MCZMA. Draft CZMPs will be submitted to MoEFCC, New Delhi through State Government for final approval, as per the para 5(vi) of CRZ Notification, 2011.

The NCESS, Kerala vide letter dated 20.7.2017 has sent the draft CZMPs of Sindhudrug district in Hard Copy. There are total 21 sheets in 1:25000 scale. The MCZMA vide email dated 27.7.2017 has requested NCESS, Kerala to make available the said maps in soft copy format in CD so that maps could be published in public domain for suggestions/objections. On receipt of the same by NCESS, Kerala, the said draft CZMPs would be published in public domain for inviting suggestions/ objections as per the procedure stipulated in CRZ Notification and as per the Court order.

Regarding Thane draft CZMP, the NCESS, Kerala has informed that payment issue is pending in respect of the HTL and CZMP of the Thane

Member Secretary

Page 2 of 25

Municipal Corporation area. The NCESS has informed that payment from the Municipal Corporations in Thane districts - 1) Vasai Virar Municipal Corporation 2) Mira Bhayander Municipal Corporation 3) Kalyan Dombiwali Municipal Corporation and 4) Bhiwandi Naizampur Municipal Corporation. 5) Thane Municipal Corporation is pending.

The Municipal Commissioner, KDMC, representatives from Vasai Virar Municipal Corporation, Bhiwandi Nizampur Municipal Corporation were present for the meeting. They informed that they need to check with the MoU and payment would be released immediately to NCESS, Kerala. Representative from the Thane Municipal Corporation was absent for the said meeting.

Considering the time given by the Hon. High Court of Mumbai in the matter of WP No. 7393/2016 and Hon'ble NGT in Application no. 117/2015, The Authority directed rest of the Municipal Corporations in Thane district such as MBMC, VVMC etc. to make payment to NCESS, Kerala towards preparation of CZMP of Thane and Palghar district. Till Municipal Corporations make payment to NCESS, Kerala/ Environment Dept., no proposal from such Municipal Corporations would be considered by the MCZMA and it will be brought to the notice of the Hon'ble High Court and NGT. The Authority further decided to make payment to NCESS, Kerala on behalf of Thane Municipal Corporation, Bhiwandi Nizampur, Kalyan Dombiwali Municipal Corporation, as they have not yet done any payment till date to NCESS, Kerala. However, these Municipal Corporations, in turn, have to make payment to MCZMA immediately to avoid the contempt of the Court/ NGT order regarding time line for preparation of CZMP.

The Authority further decided to evaluate the payment pending to NCESS, Kerala for Thane including Palghar district & Sindhudurg district and if, 75% of the total payment is not released to NCESS, balance amount would be released to NCESS, Kerala by the MCZMA immediately to achieve timeline given by Court. Authority also decided to release balance payment proportionally to IRS, Chennai after receipt of utilisation certificate of earlier amount paid to IRS, Chennai.

Member Secretary

Page 3 of 25

<u>Item No.2:</u> Proposals of Kharland Development Department

The Authority noted that in last meeting i.e. 119^{th} meeting held on 28^{th} and 29^{th} June, 2017 deliberated the following Kharland proposals:

Sr.	Proposals
No.	
1	Proposed construction of Saline Embankment for Koni Kalvane Scheme, Tal. Panvel, Dist. Raigad by Kharland Survey & Inv. Division, Pen - Raigad
2	Proposed construction of Saline Embankment for 13 Schemes in Dist. Raigad by Kharland Survey & Inv. Division, Pen - Raigad. 1) Kandalvada New, 2) Kandalvada Old, 3) Kudgaon Harvit, 4) Yashvanti, 5) Uchel Virjoli, 6) Gophan, 7) Belkhar Lebhi, 8) Sonkhotha Hashivare, 9) Narangi, 10) Bhonang, 11) Shahabaj, 12) Rayande Pezari, 13) Jui Habbas
3	Proposed construction of Saline Embankment for 8 Schemes in Dist. Palghar by Kharland Development Circle (105th Compliance Case), 1) Dehane & Lingpada, 2) Vangaon, 3) Dedale & Kolvali, 4) Umroli & Panchali, 5) Alyali & Tembhude, 6) Virathanbudhruk & Mithagar, 7) Tembikhodave & Kandrebhure, 8) Darshet & Umberpada
4	Proposal for construction of saline embankments at three sites in Sindhudurg district Maharashtra by Sindhudurg Kharland Development Div. Sindhudurg Nagari 1) Belwadi-Jamsande Kharland Scheme 2) Mondpar Kharland Scheme 3) Sarambal Kharland Scheme -

The Authority in its earlier meeting noted that sites wherein new Kharland bunds proposed have mangroves vegetation and rapid EIA submitted has not reported the impact of the bunds on mangroves. Further, the embankment is proposed in CRZ I area. As per the high Court Order in the matter of WP No. 3246/2004 and PIL 86/2006 no construction is allowed in mangroves or its 50m Mangroves Buffer Zone. Hence, the proposals were rejected.

Member Secretary

Page 4 of 25 Chairman

Minutes of the 120^{th} meeting of Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 28^{th} July, 2017

The Authority once again discussed the proposals at length and felt that construction of Khar bund is required for protecting agricultural land and human settlements. It was also noted that Kharland bunds were constructed prior to CRZ Notification, 1991 to protect agricultural land and villages residing near the coastline. However, these bunds were not maintained regularly by Kharland Department and resulted into mangrove growth into the agricultural fields. The Authority further noted the earlier CRZ clearance granted to the Kharland schemes by the MoEF, New Dehi under CRZ Notification, 1991.

The Authority also noted the para 3(iv) (b) (d) of the CRZ Notification of 2011, as per which following is permissible:

- (b) Measures for control of erosion, based on scientific including Environmental Impact Assessment (hereinafter referred to as the EIA) studies
- (d) Measures to prevent sand bars, installation of tidal regulators, laying of storm water drains or for structures for prevention of salinity ingress and freshwater recharge based on carried out by the any agency to be specified by the MoEF"

The Authority noted that clarity is required from MoEF whether the Kharland bund schemes can be considered as 'structures for prevention of salinity ingress' as it is not specifically mentioned in the Notification and also in the activities to be regulated by CZMA/ SEIAA in para 4(i) of CRZ Notification, 2011 though it is mentioned in Para 3 (iv) (d) of CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority further noted that as per para 8(i) of the CRZ Notification, 2011, development or construction activities in different categories of CRZ shall be regulated by the concerned CZMA in accordance with the norms stipulated in therein. It was also noted that construction of new Kharland bund activity is not covered under para 4(i) and 8 of the CRZ Notification, 2011 and hence, it could not be regulated by the MCZMA. The Authority felt that Kharland bund is required activity for protection of the agricultural land and human settlements by the Kharland Department. Further, the Authority noted representations received from public representatives in the matter.

Member Secretary

Page 5 of 25

Considering the above after deliberation, the Authority recommended to refer the matter to MoEFCC, New Delhi for further appropriate decision with regards to construction of new Kharland bunds proposed by Kharland Department, GoM.

<u>Item No.3:</u>
Construction of Nagaland State Guest House cum Emporium at Plot No. 2B, Sector - 30A, Vashi, Navi Mumbai by PWD, Govt. of Nagaland

The Authority noted the background of the proposal which is as follows:

- 1. Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation vide letter dated 15.11.2007 granted Commencement Certificate for construction at Plot No. 2B, Sector 30A, Vashi, Navi Mumbai by PWD, Govt. of Nagaland. CIDCO vide letter dated 18.1.2013 granted Completion Certificate. Construction of building is completed and the matter is pending with planning Authority for grant of Occupation Certificate.
- 2. The Authority in its 99th meeting observed that as per clause (Viii) of S.O. 18(E) dated 4.1.2002, prior CRZ recommendation from MCZMA was mandatory in the subject proposal, when project got commencement certificate dated 15.11.2007 from concerned planning Authority. Authority after detailed discussion and deliberation decided that this is a case of violation of CRZ Notification, 1991 & 2011 and matter be referred to Environment Department for further proceeding in accordance with Office Memorandum dated 12.12.2012 & 27.6.2013 & 24.7.2014 issued by the MoEF, New Delhi.
- 3. Accordingly, the matter was referred to Environment Department for further proceedings in accordance with Office Memorandum dated 12.12.2012, 27.6.2013 & 24.7.2014 issued by the MoEF, New Delhi.
- 4. Proposed directions were issued to PP u/s/ 5 of the Environment (P) Act, 1986 r.w. CRZ Notification dated 19.2.1991 & 6.1.2011 vide letter dated 3.6.2016. Simultaneously, the Member Secretary, MPCB as well as Assistant Director Town Planning, Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation

Member Secretary

Page 6 of 25 Chainma

were requested to submit their verification reports in the above matter vide letters dated 3.6.2016. PP has submitted their reply dated 26.7.2016. CIDCO and NMMC also submitted their say.

5. The MPCB has submitted a report dated 29.5.2017 wherein it is stated that officials of the Board have caused visit to the construction site of PWD on 26.5.2017. During visit it was observed that the PP has completed construction work of BUA 3941.106 sqm at site in 2010 as per CC from NMMC dated. 15.11.2007. It is also stated in the report that at present the construction work of Guest house building (G+4) and Staff quarters (G+2) is completed, but presently not occupied.

The Environment Dept. has referred back the above project to the MCZMA to take appropriate decision in the matter about alleged violation in ensuing Authority meeting.

The Authority noted that the MoEF has issued notification dated 14^{th} March, 2017 about the violation cases. The Authority decided to inform to project proponent to apply to MoEF, New Delhi as per the Notification dated 14^{th} March, 2017 for appropriate decision in the matter.

<u>Item No.4:</u>
Proposed modernization and upgradation of Brihan Mumbai Mahanagarpalika Kreeda Bhavan at Shivaji park, Dadar in G/N ward, Mumbai by MCGM

The MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for redevelopment of Brihan Mumbai Mahanagarpalika Kreeda Bhavan (Municipal Gymkhana) on plot bearing CS No. 1/497(pt), 1/374(pt) and 497 (pt) of Mahim Division at Shivaji Park, Dadar in G/N ward, Mumbai by MCGM.

As per approved CZMP of Mumbai, the plot under reference falls in CRZ-II and landward side of existing road. Area of the Plot is 3106.36 sqm.

Member Secretary

Page 7 of 25

The existing Municipal Gymkhana comprises of Ground + 2 upper floors on plot is in dilapidated condition. Proposed building for Municipal Gymkhana comprised of Basement + Ground + $1^{\rm st}$ to $5^{\rm th}$ upper floors.

As per DP of 1967, the plot under reference is situated in Residential Zone & designated for the public purpose of existing Swimming Pool. As per sanctioned DP of 1991, the plot under reference is situated in Residential Zone & designated for the public purpose of Municipal Gymkhana, Welfare Centre (part of larger reservation) & RG.

The Authority noted that the proposal can be granted as per DCR as on 19.2.1991. However, the Authority felt that architectural design of the proposed building could be planned in more aesthetically beautiful manner fitting to the surrounding area.

The Authority after deliberation decided to defer the proposal for submission of the following information by the PP:

- 1. MCGM to revise the architectural design of the proposed building confirming to surrounding architectural style.
- 2. PP to submit the details of environmental provisions such as STP, Solid waste management, Renewable energy and Rainwater harvesting

<u>Item No.5:</u>
Proposed extension and strengthening of jetty near Railway Bridge at Mira Bhayandar, Dist. Thane by MMB

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. Proposal details are as follows:

- Proposal is for extension and strengthening of jetty near Railway Brigde
 (E) at Mira Bhayandar, Dist. Thane. Total length of the jetty is 56 x 21 m.
- 2. Repairs include repairs to old existing jetty, flooring, protection wall, reconstruction of jetty.
- 3. Removing of old debris, repairs to flooring and UCR masonry wall.
- 4. As per approved CZMP, the site is situated in CRZ I area.

Member Secretary

Page 8 of 25

Chainman

The Authority noted the observations made in the Rapid EIA report submitted by the MMB.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to SEIAA subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. Proposed development should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time).
- 2. Mangroves, if any on site, should not be cut / destroyed for the project.
- 3. Construction debris should not be dumped into the creek.
- 4. All other necessary permissions from different competent authorities shall be taken before commencement of the proposed activities.

<u>Item No.6:</u> Proposed beautification and approach at Kalamb, Tal. Vasai, Dist. Palghar, MMB

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted that the proposal is for beautification and approach at Kalamb, Tal. Vasai, Dist. Palghar. Beautification includes promenade, Concrete flooring, Providing and fixing Stainless Steel Chair with Seat size 71"x27"x31" total weight 45kg silver color. MMB has submitted the EIA report.

The Authority discussed the proposal that beautification by way of putting solid structures like promenade, concrete flooring could not be allowed in the light of provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to reject the proposal from $\mbox{\it CRZ}$ point of view.

<u>Item No.7:</u> Proposed beautification and approach on existing bund at Rajodi, Tal. Vasai, Dist. Palghar by MMB

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for beautification and approach on existing bund at Rajodi, Tal. Vasai, Dist. Palghar. The proposal was earlier deliberated in the 115th meeting

Member Secretary

Page 9 of 25

hairmar

of MCZMA held on 17th & 18th January, 2017, wherein Authority instructed the PP to submit detail impact assessment analysis of the proposed activities along with ecosystem based remedial measures. The MMB replied to MCZMA stating the proposal involves beautification includes promenade, Concrete flooring, Supply and erecting duly certified by MNRE solar street light fitting with 9/11W CFL, Providing and fixing Stainless Steel Chair with Seat size 71"x27"x31" total weight 45 kg silver color.

The Authority discussed the proposal that beautification by way of putting solid structures like promenade, concrete flooring could not be allowed in the light of provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to reject the proposal from $\ensuremath{\mathsf{CRZ}}$ point of view.

<u>Item No.8:</u> Proposed beautification of Gorai Beach Promenade at Gorai, Mumbai by MMB

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal was earlier deliberated in the 115th meeting of MCZMA held on 17th& 18th January, 2017, wherein Authority noted that instead of proposing the solid structures on Gorai beach, which is a CRZ I area, the MMB need to explore other options for beautification of Gorai Beach, Promenade on beach along with cost benefit analysis & revert. The MMB vide email dated 25.07.2017 submitted reply submitting the details of the proposal with Rapid EIA. The proposal involves Beautification includes repairs to old bund, construction concrete pathway, construction of parapet wall/curb wall, Providing solar street light, Length 530 m.

The Authority discussed the proposal that beautification by way of putting solid structures like concrete flooring, parapet wall/curb wall, could not be allowed, in the light of provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to reject the proposal from CRZ point of view.

Member Secretary

Page 10 of 25

<u>Item No.9:</u>
Proposed beautification & protection of promenade Near Kadeshwari Mandir at Bandra Band Stand, Bandra (W), Mumbai Suburban by MMB

The MMB officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for beautification & protection of promenade Near Kadeshwari Mandir at Bandra Band Stand, Bandra (W), Mumbai. The proposal was earlier deliberated in the 115th meeting of MCZMA held on 17th & 18th January, 2017, wherein Authority noted instructed MMB to explore other options i.e. soft engineering solution or ecosystem based beautification plan. The MMB vide email dated 25.07.2017 submitted that beautification includes repairs to old bund, construction concrete pathway, construction of parapet wall/curb wall, Providing solar street light and Length is around 480 m.

The Authority noted that the MCGM has also undertaking the proposal of beautification of the area around the Bandra fort and Kadeshwari temple at Bandra. MCZMA in its earlier meeting has recommended the proposal of MCGM with a condition that no hard structure will be permissible in seaward side. The Authority opined that the MMB need to consult MCGM about the proposal.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to defer the proposal for submission of the necessity of the proposal, in the light of MCGM beautification proposal in the said area to avoid overlapping.

Item No.10: Proposed construction of Transformer Room in Naval Dockyard, Mumbai by Naval Dockyard

The officers from the Naval Dockyard, Kuldeep sing presented the proposal. The Authority noted that the proposal is for construction of Transformer Room comprises of ground floor + first floor on plot bearing S. No. 44 A in Naval Dockyard, Mumbai. The plot under reference falls in CRZ-II area & is situated on landward side of existing road. Total plot area - 73.00 sqm

Member Secretary

Page 11 of 25

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed construction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project
- 2. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.11:

Proposed redevelopment of Transit Camp with Transit EWS & MIG Type Tenements on land bearing at S. No. 113 (pt), CTS No. 356 A, Kannamwar Nagar, Vikhroli (E), Mumbai by MHADA

Officials from the MHADA presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted that the proposal is for redevelopment for EWS, MIG tenements and transit camp on land bearing at S. No. 113(pt) CTS No. 356 A (Government land) Kannamwar Nagar, Vikhroli (E), Mumbai. Redevelopment is proposed in Pocket I and pocket II. The proposed redevelopment involved residential and commercial development on land under reference. It was also stated by PP that buildings are declared dilapidated before 6.1.2011.

Proposal was earlier considered in 116th meeting of the MCZMA held on22.3.2017. The MHADA vide letter dated 10.7.2017 submitted reply. PP submitted the Project layout superimposed on Development Plan indicating CRZ setback lines, Copy of 1967 Development Plan & Details of STP, Solid Waste Management, Rain water Harvesting, Solar Energy, etc.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

 Proposed redevelopment should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011

Member Secretary

Page 12 of 25

Minutes of the 120^{th} meeting of Maharashtra Coastal Zone Management Authority (MCZMA) held on 28^{th} July, 2017

- Local body to ensure that existing buildings are identified as 'dilapidated' prior to 6.1.2011
- Local body to ensure FSI involved in the proposal is as per the prevailing DCR as per Para 8(v) of CRZ Notification, 2011. However, planning authority to again ascertain that the existing buildings are identified as dilapidated as on 6.1.2011 before according commencement certificate. FSI for the buildings other than dilapidated should be in accordance with DCR existing as on 19.2.1991
- MHADA to submit the approved CRZ map in 1:4000 scale superimposing the project layout and public hearing report to planning authority and MCZMA.
- PP to obtain Environmental clearance if the construction is more than 20,000sqm from appropriate competent authority before commencement of the work as per the EIA Notification of 2006 amended time to time.
- PP to submit undertaking that buildings were dilapidated before 6.1.2011 to authority and planning authority.
- All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.12: Proposed amendment of CRZ clearance of construction of fifth Oil Berth at Jawahar Dweep in Mumbai Harbour by MbPT

The Officer of the MbPT presented the proposal before the Authority, which is as follows:

- The MCZMA in its 109th meeting held on 19.12.2015 has recommended the proposal of fifth oil berth at Dweep in Mumbai Harbour, subject to certain conditions. One of the condition is as follows: "MbPT to ensure that no reclamation at Jawahar Dweep for tank farms is carried out"
- Based on the above, MbPT had referred the matter to the consultants for erection of tankages on piled structure with Deck. The consultants have suggested that it is technically feasible, but would involve huge expenditure when compared to reclamation and also from environment

Member Secretary

Page 13 of 25

point of view, the reclamation would be more suitable as the spillage can be contained within the reclaimed area.

 Incidentally, MbPT and JNPT will be deepening the existing approach channel which would involve soil and rock dredging. The rock quantity is to the extent of about 1.4 million cum and the same is proposed to be dumped in the deep sea, which can be effectively used for the filling purpose.

The MbPT has requested the Authority to amend the above said condition no. (v) of recommendation so that reclamation could be allowed.

The matter was earlier deliberated in 119th meeting of the MCZMA held on28th& 29th June, 2017, wherein the Authority opined that MbPT need to explore other options for locating tank farms other than reclamation which is not permissible activity as per the CRZ Notification, 2011. Further, MbPT need to clarify whether the tank farm is the port related activity.

The MbPT vide letter dated 3.7.2017 submitted its reply to MCZMA as per which:

- Mumbai Port Trust (MbPT) proposed the construction of its 5th Oil Berth at Jawahar Dweep in Mumbai Harbour. MbPT has obtained the necessary Environmental/CRZ Clearance for this proposed development (vide F.No.10-4/2015-IA.111, dated May 25, 2016. CTE for proposed development has also been obtained from MPCB. Accordingly, construction for the 5th Oil Berth has since commenced.
- As part of the proposed development, MbPT had initially proposed to reclaim about 13 hectare of area for development of tank farms on the south side of Jawahar Dweep reef area, abutting the existing approach trestle to JD4 berth. However, during deliberations at time of CRZ appraisal by MCZMA, the committee asked that MbPT do not take up reclamation and instead set up the tankage on a stilt platform.
- Now, due to availability of the dredged rock material of the JNPT Capital dredging which would otherwise have been dumped in deep sea, MbPT seeks an amendment in the Environmental/CRZ clearance to permit

Member Secretary

Page 14 of 25

reclamation for setting up a tank farm on the reclaimed area. Thus, the proposal of MbPT for utilizing the dredged rock material is environmental friendly.

- Based on the clauses of the CRZ Notification, MbPT is of opinion that reclamation for the purpose of setting up tank farm can be permitted in CRZ area.
- MbPT is requested MCZMA to reconsider the proposal for permitting a tank farm over reclaimed area.

The MbPT officials submitted that tank farm is a port related activity. The MbPT further informed that dredging material is available from JNPT rock material which will be used for reclamation purpose. MbPT officials requested the Authority to allow the tank farm by way of reclamation.

In the light of above, the Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the matter to MoEF, New Delhi for amendment in the condition stipulated in Environment Clearance dated May 25, 2016 subject to condition that impact of the reclamation of water body on surrounding area and marine ecosystem should be evaluated and submitted to MoEFCC, New Delhi. Further, other required permissions like Environment Clearance etc as applicable should be obtained by the MbPT.

Item No.13: Proposed construction of small training jetty at S. No. 08, village Versave, Ghodbunder, Dist. Thane

The proposal is of M/s Marine Training Academy, which is a private proposal. The Authority decided to defer the proposal, since Govt proposals were considered in the meeting. The PP was also absent for the meeting.

Item No.14:

Proposed work of provision illumination by decorative street lights at Seven Bangalow beach and Versova Beach, K/W ward, Andheri (W), Mumbai by MCGM

The Authority noted that the proposal is for illumination by decorative street lights at Seven Bangalow beach and Versova Beach, K/W ward, Andheri (W),

Member Secretary

Page 15 of 25

Mumbai. The site under reference is falls in CRZ I. Total stretch of street lights id $1.50\ km$.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. MCGM to ensure that lux intensity of lights should be such that it should not harm marine flora and fauna and should not cause disturbance to local people residing in the area by way of light pollution.
- 2. Proposed activity should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.15:

Proposed work of provision illumination by decorative street lights at Silver Beach, Erangal Beach, Danapani Beach, Aksa Beach, Marve Beach and Manori Beach, P/N ward, Malad (W), Mumbai by MCGM

The Authority noted that the proposal is for The MCGM has proposed to make provisions for decorative street lights for illumination at various beaches in Malad, Mumbai. 1) Silver beach 2), Erangal 3) Danapani 4) Aksa 5) Marve and 6) Manori. As per the approved CZMP, above mentioned beach sites are located in CRZ I area.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. MCGM to ensure that lux intensity of lights should be such that it should not harm marine flora and fauna and should not cause disturbance to local people residing in the area by way of light pollution.
- 2. Proposed activity should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 3. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Member Secretary

Page 16 of 25

Item No.16: Proposed underground electrical cable works at Alibag, Dist. Raigad by Alibag by Maharashtra State Electricity Distribution Company Ltd (MSEDCL)

The officials from MSEDCL presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is underground electrical cable works at village Chendare, Varsoli and Alibag, Tal. Alibag, Dist. Raigad. As per submitted information, the site under reference is falls in CRZ I, CRZ II & CRZ III area. Total area is 7.9sqm, Total High tension line is 27.66Km and Total Low tension line is 45.22Km.

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. Proposed activity should be in accordance with provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 (amended from time to time)
- 2. PP to ensure that the site is restored after completion of the work.
- 3. Mangroves, if any should not be destroyed / cut for the proposed activity.
- 4. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Item No.17: Proposed revamping of Slug Catcher Piping facilities at ONGC Uran Plant, Raigad by M/s. ONGC.

The officials from ONGC presented the matter before the Authority. It was presented that ONGC Uran plant is having processing units like Crude Stabilization Unit, Condensate Fractionate Unit, Gas Sweetening Unit, LPG and C2C3 recovery unit, Slug Catcher etc. for processing Natural gas and crude oil. Proposed revamping of slug catcher piping facilities shall be located in the existing gas processing facility at ONGC Uran Plant. The proposed site is located in CRZ III area.

The Authority noted that the PP needs to submit the approved CZMP showing the Slug Catcher pipeline.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to defer the proposal for submission of the compliance as stated above.

Member Secretary

Page 17 of 25

Item No. 18: Proposed new administrative office building at S. No. 1, H. No. 7, 8 & 9, Village Pise, Tal. Bhiwandi, Dist. Thane by MCGM

The Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for new administrative office building comprising of Ground + first floor at S. No. 1, H. No. 7, 8 & 9, Village Pise, Tal. Bhiwandi, Dist. Thane.

As per the Town Planning & Valuation Dept., Thane, vide letter dated 24.01.2017 mentions that the plot under reference is falls in CRZ III and the site under reference is situated within 120m to 140m from HTL of Bhatsai River. Total plot area is 10003.63 sqm

The Authority observed that the proposed site is situated beyond 100 m CRZ setback from the Bhatsa River.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to grant CRZ NoC for the project to concern planning Authority. Local body to ensure no construction should be proposed within 100 m CRZ belt from the Bhatsa River.

<u>Item No.19:</u> Proposed beautification at MHADA open RG plot, Opp. Plot no. 845, Charkop, Sector 8, Kandivali (W), Mumbai by MHADA

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. Hence, the matter was deferred.

Item No.20: Proposed beautification at Bhati Talao, Malad Madh Road, Malad (W), Mumbai by MHADA

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. Hence, the matter was deferred.

Member Secretary

Page 18 of 25

<u>Item No.21:</u>
Proposed Sewer pipeline with D.P. road from S.B. Patil Road, to Talmiki Road, Santacruz (W) in H/ West Ward, Mumbai by MCGM

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. Hence, the Authority decided to defer the proposal.

Item No.22: Proposed protection wall at Sector No. 2, 8, 9 of MHADA layout, Charkop, Mumbai by MHADA

The project proponent was absent for the meeting. Hence, the matter was deferred.

<u>Item No.23:</u>
Proposed anti-sea erosion bund at Mandva, Revdanda, Navedar-Navgaon, Saswane, Tal. Alibag, Dost. Raigad by PWD

The PP presented the proposals before the Authority. The proposal is for antisea erosion bund at Mandva, Revdanda, Navedar-Navgaon, Saswane, Tal. Alibag, Dost. Raigad. The Authority noted that MCZMA in its 119th meeting has rejected the proposals of Anti-sea Erosion bunds at above said 4 sites of Taluka Alibaug.

The Authority opined that uniform model of Anti-sea erosion bund along the Maharashtra Coastline cannot be only solution towards protecting the coastline. There has to be site specific solutions with needs to be in consonance with local ecology. Ecological solutions such as nourishment of beach, planting vegetation along the beach could be more effective solution which would help in protecting the shoreline. Putting hard structures for arresting the sea erosion may alter the shoreline.

The Authority noted that the MMB to undertake such studies whereby soft engineering solution could be implemented for checking sea erosion at coastal stretches, rather than uniform anti-sea erosion bund at the coastline.

Member Secretary

Page 19 of 25

After deliberation, the Authority decided to defer the proposal for the reasons stated above.

Item no.24:

Proposed Fire safety Exit Platform at Visa Section of the German Consulate General located at the Hoechst House, Nariman Point, Mumbai by Consulate General of the Federal Republic of Germany Mumbai

The project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. Consulate General of the Federal Republic of Germany Mumbai has requesting the CRZ NoC for the 'Fire Safety Exit Platform' at the Visa Section of the German Consulate located at Nariman Point. The MMRDA has forwarded the proposal to MCZMA. The Applicant has requested approval of MCZMA for Fire safety Exit Platform. The PP has informed that Fire NoC has been granted by the Concern Authority.

As per the approved CZMP, the building of German Consulate at Nariman Point is located at Nariman point and located within CRZ II area.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concern planning Authority subject to following conditions:

- 1. Proposed construction should be in accordance with provisions of \mbox{CRZ} Notification, 2011
- 2. Local body to ensure that proposed activity is as per the DCR existing as on 19.2.1991.

<u>Item No.25:</u> Proposed Housing Scheme having EWS and LIG Type Tenements at Sector-10, Ghansoli, Navi Mumbai by CIDCO

The Project proponent presented the proposal before the Authority. The Authority noted the project details as follows:

Member Secretary

Page 20 of 25

- 1. The proposal is for Mass Housing Scheme having EWS and LIG Type Tenements at Sector-10, Ghansoli, Navi Mumbai
- 2. Approved CZMP map submitted by the PP shows the plot is partly n CRZ II and partly outside CRZ area.
- 3. As per remarks of the CIDCO, total plot area is 7900 Sqm. Permissible and proposed FSI is 1.00.
- 4. Consolidate statement submitted by the PP shows proposed construction as follows:

EWS	5 numbers	G + 14
LIG (R+C)	6 Numbers	G+ 14
LIG(R)	1 Number	G +7
LIG (R)	3 number	G + 14

The Authority after deliberation decided to recommend the proposal from CRZ point of view to concerned planning Authority subject to compliance of following conditions:

- 1. The Local Body to ensure that FSI for the proposed construction is as per the town and country planning regulation existing as on 19.2.1991 before issuing commencement certificate to the project
- 2. Local body to ensure the construction is proposed on landward side of existing road constructed prior to 1991.
- 3. Local body to ensure that no construction is allowed in mangroves or its 50 m mangrove buffer zone.
- 4. Construction debris should not be dumped in CRZ area.
- 5. PP to obtain Environmental clearance if the construction is more than 20,000sqm from appropriate competent authority before commencement of the work as per the EIA Notification of 2006 amended time to time.
- 6. All other required permission from different statutory authorities should be obtained.

Member Secretary

Page 21 of 25

Table Item No1:

Regarding alleged illegal shopping Mall and restaurant at Mandwa Jetty, Raigad in violation of CRZ Notification, 2011.

The Authority noted that there was Newspaper article dated February 4, 2017 in Mumbai Mirror about the alleged illegal shopping Mall and restaurant at Mandwa Jetty, Raigad. The MCZMA vide letter dated 10.3.2017 has requested Chief Officer, MMB and District Collector, Raigad to examine the matter and remove the said structures/ activities, if found, as it is in violation of CRZ Notification, 1991 and 2011. Action taken report was sought from the MMB and District Collector. The Authority noted that the MMB vide letter dated 20th May, 2017 has submitted its report to the MCZMA. As per the said reply of MMB, the MMB has signed an agreement with Mandwa Port LLP for five years. Therefore, whatever developmental activities are installed by Mandwa Port LLP. MMB has further mentioned that Mandwa LLP have been asked to seek formal approval from the MCZMA on urgent basis.

The Authority noted that project activities proposed in CRZ area requires prior CRZ recommendation from the MCZMA. It was further noted that alleged shopping mall and restaurants on Mandwa Jetty is in violation of provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011. After deliberation, the Authority decided to direct MMB and District Collector, Raigad under section 5 of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986 to remove the said structures / activity from the site at Mandwa Jetty.

Table Item No. 2: Regarding proposal of Art Museum and fine Arts Gallery on plot bearing No. 200, Sector 12, Vashi, Navi Mumbai

The Authority noted that the matter was earlier deliberated in $103^{\rm rd}$, $109^{\rm th}$ and $113^{\rm th}$ meeting of the MCZMA held on 20.8.2015, 19.12.2015 and $8^{\rm th}$ to $11^{\rm th}$ August, 2016 respectively. As decided in 113rd meeting, the Authority vide letter dated 28.10.2016 informed to Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation that, the Authority felt that since, at the time of grant of building permission, the

Member Secretary

Page 22 of 25

plot was outside CRZ area and accordingly, building construction is completed, the concern planning Authority may grant OC to the building subject to permission of High Court.

Shree Swaminarayan Mandir vide letter dated 19^{th} July, 2017 has requested the Authority to consider the matter in the light of the MoEF letter dated 29^{th} September, 2016. The PP during the meeting requested to delete the above said condition of High Court.

The Authority noted the MoEF letter dated 29^{th} September, 2016 which states that the Ministry is of the opinion that the proponent has obtained permissions from the Authorities based on the approved CZMP of 1996 under CRZ Notification, 1991. Further, it is stated that the said project is in accordance with the CZMP of 1996 and may be permitted to be completed as approved by the concern Authorities of GoM.

Considering the above stated MoEF letter, the Authority noted CRZ map in 1:4000 scale prepared by IRS, Chennai depicting the CRZ status of the plot as per the approved CZMP. As per the said map, the plot under reference is situated outside CRZ area as per the approved CZMP.

After deliberation, the Authority decided to inform the Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation that the said project may be allowed in accordance with the approved CZMP under CRZ Notification, 1991, as informed by the MoEF, New Delhi and condition of High court permission stands deleted.

Table Item no.3:

Review of Item no. 19 of 117th MCZMA meeting-Regarding proposed construction on land bearing S.No.62, H.No.1,7 S.No.63, H.No.2/1,2/2, S.No.64 H.No.2,3, S.No.65, S.No.68 H.No.1,2,3 etc. village Gokhivare, Tal. Vasai, Dist. Palghar by Shri. Devendra R. Ladhani

The Authority noted the minutes of item no. 19 of Item no. 117^{th} meeting of the MCZMA held on 5-6.4.2017. The minutes of the said item is reviewed as follows:

Member Secretary

Page 23 of 25

nairman

Project Proponent was present for the meeting and presented the proposal before the Authority. The PP presented that, the MCZMA in its 102^{nd} & 107^{th} meeting held on 31^{st} July & 1^{st} August, 2015 and 7^{th} November, 2015 deliberated the proposal. The Authority noted the decision taken in its 107^{th} meeting.

Now, PP requested the Authority to allow the construction in CRZ belt of the land. The Authority noted the CRZ delineation done by IRS, Chennai, one of the MoEF authorised agency. As per report of IRS Chennai, the CRZ status of the site under reference is CRZ-I (A) & CRZ-III as per approved CZMP and as per guidelines of CRZ Notification of 2011 it is CRZ-IB, mangrove buffer zone & CRZ-II. The comparative table is as follows.

SURVEY	BASED ON 180m WIDTH OR WIDTH OF THE CREEK WHICHEVER IS LESS CRITERIA								
	AREA AS PER CRZ 1991(Sq.m)				AREA AS PER CRZ 2011 (Sq.m)				TOTAL AREA AS
<u> </u>	NOTAFFECTED		CRZIVE	NOTAFFECTED	CRZIB	CRZ II		PER CITY SURVEY	
62	27158.4		3591.6	1	30750	1.00	CN211	CRZIVB	RECORD (Sq.m)
63	30020		1	1	30020	1		 	30750
64	11097.14		3342.86	1	14440			 	30020
68	2713.128	. 42	16206.872	1	5344.9	43.516	13531.584	 	14440
69		178.596	3531.404	1	3690	43.510	13331.384	-	18920
72	3629.952		3730.048		7360	†		 	3690
75	9000		1	1	9000	 			7360
86	5865.3		3634.7		2645,75	 	6854.25		9000
87	4512.618		11107.382		7330.466	†	9289.534		9500
88	7229.504		8680,496		6548.556	f	9361.444	 	15620
89		378.394	13431.606		524.78		13285.22		15910
271		26480.064	299.936		13984.516		12795,484		13810
272		20710			9826.895	107.592	10775.413		25780
273		27520		7.1	25830,272		1689.728		20710 27520
274	1061.34	21476.308	14702.352		37240				37240
275	11909.726	1387.293	15072.981		28370				28370
276	14373.159		8336.841		22710				22710
277	26860				25850				26860
278	7117.11	544,544	12358.346		18810.792	58.058	1151.15		20800
279		22510			7892.006	2372.554	10197.03	2048.41	22510
280		20266.87	7553.13		20439.354	2715.232	2526.056	2139.358	27820

It is observed by the Authority that there is change in HTL and CRZ classification in approved CZMP and CZMP delineated as per 2011 Notification. The Authority decided to follow the stringent of the CZMP and therefore decided to follow approved CZMP. The Authority noted that the site under reference is CRZ-I (A) & CRZ-III as per approved CZMP

The Authority noted that no construction is allowed in CRZ I(A/B) and 50 mangroves buffer zone area. Further, as per the provisions of the CRZ

Member Secretary

Page 24 of 25

Notification, 2011, 100 mts along tidal influenced water bodies or width of the creek whichever is less is in CRZ III area is No Development Zone (NDZ), wherein construction is not allowed as per the provisions of CRZ Notification, 2011 and approved CZMP.

Table item no. 4: Proposed construction of ramp/road along Rangsharda road connecting Bandra Worli Sea Link by MCGM.

The MCGM officials presented the proposal before the Authority. The proposal is for construction of ramp/road along Rangsharda road connecting Bandra Worli Sea Link. As per the approved CZMP, the site is in CRZ I area. The Authority observed that proposed link may create traffic hazard and air pollution. Authority noted that construction of ramp in CRZ I area is not permissible activity.

In view of above, the Authority decided to reject the proposal from CRZ point of view.

Table item no. 5: Regarding purchase of Monitoring Display

The Authority decided to purchase the LED Monitoring display (65 inches) for creating environment awareness by way of displaying Environment related news, Coastal Information System, Climate Change related information programme, Coastal Zone Management Plans etc. in public domain.

------Meeting ended with vote of thanks to Chairman-----

Annexure I

List of the members present during the meeting -

- 1) Dr. S. M. Deshpande, Jt. Commissioner, Fisheries
- 2) Dr. Baban Ingole, Expert Member, MCZMA
- 3) Mr. Chavan, Dy. Che. Eng. (DP), MCGM
- 4) Dr. B. N. Patil, Director, Environment & Member Secretary, MCZMA

Member Secretary

Page 25 of 25